

Vernerri Hietala

“THINK GLOBAL, ACT LOCAL” - CULTURAL POLICIES OF DUNDEE FROM WORLD
CULTURAL PERSPECTIVE

University of Tampere

Faculty of Social Sciences

Master's Programme in Global and Transnational Sociology

Master's Thesis

May 2017

University of Tampere
Faculty of Social Sciences
Master's Programme in Global and Transnational Sociology
VERNERI HIETALA: "Think Global, Act Local" - Cultural Policies of Dundee from World Cultural
Perspective
Master's Thesis, 59 pages
May 2017

Despite growing interest in neo-institutionalism and world culture theory in recent years, few studies have researched urban cultural policies from this perspective. By far the most research on urban cultural policy-making relies on rational choice and structural theoretical perspectives. The purpose of this thesis is to acquire new knowledge on urban cultural policies by examining the main justifications of cultural policies in Dundee from world cultural theoretical perspective.

This thesis is organised as a case study and it analyses the justifications ascribed to cultural policies in the official cultural policy documents of the city of Dundee. It utilises critical discourse analysis and social-interactive discourse theory as its prime methodological tools.

The analysis indicates that the cultural policies are justified using economic, social, intrinsic as well as global justifications. While the use of economic, social and intrinsic benefits as justifications has been identified in earlier research, the additional emphasis on global justifications in the documents of Dundee is a finding which lends credence to the explanatory power of world culture theory. Further analysis of the documents reveals clear diffusion of global influences which takes place through four key conduits of world culture: international organisations, universities, statistics and measurement, and global political culture. Finally, the analysis reveals some contradictory features in the documents, which do not make sense from pure rational choice and structural perspectives. This suggests that it is not only possible but in fact imperative to trace back the sources of different cultural policy justifications to the global discourse on cultural policies.

The results of the study emphasise the need to conduct more research on urban cultural policies from the perspective of world culture theory. This is because the theory reveals how different policies, which are conventionally viewed to be of local origin and to serve local interests, are in fact better understood as globally shared policy models.

Keywords: world culture theory, urban cultural policies, discourse analysis, policy documents, Dundee

Table of contents

Table of contents	1
1. Introduction	2
2. Urban cultural policies in context	5
2.1. A short history of cultural policies	6
2.2. Social benefits of culture	7
2.3. Economic benefits of culture	8
3. Theoretical background	12
3.1. Dominant theoretical perspectives to urban policy-making	13
3.2. World culture theory and urban cultural policy-making	14
4. Data and methodology	19
4.1. Data	19
4.2. Methodology	21
5. Main justifications of cultural policies in Dundee	23
5.1. Economic justifications	24
5.2. Social justifications	28
5.3. Intrinsic justifications	31
5.4. Global justifications	32
6. Key conduits of world cultural influence	34
6.1. International organisations	35
6.2. Universities	36
6.3. Statistics and measurement	37
6.4. Global political culture	39
7. Underlying contradictions as evidence of world cultural impact	40
7.1. Underlying contradictions in the documents	41
7.2. How do the documents manage the contradictions?	45
8. Conclusion and discussion	48
List of references	52

1. Introduction

The main objective of this thesis is to examine the cultural policies of the city Dundee (Scotland) from the perspective of world culture theory. I first became interested in cultural policy-making at the city level when I was studying in Dundee between the years 2010 and 2014. Cultural policies had been assigned a central strategic role in the city's attempt to achieve sustainable social change and improve the lives of its citizens. In its recent cultural strategy the city has clearly chosen to prioritise and focus on design. Perhaps the most ambitious example of this emphasis on culture and design is the Victoria & Albert Museum of Design (V&A) which is currently under construction and due to open in 2018. Dundee is rather unique in this respect, as this emphasis on culture requires a considerable part of the economic resources of the city, at the same time when many of its communities still suffer from long-term unemployment and poverty. How such belief in the long-term benefits of cultural investments have come to take precedence over many more imminent calls for short-term improvements instead? To find out the answer, it is thus important to look at the justifications of cultural policies in more detail.

When living in Dundee, I remember that the media focused extensively on the economic side of cultural policies. However, it must be mentioned that the regional newspaper, *The Courier*, regularly devotes a full page column to design which is written by a designer or design supporter. Yet, it was typically the monetary costs and expected benefits which were debated in the media. This felt a bit bizarre for two reasons. First, can the true value of culture really be measured only in economic terms? Second, if the city is merely interested in generating economic benefits, why invest all that money in culture and not in something which would be more likely to create steady and measurable revenue streams. Money could not be the whole answer.

My interest in the phenomenon led me to read different cities' cultural policy strategies, academic literature on cultural policies as well as visit seminars on the topic. As a result, I now understand that, in addition to economic benefits, the experts, academics and decision-makers also clearly value the social and intrinsic benefits associated with a vibrant cultural scene. The overall cultural policy discourse is not restricted to the typical economic themes highlighted in the media.

The growing interest in urban cultural policies in recent years, as evidenced for example by the growing size of the UNESCO Creative Cities Network¹, has heightened the need for new ways to make sense of this specific field of policy-making. This is because the existing research has relied heavily on rational choice and structural theories which are the dominant ways of understanding policy-making in general (Lichbach and Zuckerman, 2009) and urban policy-making in particular (DiGaetano and Strom, 2003). As a result of this theoretical bias, in most academic literature the cultural policies of cities are typically divided into those which emphasise the economic motivation and others which foreground the social benefits. As this paper argues throughout, however, such theories miss many important points and cannot therefore comprehensively explain why different cities invest so heavily in culture and why they prioritise certain cultural fields over others. This thesis argues that the sociological variant of neo-institutionalism (Thomas, 1987; Powell and DiMaggio, 1991) and its emphasis on world culture is more helpful in shedding light on the phenomenon. A growing number of researchers have turned to neo-institutionalist and world cultural analyses to make sense of many different aspects of our social reality in recent years (Boli, 2005; Hafner-Burton et al., 2008; Meyer and Bromley, 2013). However, with the exception of Pertti Alasuutari's (2013) work on local government cultural policy development in Finland, urban cultural policies are yet to be adequately researched from this perspective. To fill this gap, this paper applies existing knowledge generated under the auspices of neo-institutionalist research to shed light on urban cultural policies in Dundee. I have set three main research questions to guide the thesis. First, how are the cultural policies justified in the official cultural policy documents of Dundee? Second, which world cultural institutions have influenced the choice of these particular justifications? Third, how can world culture help make sense of the interplay between different cultural policy justifications?

To explain the starting point of this thesis, it is necessary to clarify some concepts and terminology. Some people might associate cultural policy only with the actions of governments (policy belongs to the sphere of government). However, I adopt a wider understanding of the concept and follow the recently redefined scope of the *International Journal of Cultural Policy* which understands cultural policy as 'the promotion or prohibition of cultural practices and values by governments, corporations, other institutions and individuals, and considers that such policies may be explicit, in that their objectives are openly described as cultural, or implicit, in that their

¹ For more information, see their website: <http://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/home>

cultural objectives are concealed or described in other terms' (Ahearne and Bennett, 2009, p.139). This expanded concept allows to incorporate different actors in the cultural policy analysis, which is necessary given the partnership approach to cultural policies in Dundee. By this I refer to the Dundee Partnership which has brought together different key stakeholder organisations in Dundee since the 1990s, as is further explained below.

The choice to focus on cultural policies at the local level and especially in cities, instead of national, international or supra-national policy-making, is based on the widely shared view that cities, rather than nations, are in fact the protagonists in cultural policy and politics (Anheier and Isar, 2012; De Beukelaer, 2014). Helmut Anheier and Yudhishtir Isar (2012) identify three reasons behind this development. First, due to the sheer size of many cities, they have greater populations and economic power than many nation states. Second, many trends of globalisation peak in cities. Immigration, for example, contributes to cultural hybridisation whereby local and global influences mix. In globalisation literature this phenomenon is often dubbed as 'glocalisation' (see Robertson, 1992). Third, Anheier and Isar highlight the great flexibility of cities to react to changes. Christiaan De Beukelaer (2014, p.93) largely echoes these findings by arguing that most cultural policies typically take place at the city level given the fact that cities house the 'most significant concentrations of cultural and creative activity' and they also have the best potential 'to tailor action to the particular needs of the city and to react faster to changes'.

Overview of the thesis

Chapter 2, which follows this introduction, discusses the most prevalent ways of justifying urban cultural policies which are both identified and promoted in previous academic research. These include the economic, social and intrinsic justifications. Each type of justification in turn consist of a larger group of more specific justifications which are also illustrated with several examples.

Chapter 3 then outlines the dominant theoretical perspectives to urban policy-making, including rational choice, structuralism and culturalism. However, most attention is paid to neo-institutionalism and world culture theory which constitute the theoretical framework of this thesis. While the benefits of this theoretical approach are discussed at length, the text also addresses some of the most prevalent criticisms of the theory.

Chapter 4 moves the discussion on to the data and methodology. The thesis is organised as a case study which scrutinises three official cultural policy documents of Dundee and the discourses evident in them. To be more specific, in an attempt to identify and place different justifications of cultural policies in their social contexts, the study takes advantage of Norman Fairclough's (1992) *critical discourse analysis*. In addition, Maarten Hajer's (1995) *social-interactive discourse theory* is utilised to make sense of how different and often contradictory justifications manage to coexist in the documents.

The following three chapters then outline the findings of the study. Chapter 5 answers the first research question and shows that the documents contain four different types of justifications of cultural policies, namely the economic, social, intrinsic and global justifications. Chapter 6 addresses the second research question and examines the key conduits of world cultural influence which can be identified in the documents in order to demonstrate the wider impact of world culture on cultural policy justifications. With the third research question in mind, Chapter 7 discusses some inherent contradictions between different cultural policy justifications and how these are dealt with in the documents. This is done in order to demonstrate the significant influence of world culture.

Finally, Chapter 8 concludes the thesis by recounting the main findings, considering possible limitations of the study and by suggesting some further research. It also briefly discusses the wider relevance of world cultural approach in trying to make sense of today's social reality.

2. Urban cultural policies in context

This chapter discusses the most prevalent ways of justifying cultural policies which are both identified and promoted in previous academic research. I will begin with a short history of cultural policies to establish the historical relevance of intrinsic justifications. The following two sub-chapters then discuss the instrumental social and economic justifications of urban cultural policies.

2.1. A short history of cultural policies

In order to locate the appropriate social and political contexts in which cultural policies are made, it is good to begin with historical justifications of cultural policies. The focus of this study is urban cultural policy-making. However, I will begin with the history of European national cultural policies, albeit a very short one, because these are historically better researched, and because studying cultural policies at the national level may also add to our understanding of the overall dynamics of cultural policies.

Over the course of history, culture has been assigned with a number of different roles. According to Mikko Lehtonen (2014), in most modern Western accounts of the 20th century, culture was mainly seen as a value in itself, a sphere which was separate from other spheres such as the economy or politics. Any cultural policies were there to support culture as an intrinsic value. In a similar vein, Franco Bianchini (1993) argues that, still in the 1950s, Western European cultural policies had two basic aims: to promote high-quality art and to widen access to it.

However, this is not an entirely full portrayal as leaders from all over the world have for long understood the political value of culture too. The idea of nationalism and the building of modern nation states relied heavily on forging a national identity through a shared national culture. If we understand nations first and foremost as 'imagined communities', as mental images rather than true communities in accordance with the thinking of Benedict Anderson (1983), in order for individuals with various backgrounds (religious, family, ideological, occupational, gender, language etc.) to identify with a single nation, they need to be actively educated to accept the image. A shared cultural experience is an effective way to achieve this goal of nationalism. To illustrate this point with an example from my native country of Finland, the role of artists such as Akseli Gallen-Kallela, Elias Lönnrot, J. L. Runeberg and Jean Sibelius in forging a Finnish national idea cannot be overlooked.

Today's cultural policies are justified using a wider range of justifications. Most research identifies either the economic or social impacts of culture as the main drivers of cultural policies. However, most research on local cultural policy-making tends to focus on just one type of justification which is given priority and viewed to guide cultural policies. Later in the thesis I associate this tendency with the prevalence of normative approach and the fact that different economic, social and

intrinsic justifications are often contradictory. Due to these contradictions, dominant theories which typically utilise structural, functional and rational choice models find it difficult to explain cultural policies in their complexity. For example, in discussing the EU's cultural policy text *Unlocking the potential of cultural and creative industries*, Mirja Liikkanen (2014) finds it paradoxical that the text focuses on the ability of culture to increase both economic and social (health) benefits at the same time. From dominant theoretical perspectives this might appear paradoxical, and this is exactly why I have a different approach to looking at cultural policies, more of which below.

2.2. Social benefits of culture

Culture has been argued to carry with it a wide range of different social benefits, and urban cultural policies are therefore often justified drawing on these. Next I present some of the most prevalent types of social benefits associated with culture to roughly illustrate what is meant by the notion.

Drawing on recent British experience (early 1990s), Charles Landry and his colleagues (1996) highlight the importance of different social benefits behind the interest in the use of culture and arts in urban regeneration. They clearly depart from the traditional notion of culture as an intrinsic value by arguing that cultural regeneration 'is about people and the quality of the lives they will be able to lead' (Ibid, p.5). In their opinion it is crucial to involve people in cultural projects. They also downplay the role of economic gains: 'in a world driven by economic imperatives, and focused on financial measures of success, the 'softer' benefits of cultural investment are easily forgotten' (Ibid, p.8). These benefits can include, for instance, strengthened social cohesion, increased personal confidence and life skills, common ground between people, improved mental and physical well-being, strengthened ability to act as democratic citizens, new training and employment routes, attracting those whose needs are not addressed by other provision, and increased organisational capacity (Ibid). In another vast study concerning the social impacts of arts programmes, François Matarasso (1997) delineates no less than 50 different social benefits which his study shows can be produced through participatory arts projects.²

² In order to save space, I do not repeat the list here but many of these will be referred to in the following chapters.

Most authors do not typically focus on such vast lists of different social benefits, but instead emphasise different aspects. For example, Ray Hudson (1995) emphasises the role of culture in personal learning, especially in terms of young adults' employment opportunities. The impact of culture on health and well-being has also become a popular object of study. For instance, by controlling other important factors impacting health, Mark Stern and Susan Seifert (2017) find that in the lower-income neighbourhoods of New York, cultural resources are significantly linked to better health. Moreover, culture is often seen as a social institution which is crucial for democracy to work. Hannu Nieminen (2014) argues that democracy is based on the idea of 'epistemic commons'. By this he means that there must be areas of knowledge and experience which are open to everyone (though the concept of 'everyone' is historically contingent). Consequently, in order for us to organise our society in an efficient and just manner, we need a common culture among other things. Given all these factors, according to Jutta Virolainen (2015), public cultural policies have increasingly sought to promote cultural participation and social inclusion in recent years.

As a result of this burgeoning research on the social benefits of culture discussed above, the analysts of cultural policy documents have also noticed the importance and salience of social benefits of culture as justifications. For example, Ron Griffiths (2006) has found that the most notable feature which united three bids of different cities which at the time wanted to become European Cities of Culture was the relationship between culture and social cohesion. This increasing tendency to link culture and cultural policies to the above-mentioned social benefits has led some to argue 'that the narrow economic instrumentalism of the last decade has lost its place as the master discourse [and this] will be welcomed by many' (Griffiths, 2006, p.430). Next this chapter turns to the manner of justifying cultural policies by emphasising the economic benefits they generate, which is of course the other major strand of thought which Griffiths refers to with his categorisation of 'narrow economic instrumentalism'.

2.3. Economic benefits of culture

In the past few decades, there has been a growing tendency in Western economic discourse to reconceptualise the economy. In this new parlance of many economists, Western societies should no longer be characterised as industrial ones, since major structural changes have fundamentally transformed their economies. In an attempt to capture the nature of these changes, different

commentators have used different concepts, such as ‘information society’, ‘postindustrial society’, ‘knowledge based economy’, ‘post-fordist economy’ and ‘creative economy’ (see Kuusela, 2014). Yet, all these concepts roughly refer to the same idea whereby Western economic systems have moved from industrial and primary production towards a new type of economy in which the role of knowledge and immaterial property and their ability to add economic value have become of central importance (Ibid).

This new economic thinking has had its repercussions for urban policy-making and cultural policies as well. According to David Throsby (2001, p.137), today the idea that the most important function of different levels of policy-making is to advance economic development is accepted to the extent that ‘public policy and economic policy have become almost synonymous’. Local cultural politics and policies make no difference here, as cultural policies and economic development are clearly linked at all levels of government (Throsby, 2001). Especially the ideas behind the concept of creative economy elevate the role of culture in economic discourse and economy in cultural discourse, and tightly associate culture with this new economic system (Kuusela, 2014). Based on earlier studies, I have distinguished three primary ways in which cultural policies are viewed to lead to economic gains. It is important to note that each is based on the idea that Western economies are now fundamentally different and the solutions to economic woes must be correspondingly unconventional, all of which underscores the potential of culture and cultural policies. Next this thesis discusses the three notions individually.

First, perhaps the most obvious way has been to associate cultural policies with increased tourism. Tourism has become one of the fastest growing economic sectors in the world and given the rising income levels in populous countries such as China and India, the trend is likely to continue. Indeed, tourism currently accounts for 7% of world exports and international tourist arrivals are expected to increase by 3.3% a year between 2010 and 2030 (UNWTO, 2016). Perhaps unsurprisingly then, cities want to tap into this market and culture is often seen as important in attracting large numbers of visitors. According to Lily Kong (2012), city branding is believed to be one effective strategy in this global competition for tourists, residents and investments. The development of a city brand is a process theorised and studied by a number of academics and experts (see discussion in Kong, 2012). Cultural policies often take centre stage in these branding efforts and flagship cultural facilities such as museums designed by star architects spring up all over the world.

However, the effectiveness of this strategy can be questioned as similar branding efforts often result in greater global homogenisation. Different authors have identified this paradox. For example, Davide Ponzini (2012) argues that the hiring of star architects to design spectacular landmark buildings is a global phenomenon leading to very similar urban landscapes. Global dominant narratives such as the 'Bilbao effect', whereby the new Guggenheim museum designed by Frank Gehry triggered a process of Bilbao's transformation and revitalisation, seem to take a life of their own (Ibid). All over the world, different cities try to replicate this assumed success story. Ponzini (2012) and Kong (2012) have questioned the positive economic impact of this narrative due to the lack of supporting evidence in most cases. The whole narrative may seem peculiar from purely economic point of view, but then again, this viewpoint often misses the impact of world culture which is not only about the economy. But more of this later.

Second, the idea that cultural sector is itself an important part of post-industrial economy is visible in the emphasis on cultural industries. As Andy Pratt (2008, p.107) argues, 'the cultural industries are ... one of the potential motors of urban growth and regeneration in their own right'. According to Allen Scott (1997), they are said to bring about competitive advantages and thus increase employment levels and incomes. What do we then mean by these cultural industries? There are a range of different models to categorise cultural industries³, but typically industries such as film, music, publishing and design, to name a few, are included in the lists. The importance of cultural policies lies in their ability to enhance the development of these cultural industries. As David Hesmondhalgh (2007) points out, the UK government has since the 1980s emphasised the role of cultural industries in generating economic growth, and at the local level this has had its impact on the subsidy, regulation and management of culture. This cultural industry approach has been especially important for the so-called 'old economies'. DiGaetano and Strom (2003) divide cities into 'old economies', which are reliant on heavy industries and therefore lag behind in the competition for business investment and middle-class residents, and 'new economies', which emphasise corporate and financial services, high technology and cultural sectors, and reap the benefits of globalisation as a result. As an old industrial city, Dundee, for instance, can be viewed to be in the process of trying to modernise its economic structure and thus investing in its cultural industries.

³ for a more comprehensive list of these, see Throsby (2008)

Third, the notion of creative economy expands the role of culture in supporting and growing the economy even further. This is because while one can measure the impact of cultural industries on the Gross Domestic Product by selecting the industries one wants to include in cultural industries, it is harder to do the same regarding the creative economy as a whole. This can be useful if one wants to emphasise the economic impacts of culture. In the UK, for example, the Gross Value Added of creative industries was measured at 8% in 2003 and 6,4% in 2009 (Oakley, 2009). The significance of this decline can be downplayed by focusing on creative economy as a wider concept or entity. The idea behind creative economy, that culture is important in attracting creative workforce and investments has been mostly associated with the works of Richard Florida (2002) and John Howkins (2002). According to Florida's theory, regional economic growth is driven by the location choices of creative people, in fact the creative class as he calls them, who want to live in cities which are diverse, tolerant and open to new ideas. This theory is based on the understanding that we now live in a new type of economy powered by human creativity – the creative economy. Businesses will follow this creative workforce and not the other way around. As far as cities are therefore concerned, the most crucial factor in their success is their ability to provide a social and economic environment which can nurture creativity in its many forms. A vibrant cultural life is seen as a key to achieve this. This, according to Florida is the reason why places like the San Francisco Bay area are booming while those organisational age communities which have not embraced change and creativity, such as Detroit, find themselves in dire situations.

Even though the notion of creative economy is a popular justification, it should not be interpreted as a sign of the salience of economic rationale behind cultural policies in general. Florida's thesis has faced a lot of criticism from both the left and the right. For example, the causal mechanisms of Florida's theory have been challenged as well as the desirability of a societal model which neglects the needs of a large 'non-creative' population (for further discussion on different criticisms, see Peck, 2005). It can be assumed that policy-makers are aware of these problems. What is more, Florida's thesis is not only about growing the economy, although this is a common interpretation of its objective. Florida makes it clear that it no longer makes sense talking about the bohemian ethic and the Protestant work ethic as separate or opposing values. In today's creative society these two have essentially morphed into a new type of work ethic, namely the creative ethos. This new synthesis is often neglected in traditional thinking which sees 'work and life, or the economy and the culture, as separate spheres with distinct value systems that should interact only in certain

ways' (Florida, 2002, p.197). As a result, cultural policy makers do not necessarily have to understand Florida's argument as an economic one at all. According to this alternative reading, any city needs to attract creative people with cultural offerings, not to boost the economy but to maintain a vibrant cultural life and scene which today are dependent on the consumption and production of the creative class. I will return to this relationship between the discourse on creative economy and cultural policies from the viewpoint of world culture theory, which I argue to be more useful in explaining the phenomenon than the theories which concentrate on the economy.

Due to the above-mentioned three ways to conceptualise the relationship between culture and economy, it is now common to claim that it is primarily the concern for the economic benefit what guides cultural policies, not any social benefit. This remains the case despite the fact that tangible economic benefits of culture are questioned by many, as was explained. Such emphasis on the economy is of course tied to more general demands for cost-effectiveness regarding all public policies, especially following the financial crisis of 2008. Accordingly, Darrin Bayliss (2007) argues (contra Griffiths discussed above) that studies which claim that the narrow economic instrumentalism of culture-led development is long overdue, have it all wrong. For example, by analysing the cultural policy documents of Copenhagen, Bayliss finds that it is the economic justifications what truly stand out and appear to guide cultural policies.

3. Theoretical background

The current tendency in urban research to view cultural policies as a route to either social or economic benefit, as explained above, can be understood as a reflection of the dominant theoretical context. I will begin this chapter by describing the three competing schools of thought in the study of urban politics, namely structural, rational choice, and cultural. I will also briefly address the prevalence of normative approach in the academic research on urban cultural policy-making. In the second part, I will introduce the world culture perspective which constitutes the theoretical framework of this thesis.

3.1. Dominant theoretical perspectives to urban policy-making

Conventionally, urban politics has been researched from structural, rational choice, and cultural perspectives (DiGaetano and Strom, 2003). This of course mirrors a wider theoretical division in political sciences in general. For example, Mark Lichbach (2003) and Lichbach and Zuckerman (2009) have also presented a typology of structuralist, rationalist and culturalist theoretical schools of thought in political sciences.

First, according to structural approaches to urban politics (Jessop et al., 1999; Kantor et al., 1997), urban governance is based on and guided by various social, economic and technological structures and processes. DiGaetano and Strom (2003) argue that the most common approach to structural studies is the focus on political economy; in other words the governance of a city is seen as an interplay between government power and private resources. In line with this logic, cultural policies must then also result from economic needs and be governed by economic leeway. This perspective attributes such a major role to the underlying economic rationale that the theory misses other possible structures, like the underlying 'global culture' advocated in this thesis. Many studies, including the present study, argue that cultural policies can have other objectives in addition to mere economic gains.

Second, the rational choice model focused on rational, strategic and self-interested political actors has also been one of the dominant approaches to comparative urban governance (DiGaetano and Strom, 2003). This research tradition has often focused on the role of political leadership in urban politics (see Stone, 1995). Whether the end goals are viewed as economic or social benefits, policy actors are considered to be mostly rational, selfish and strategic in their actions and thus know how to best maximise utility and calculate costs and benefits correctly. Pure rational choice is problematic, however, in that it assumes the underlying structures and concepts to be given. While it is obvious that individuals effect the change, they should also be seen as socially constructed and embedded in wider cultural contexts. Even if we assume that actors are self-interested and involved in constant cost-benefit analyses, surely they have not invented themselves the same concepts and models which are used all over the world. This emphasis on rational choice also makes it difficult to acknowledge that cultural policies are complex outcomes of many different influences, often contradictory ones, and that they do not necessarily consist of

entirely coherent practices. And most importantly, this paper shows that in the case of Dundee, rational choice fails to explain why certain policies are chosen instead of others.

The third major school of thought consists of cultural analyses of urban politics. According to Marc Ross (2009, p.136), in cultural analyses of politics, 'interests are contextually and intersubjectively defined and the strategies used to pursue them are viewed as context dependant'. When it comes to cultural analysis of urban policy-making, DiGaetano and Strom (2003) claim that these explain persistence much better than change. While this may be the case concerning local cultural influences, this thesis argues that global culture does indeed explain major changes in urban cultural policy-making. For example, Terry Clark (2000, p.6) argues that new paradigms on urban policy-making are needed because 'globalisation and its associated market and communication processes are clearly one and perhaps the prime factor undermining most earlier urban paradigms'. Before I turn to explain the world cultural approach which guides this thesis and which arguably forms an excellent theoretical framework for understanding local cultural policies, I need to address the prevalence of normative approach in the academic research on urban cultural policy-making.

There is no denying the fact that much research on urban cultural policy-making, which was discussed in the previous chapter, adopts a normative approach. Many studies often explicitly or implicitly promote a desired state of affairs and a preferred aim behind cultural policies. This can have an impact on how accurately they portray cultural policies. The aim of this thesis is to present the cultural policies of Dundee as they are discussed in the official policy documents without taking a stance on what objectives are most valuable. I do not avoid such normative position because I think it is wrong to make normative claims or because I think I am devoid of any prior assumptions and thus somehow more able to describe reality objectively. Instead I do it because I think it is very hard to take a normative stance before trying to understand the current situation as accurately as possible. I am confident that the theoretical perspective I have adopted is excellent in shedding light on the cultural policies of Dundee in their complexity.

3.2. World culture theory and urban cultural policy-making

This paper analyses cultural policies from a sociological neo-institutionalist and more specifically world cultural point of view. This neo-institutionalist research views local actors as essentially

constituted by and embedded in a world culture (Alasuutari and Qadir, 2014; Boli and Thomas, 1997; Meyer et al, 1997; Thomas, 2009). The concept of world culture is similar to the concepts of world polity and world society in that they all point to a consciousness of a world characterised by moral and cultural schema that encompasses boundaries (Thomas, 2009). However, each concept foregrounds different aspects of the world. Notwithstanding the risk of confusing readers by using the term 'culture' in different contexts and senses, this thesis adopts the concept of world culture theory as this best captures the idea that the local makers of cultural policies are not only influenced by global trends, but their very identities and functions are in fact constituted by a wider global cultural context.

World cultural perspective is not a typical approach to analysing local policy-making. This is partly because there is a wider 'preference for minimising the causal and constitutive powers of contexts and preserving the sovereignty of actors' (Thomas, 2009, p.118). This is what privileges the above-mentioned rational choice models emphasising interests-seeking rational actors. Neo-institutionalists do not deny the role of actors but they view actors more as enactors of social and cultural rules and scripts provided by the wider environment (Schofer et al., 2012). By analysing actors as embedded in constitutive contexts, world culture theory goes well beyond the typical way of conceiving the world as a network of interconnected and interdependent actors (which only reifies the actors) (Thomas, 2009).

The tendency of traditional rational choice and structural theories to treat cities as functional organisations is also somewhat problematic because cities are better understood as complex networks instead of unified organisations. Therefore, Barbara Czarniawska (2002) studies city management as an action net consisting of different organisations, such as private, municipal and voluntary ones, as well as individuals. She does this exactly to 'avoid the fallacy of seeing the ... city as one formal organisation (Ibid, p.4). Peter Hall and Rosemary Taylor (1996) manage to summarise the point of neo-institutionalists in a rather concise manner:

Many of the institutional forms and procedures used by modern organisations were not adopted simply because they were most efficient for the tasks at hand, in line with some transcendent "rationality". Instead ... many of these forms and procedures should be seen as culturally specific practices, akin to the myths and ceremonies devised by many societies, and assimilated into organisations, not

necessarily to enhance their formal means-ends efficiency, but as a result of the kind of processes associated with the transmission of cultural practices more generally'. (Hall and Taylor, 1996, p.946-947)

In a similar vein, this thesis takes issue with the idea of seeing cities as purely functional organisations. It is very unlikely that either economic imperatives alone or pure rational choice in general would drive cultural policies. Rather, in performing their roles, it seems that different local policy-makers and stakeholders combine various interests and make compromises. This is not a very bold or novel claim, but must be said because it is surprisingly common to view cities as entirely functional organisations. According to Czarniawska (2002), this is because structural functionalism forms a 'powerful sense-making device'. Almost everything can be interpreted in functionalist terms. But the problem is that typically certain organisational structures or policies are not the only functional possibilities and all policies can be challenged using functional arguments. So the question of why certain policies are adopted instead of others is often neglected. According to world culture theory, the different interests and compromises which I mentioned above are not random ones at all, as I shall discuss in the coming chapters. As a result, I strongly believe that the less conventional world cultural perspective is very useful when researching the cities' cultural policies in their entire complexity.

While it is not the most common approach, there are excellent previous studies on local decision-making from a neo-institutionalist and world cultural perspectives. This body of literature includes, for example, Kenneth Hansen and Daniel Krejci's (2000) study on municipal arena-specific strategies, Greg Protasel's (1988) work on the local abandonments of the council-manager plans, and Sebastian Büttner's (2014) research on the emergence of new administrative regions in Poland. Moreover, in her book on city management, Barbara Czarniawska (2002) identifies two opposing tendencies: increasing homogenisation and heterogenisation. While everything becomes more alike, differences at the same time seem to multiply. For example, all her case cities seem keen to follow the 'European ideal' which is at the same time counterbalanced by local tradition. This development seems to validate both the neo-institutionalist finding of increased isomorphism (see Meyer et al., 1997) as well as research on glocalisation (see Robertson, 1992). Pertti Alasuutari's (2013) article on the impact of media coverage of an R&D project on local government cultural policies touches the themes of this paper. It uses the idea of domestication to explain how the project contributed to standardising local government cultural activities, while at the same

time managed to strengthen local viewpoint on the process. Local actors were found to actively use comparative data to further their own ends in local political field battles.

World culture theory of course has its critics (see wider discussion in Schofer et al., 2012), so I will briefly comment on some of those criticisms which might be raised to challenge the points presented in this study. World culture theory is sometimes accused of portraying globalisation as a process which only leads to ever-increasing homogenisation. This may have been the case when neo-institutionalist writers wanted to demonstrate the increasing isomorphism of the world. The notion of isomorphism has its origins in comparative research on education in the 1970s and can be defined as 'a world whose societies, organised as nation states, are structurally similar in many unexpected dimensions and change in unexpectedly similar ways (Meyer et al., 1997, p.145). Researchers found that in sub-Saharan Africa, for example, local education systems resembled very much those in the West despite obvious societal differences and concomitant functional needs. This mode of early neo-institutionalist research is not the case anymore, for world culture theory has accepted more nuanced accounts which explain how similar processes can in fact result in different local outcomes. For instance, this is the point behind Pertti Alasuutari's (2013) work on domestication, which was already mentioned above, Ulf Hannerz's (1987) work on creolisation, and Roland Robertson's (1992) work on glocalisation. As this thesis only analyses Dundee's policies, I do not even attempt to claim that other cities adopt similar justifications. I just try to find out whether the justifications used in Dundee are better understood to be of global origin. I do not try to deny the important role of local decision-making, but I do not think local perspective alone is very helpful in making sense of urban cultural policies.

World culture theorists are also sometimes accused of not paying sufficient attention to the mechanisms of policy diffusion. However, this is arguably no longer the case regarding much of the research done under the auspices of neo-institutionalism as 'scholars have documented a variety of "carriers" of institutionalised cultural models, including international associations, scientists and professionals, media and telecommunication, modern school systems which convey standardised curricula, and even the legacy of colonial ties' (Schofer et al., 2012, p.8). For example, the concept of domestication of global trends, whereby global ideas are drawn on and used by national actors in local field battles, pays more attention to the mechanisms of diffusion (Alasuutari, 2013). To remedy any such shortcomings, this thesis also discusses the sources of new ideas which are evident in the discourses under scrutiny and how those ideas travel. Like most

academics today, I do not to treat globalisation as an explanation in itself. The media, for example, are much more likely to make this mistake. As pointed out by Manfred Steger (2013, p.9), 'the often repeated truism that globalisation (the process) leads to more globalisation (the condition) does not allow us to draw meaningful analytical distinctions between causes and effects'. This thesis attempts to avoid this theoretical error as well. Instead, it identifies a set of social processes and mechanisms, most of which are known global trends, which can be of use when trying to make sense of Dundee's cultural policies.

One last criticism I want to address is the claim that world culture theory is equivalent to ceremony without substance, meaning that policies written in official documents are not necessarily implemented on the ground (see discussion in Schofer et al., 2012). Such decoupling has been found to exist in many nation-states with repressive regimes which sign up to human rights treaties but fail to honour their commitments in practice (Hafner-Burton et al., 2008). However, this thesis does not attempt to trace whether all cultural policies are followed up on the ground, it is merely trying to trace different justifications which are deemed acceptable. What is more, I would not go as far as to call these commitments on paper as meaningless, given the fact that in democratic systems, such as Dundee, the citizens, opposition and media, for instance, can hold decision-makers accountable for their pledges.

Finally, it is necessary to write a few words on the issue of power, as the study of politics is traditionally seen as the study of power (Heywood, 2011). It is evident that this thesis does not pay too much attention to the fact who is eventually making different decisions and through what hierarchical structures. It does not do so because this is not crucial for the overall argument. But more importantly, this thesis understands power as a mechanism and thus departs from the traditional conception of power as a tool, as domination or control over others, because the traditional conception is not very helpful in making sense of today's networked ways of working which are evident in urban cultural policy-making. This wider move from hierarchies to networks in both national and international settings, whereby social life is increasingly coordinated through informal networks of people and organisations, has been theorised by Manuel Castells (1996) with his concept of a 'network society', and at practical level different organisations and agencies have indeed identified this new reality and its impact on their day-to-day work (see eg. Criminal Sanctions Agency, 2016). When clear hierarchical structures are not discernible in global settings, disputes must be settled and ways of working set up using arguments. Most of the time we are

talking about voluntary cooperation anyway. It is more fruitful then to research which discourses achieve the status of authority and how this takes place, than trying to find out who has the power to force their will and with what tools. This is not least because causality is difficult to prove. Pertti Alasuutari and Ali Qadir's (2014) work on epistemic governance, for example, tries to unpack different strategies, often unconscious ones, which are used to affect people's conceptions of the reality at hand. By carefully analysing prevalent discourses surrounding Dundee's cultural policies, it is possible to identify which ideas have reached the status of authority. To demonstrate the existence of world culture and its significant impact on urban cultural policy-making, this thesis shows how these ideas and discourses are not necessarily of either local, functional or rational origin.

4. Data and methodology

4.1. Data

The world cultural perspective outlined in the previous chapter has influenced the choice of data and methodology in this thesis. Central to all cultural analyses of politics are narratives which individual and groups recount to make sense of their social and political worlds (Ross, 2009). This thesis analyses the narratives in three official cultural policy documents of Dundee in order to make sense of the cultural policies, including their justifications. These include *Creative Dundee: the City's Cultural Strategy 2009-2014* (Dundee City Council and Creative Services Scotland, 2009), *Dundee Cultural Strategy 2015-2025* (Dundee Partnership, 2014a) and *UNESCO Creative Cities Network Dundee City of Design: Summary of Application* (Dundee Partnership, 2014b). From now on these are referred to as Cultural Strategy (2009), Cultural Strategy (2014) and UNESCO Application (2014) respectively. The Dundee Partnership, which brings together key city agencies with local academic institutions and representatives of the business, voluntary and community sectors, is responsible for the documents.

As their names suggest, two of the documents represent the latest official cultural strategies. To be more precise, these are the third and fourth cultural strategies of Dundee. I have chosen two consecutive cultural strategies as my data in order to find out any major policy shifts over the years. Such an approach, when analysed in the wider social context as advocated by critical

discourse analysts (see Fairclough, 1992), should also reveal what developments can be attributed to these differences in texts.

The summary of the application to join UNESCO's Creative Cities network differs from the other documents in that it is directed mainly at UNESCO. In other words, it discusses primarily the role of design and attempts to justify why Dundee should be accepted a member of the network. Many specific insights in the document, however, provide a valuable addition to the analysis. This is because the justifications it contains reveal what the decision-makers believe the people at UNESCO view as important and valuable.

The official cultural policy documents fit well in my overall research design and the choice to focus particularly on these three documents results mainly from practical reasons. To begin with, these data are readily available online as I specifically wish to scrutinise texts which are directed at the wider audience. In other words, I do not want the documents to have any particular target audience in mind. If a paper was directed to, say, the finance department, there would likely be a disproportionate emphasis on economic justifications. The UNESCO application document of course differs from the rest in this respect, given that it was targeted mainly at UNESCO. Second, the data fit in the expanded conception of cultural policies. As mentioned in the introduction, this thesis adopts a wider understanding of what constitutes and who can contribute to cultural policies. In other words, it does not solely associate cultural policies with the actions of governments. Having said that, due to the Dundee Partnership, all three documents actually fit well in this conceptualisation. This is because Dundee has adopted a partnership approach whereby different stakeholders have a chance to provide their input in policies through a consultation process. Third, because I want to find out how cultural policies are justified in their final form, after different actors have given their input, these official documents are excellent as they already represent the collective views of different stakeholders. I specifically want to avoid using interviews because individual views can differ widely on the issue. Given my theoretical viewpoint, I hypothesise that cultural policy discourses in Dundee consist of a collection of globally prevalent discourses. With interviews, I might easily omit a representative of some important institution and thus distort the findings.

I have two final remarks regarding my data. In terms of possible limitations of the data, I do not believe analysing more documents would significantly enhance my research. In short, there is no

need to collect more data because even these three documents largely repeat the same main justifications. This is also the case regarding the *UNESCO City of Design Dundee: 2015-16 Report*, which was published at the time of writing this paper. Finally, as a technical detail, I use direct quotes as much as possible instead of paraphrasing when presenting my data so that the reader can have an exact sense of the way issues are presented and of the words used. This is of course particularly important when doing a discourse analysis, but it also reflects my general style of writing and my belief in the importance of how ideas are presented in addition to what is being presented.

4.2. Methodology

To unpack and analyse the data, this thesis seeks to place the cultural policy discourses in their relevant contexts. This is because in cultural analyses of politics, as already mentioned above by Ross (2009, p.136), 'interests are contextually and intersubjectively defined and the strategies used to pursue them are viewed as context dependent'. According to my underlying theoretical approach, the most relevant context is primarily global. In order to find out the ways in which the notion of world culture can help us understand urban cultural policy-making, quantitative analysis arguably does not provide the depth needed to understand such complex social phenomena. It is more important to explore in detail what is being said instead of counting how many times issues are mentioned. When relatively little is known about a topic such as this one, qualitative case study employing emergent design is a useful approach (Mabry, 2008). In such a case study, a researcher is expected to improve on the original research design as information emerges during data collection (Ibid). Combined with this approach as my methodological guideline, I use Norman Fairclough's (1992) *critical discourse analysis* and Maarten Hajer's (1995) *social-interactive discourse theory* as more refined methods of analysis. The flexibility of my methodology is reflected in the fact that the latter method was chosen at a relatively late point to make sense of the underlying contradictions in the texts which my in-depth analysis had revealed.

The starting point of this thesis is that social and political realities do not lie outside language, but are to a large extent created by language instead. The method of critical discourse analysis is very useful in an attempt to uncover how these social and political realities are constituted and acted upon in discourse. Because the concept of critical discourse analysis shelters a broad family of

analysts (see Antaki, 2008), it is necessary to explain the method of this thesis in more detail. Norman Fairclough's (1992) more linguistically oriented critical discourse analysis provides an excellent framework for the purposes of this study. This is because it allows to place the official cultural policy documents of Dundee in their wider contexts, which is necessary in order to map different justifications of cultural policies.

Fairclough's (1992) three-dimensional conception of discourse consists of three dimensions of analysis: text analysis, analysis of discursive practice and analysis of social practice, all of which are interconnected. Fairclough mostly traces intertextual connections to illustrate how different dimensions are linked. He calls the analysis of features of a text as 'description'. Yet, the division between text analysis and analysis of discursive practice, which has to do with 'interpretation', is not a sharp one. The analysis of discursive practice focuses on three social processes of text production, distribution and consumption, and requires reference to the 'particular economic, political and institutional settings within which discourse is generated' (Fairclough, 1992, p.71). Fairclough's last dimension of discourse as social practice relates discourse to ideology and power, and places discourse within a view of power as hegemony.

This type of multidimensional analysis is necessary in order to find out the impact of world culture which is one of the aims of this paper. This is because any world cultural impact is embedded in wider social structures and thus requires linking social practice to the text itself. However, the conception of power is where I differ with Fairclough as I view power more as a mechanism, in line with many world culture theorists. This was explained in the theory section.

Finally, in order to make sense of how the documents manage to deal with a relatively high level of incoherence and contradictions, which I identify in the texts, I take advantage of Hajer's (1995) social-interactive discourse theory. Hajer (1995, p.44) defines discourse as a 'specific ensemble of ideas, concepts, and categorisations that are produced, reproduced, and transformed in a particular set of practices and through which meaning is given to physical and social realities'. This definition consists of two approaches. The first one attempts to make sense of what is being said, i.e. of the regularities and variations in content, while the second approach tries to analyse the specific context in which the statement is made or to whom it is directed. Hajer's overall approach is useful in analysing policy discourses because policy discussions consist of many different discourses which do not necessarily form a coherent whole (Ibid).

How do different actors then communicate using knowledge produced in different contexts? Hajer's notion of discourse-coalitions helps to make sense of this by showing how different discourses can be brought together under one discourse. 'Discourse-coalitions are formed if previously independent practices are being actively related to one another, if a common discourse is created in which several practices get a meaning in a common political project' (Hajer, 1995, p.65). Hajer (2017) defines practices as 'embedded routines and mutually understood rules and norms that provide coherence to social life'. In addition, coalitions are formed among actors (who might perceive their position and interest according to widely different discourses) that are attracted to a specific set of story-lines. In Hajer's (2017) terminology story-lines 'refer to a condensed form of narrative in which metaphors are employed, used by people as 'short hand' in discussions'. In the analysis section, I show how discourse-coalitions are formed in Dundee's policy documents and what story-lines are used to unite different discourses on the role of culture in Dundee. This analysis is important to make sense of how it is possible to maintain the appearance of structural functionalism despite the real influence of world culture.

To end the discussion on methodology, I want to highlight a few points. First, this case is chosen because of the researcher's interest in this particular story as well as good access to it. Being a case study, it is obviously not possible to generalise these findings to argue that such dynamics apply in all cases, i.e. beyond Dundee. However, I believe that the findings of this case study could prove to be informative about the potential dynamics behind similar cases elsewhere. The fact that the particular dynamics are shown to exist in one place, proves that they are possible elsewhere (Alasuutari, 2013).

5. Main justifications of cultural policies in Dundee

This first empirical chapter addresses the first research question of how cultural policies are justified in the official cultural policy documents of Dundee. It begins with economic justifications which are further divided into different sub-types, including cultural industries, tourism and creative economy. After outlining the economic justifications the discussion moves on to the social justifications of cultural policies. These are followed by a shorter analysis of intrinsic justifications. Finally, the analysis reveals one further group of justifications evident in the documents, which is

termed as global justifications. This novel finding illustrates the explanatory power of world culture theory.

5.1. Economic justifications

Chapter 2 identified three distinctive economic benefits associated with culture and cultural policies. These include the cultural industries, tourism and creative economy. Evidence of all of these used as justifications can also be found in the documents of Dundee as is shown below. However, I will begin with a discussion on the extent to which economic discourse has entered the official parlance of cultural policy-making.

Economic discourse in cultural policy documents

One useful way to map how official documents view the world around them is to focus on the use of metaphors. This focus on metaphors can be viewed as a critical tool to studying texts since 'metaphors are not just superficial stylistic adornments of discourse. When we signify things through one metaphor rather than another, we are constructing our reality in one way rather than another' (Fairclough, 1992, p.194). The increasing prevalence of commodification in modern discourse has also been identified by discourse analysts, such as Fairclough (1992, p.207) who defines commodification as a process 'whereby social domains and institutions, whose concern is not producing commodities in the narrower economic sense of goods for sale, come nevertheless to be organised and conceptualised in terms of commodity production, distribution and consumption'. This commodification of culture is apparent in the cultural policy documents of Dundee.

In one instance the older Cultural Strategy (2009) of Dundee describes creativity as:

'The necessary currency and consequence of involvement in cultural activity, and a commodity that can be transferred to influence and benefit many other aspects of daily life - work, education, play'. (Cultural Strategy, 2009)

The terms of 'currency' and 'commodity' which are associated with creativity show how economic metaphors have entered the official parlance. Furthermore, in the older Cultural Strategy (2009), culture is often discussed as a 'service'. In the 21st century, the concept of service is mostly

associated with its capitalist undertone which designates service as something produced for the consumers (Rautiainen-Keskustalo, 2014). In addition, the UNESCO Application bid (2014) refers to the 'added value', 'production' and 'consumption' of culture, each of which is typically found in economic discourse. The documents also repeat concepts and words such as 'cultural industries', 'creative industries', 'marketing', and 'branding'. All this manifests the commodification of culture and the power of economic discourse in making sense of our social reality. However, it should be borne in mind that this commodification of discourse is essentially a global development (Fairclough, 1992), and as such, it shows the ability of world cultural perspective to help make sense of the development.

Cultural industries

The cultural industries feature high on the cultural policy agenda of Dundee. All three cultural policy documents under scrutiny make several references to the ability of cultural policies to boost the local economy.

The current Cultural Strategy (2014) clearly recognises the important impact cultural industries can have on the overall economy. It highlights the need to 'turn local talent into jobs' and the potential of 'commercialising creative output'. The same document continues that the city is committed to 'develop and support effective pathways to enable the citizens of Dundee to make the most of their abilities within the cultural and creative industries'. One of the three core objectives of cultural policies is to 'contribute actively to creating a healthy, more equitable, economically successful City'. Cultural industries are explicitly mentioned to play a role to achieve this end. The paper also enumerates several practical policy initiatives through which self-employed creative practitioners and businesses are helped. These include for instance the Cultural Skills Academy, Talent Development Hub, Creative Dundee and the growing supply of affordable work spaces.

The older Cultural Strategy (2009) sets out to address especially four key areas identified in the Single Outcome Agreement which represents the wider commitments of the Dundee Partnership. The first and third of these action areas can be considered to fall in the category of economic benefits. These are 'employment opportunities' and 'escaping poverty'. In the same way as the current strategy, the older strategy also has an objective 'to develop and support effective pathways to enable the citizens of Dundee to make the most of their abilities within the cultural

and creative industries'. To this end, the document expands the traditional understanding of cultural policy-making, which only includes the actions of the government, and instead identifies a wider group of actors as responsible for cultural policies⁴:

'The Cultural Strategy is not aimed solely at the public sector as there are aspects that will be out with its responsibility or capability. Some recommendations will be more pertinent to people involved professionally and voluntarily in the creative industries and economy – in retail, leisure, vocational and academic studies and Dundee's communities'. (Cultural Strategy, 2009)

Of different cultural industries, the older Cultural Strategy (2009) names the digital media sector as 'a key part of the local economy'. It goes on saying that the 'digital media businesses in particular have become associated with the economic renaissance of Dundee'. Moreover, Interactive Tayside is mentioned as an initiative which has helped to 'build a digital media community, encourage collaboration between businesses and academia, develop new commercial opportunities and promote the skills and talents of the area's digital media practitioners'. As a result, 'there are now more than 350 companies with a combined turnover of £185m per annum'.

The UNESCO Application bid (2014) does not differ from the other documents in its emphasis on cultural industries. It says that 'we believe in the transformative power of design to grow our city [including] in its ability to enhance our companies'. The paper specifically mentions the Dundee Cloth project which links designers with seamstresses from the city and which will 'contribute towards the regeneration of one of the more economically disadvantaged areas of the city'. It also explores 'the creation of a new centre for design and creativity in the city to provide a physical locus for the growing number of commercial spin-off design businesses'.

Tourism

Increased tourism is another economic justification which can be found in all three documents. However, a bit surprisingly, given the fact that it is a fairly straightforward economic justification, tourism does not receive as much attention as other types of economic discourses.

⁴ see wider discussion in the introduction.

The older Cultural Strategy (2009) states as an objective to 'improve the awareness and marketing of Dundee's cultural assets to local people and visitors'. The UNESCO Application document (2014) sees that the 'UNESCO Creative City status is a terrific opportunity for Dundee, and [as such it] will allow the city to highlight its cultural, creative and educational assets on a global platform [and to] promote the city as an exciting and vibrant place to work, visit, learn and do business'. An increase in the number of visitors is also mentioned as one of its measures of success (UNESCO Application, 2014). The current Cultural Strategy (2014) makes most references to the importance of increasing tourism. The authors of the document strive, for example, to 'develop cultural tourism and the offer for visitors' (Cultural Strategy, 2014). The document uses a term 'visitor economy' which is to be developed through promotion of the city's culture and heritage (Cultural Strategy, 2014). It also focuses especially on marketing the city by 'working with those involved in economic development, marketing and branding to develop a coherent approach to the external image of the City and the messages, and media that are used to reach audiences and visitors' (Cultural Strategy, 2014).

Creative economy

In addition to tourism and cultural industries, the documents also justify cultural policies by adopting the discourse of creative economy.

To begin with, the current Cultural Strategy (2014) specifically mentions the creative economy with its aim to develop 'the creative economy to become one of the City's key economic drivers'. Moreover, the emphasis on the creative economy becomes especially apparent with regard to the need to retain local creative workforce. The idea that cities compete for talented individuals and that a vibrant cultural life is crucial in the attempt to attract the workforce, as discussed in the theory chapter, are common ways to read Florida's argument about the creative economy. It is no wonder that Dundee emphasises the competition for creative workforce given the large numbers of students in the city, many of whom leave Dundee upon graduation. In consequence, the documents highlight the following points and objectives:

'The cultural landscape is also a key feature of making Dundee an attractive location for the attraction of talent within a global marketplace'. (Cultural Strategy, 2009)

'Engage universities in a city-wide plan for the retention of creative graduates within the City'. (Cultural Strategy, 2009)

'Retain and attract creative talent to the City by creating an environment throughout the public, private and academic realm that declares Dundee as a city that welcomes and supports ideas and innovation'. (Cultural Strategy, 2014)

Finally, the older Cultural Strategy (2009) discusses the importance of the digital media sector for the cultural landscape and the economy of the city. According to the document, the importance of the sector 'is reflected in the number of creative people employed in the sector who are consumers of cultural activity, as well as contributors to cultural activity'. This idea of the dual function of the creative class as both consumers and creators of cultural activities also reminds of Florida's argument and sheds light on the essence of the new creative economy. Accordingly, the economy and cultural life should no longer be considered as two separate spheres.

5.2. Social justifications

Despite the increasing prevalence of economic justifications, social justifications behind cultural policies have not disappeared anywhere. On the contrary, the cultural documents of Dundee make frequent references to different social benefits.

'While economic benefit was viewed as a welcome outcome of the Cultural Strategy's commitments, it was felt it should not be the starting point for its objectives'. (Cultural Strategy, 2009)

This extract from the older Cultural Strategy (2009) makes it clear that economic benefits should not drive cultural policy-making. As a result, out of the four key areas identified in the Single Outcome Agreement, which represents the wider commitments of the Dundee Partnership, the second and fourth can be considered to fall in the category of social benefits. These are 'skills and qualifications at school' and 'health and fitness' (Cultural Strategy, 2009). To achieve these ends, the Dundee Partnership has, for example, established a Theme group which brings together the cultural sector with agencies committed to the promotion of lifelong learning (Cultural Strategy, 2009).

The current Cultural Strategy (2014) has a similar social emphasis, and one of the three main objectives of its authors is to ‘build the confidence and self-esteem of our individuals and communities in their abilities’. Furthermore, the UNESCO Application bid (2014) manages to associate its emphasis on design with social benefits by arguing that ‘we are particularly focused on using design as a cornerstone of our approach to redress some of the social inequalities and opportunities that exist in the city’.

‘There is a growing evidence base of the links between cultural participation and social capital (bonds and networks of trust and reciprocity) in communities, this is a fundamental condition for sustainable cultural and social development. It can evidence itself in various ways, including:

Civic participation and volunteering rates

Improved literacy, writing, numeracy skills

Increased skills in the key competencies of problem solving, planning and organising, communication and working with others’. (Cultural Strategy, 2009)

As the extract above suggests, the documents identify many links between cultural policies and different social benefits. Some of the most prevalent ones include the health and educational benefits associated with culture. First, the impact of culture on health is mentioned in all documents. The current Cultural Strategy (2014) mentions health inequalities as one of the key measurements of cultural impacts. ‘Health and fitness’ are also one of the four key areas identified in the older Cultural Strategy (2009). And finally, the UNESCO Application (2014) underlines the transformative power of design to ‘bring imaginative solutions to our health provision’ among other benefits. Second, education is another social impact of culture which is emphasised in all three documents. The current Cultural Strategy (2014) is committed to ‘giving all children a creative education’. What is more, the second of the four key areas of the older Cultural Strategy (2009) addresses ‘skills and qualifications at school’. The UNESCO Application document (2014), for its part, introduces a pilot project in design-led education focused on improving literacy.

As a final point, the extent to which the social dimension has come to dominate today’s cultural policy discourse is evident in the documents’ underlying messages of democratisation,

participation and social inclusion. According to Fairclough (1992), democratisation of discourse has been a growing trend in recent decades. By this he means the 'removal of inequalities and asymmetries in the discursive and linguistic rights, obligations and prestige of groups of people' (Fairclough, 1992). The use of different social dialects in official documents, the possibility of ordinary citizens of different backgrounds to contribute to these documents and the tendency to informality, for instance, manifest this democratisation of discourse. The emphasis on participation and social inclusion have also grown in importance in the academic discussion on cultural policies due to the advent of digital technologies and digital culture, and the changes in the consumption of media culture and in the nature of leisure activities (Virolainen, 2015). This cultural participation consists not only of taking part in cultural activities, but it also means increasing the citizens' participation in the discussion and decision-making concerning cultural policies (Ibid).

The use of quotes of 'ordinary' citizens describing 'what surprises them about their city' throughout the current Cultural Strategy (2014) builds a democratic picture of cultural policy-making. The document thus appears to incorporate the insights of the wider population when constructing cultural policies. These quotes are said to be unedited submissions from local people in 2013 to the WeDundee website (www.wedundee.com), which had over 4,000 contributions. To give an example:

'Being a foreigner who has settled down in Dundee, I found Dundee very accommodating to internationalism. It's not surprising. Having the advantage of our harbours and wharfs, Dundee is used to welcoming visitors. The Dundee International Women's Centre has been servicing the international community for over 40 years. I love living in Dundee and the cultural diversities and dynamics here excite me'. (Cultural Strategy, 2014)

While these quotes are anonymous in that the identities of the citizens are not mentioned, the extract above suggests that the writer is an immigrant and likely to be a woman. This reinforces the picture that different societal groups are taken into account and listened to when constructing cultural policies. The real significance of the input of ordinary citizens can of course be questioned, but the point of this analysis is to show that the writers of the document clearly view this portrayal, that the wider population has contributed to these policies, as important.

This thesis associates the frequent emphasis on different social benefits with the global discourse on cultural policies. I will shortly discuss why I believe such discourses must be placed in the global context and understood as global phenomena.

5.3. Intrinsic justifications

The traditional justification of cultural policies, that of supporting culture for the sake of culture, has not disappeared anywhere. Despite the growing influence of both instrumental social arguments from the 1960s onwards and instrumental economic arguments from the 1980s onwards, 'the basic aim of 1950s urban cultural policies of promoting high-quality art and widening access to it remains one of the reasons for cultural funding at municipal level' (Bianchini, 1993, p.18). These types of intrinsic justifications can be identified in the cultural policy documents of Dundee as well.

The authors of the older Cultural Strategy (2009) admit that 'for the public sector the primary impulse [for engaging with cultural activities] is often instrumental'. That is to say the public sector is more likely to consider the various economic and social benefits that can result from a healthy creative sector. However, as explained in the introduction, cultural policy-making should no longer be considered as the exclusive domain of the government. In constructing their cultural strategies, the city officials of Dundee have also consulted a large group of different actors in the field of culture (Cultural Strategy, 2009). The older Cultural Strategy (2009) goes on to argue that the primary impulse of the cultural sector (including for example professional and non-professional cultural organisations and creative individuals) is usually more intrinsic. As a result, this cultural sector ensures that the intrinsic value of culture is not forgotten when different policies are designed and that culture is promoted also as a value in itself.

The current Cultural Strategy (2014) similarly justifies cultural policies by emphasising the intrinsic value of culture. For example, immediately after having outlined the three core objectives, the document adds and emphasises an important point:

'We recognise the importance of outstanding creativity as an end in itself, and will work towards identifying opportunities for and encouraging support for creative talent to flourish and be enjoyed by the public'. (Cultural Strategy, 2014)

5.4. Global justifications

In addition to economic, social and intrinsic justifications, I identify one further justification in the documents. These types of justifications for cultural policies, which I coin as global justifications, do not fit neatly into the other categories. In the cultural policy documents, Dundee is placed in a context which is essentially global. This global context is then used to justify cultural policies. What is more, global awards and statistics presented by international authorities are also viewed as valid justifications in themselves and not necessarily discussed as instruments to other types of benefits.

One of the objectives of Dundee's cultural policies is to make a significant international impact. For instance, this emphasis on the global context is apparent in the current Cultural Strategy (2014). The main objectives of the document have been refined into a series of actions. Under the action termed as 'Significant' the authors of the document 'will ensure Dundee makes a significant contribution to the national and international stage' (Cultural Strategy, 2014). The value of the global cultural impact is largely assumed and not clearly explained. While this is in itself a curious phenomenon and manifests the importance of global context in general, it also has its repercussions for the justifications of cultural policies. When global context is given an important role, cultural policies can be justified by emphasising their ability achieve a global impact. In Dundee, two types of global justifications are used.

First, Dundee aims to re-establish its global identity by focusing on culture. The history of Dundee is very much tied to global developments. Professors Jim Tomlinson and Christopher Whatley (2011) have argued that due to its dependence on jute industry, Dundee of the early 20th century can be considered to have been one of the most economically globalised cities in the world. The collapse of the sector then led to a long period of decline in Dundee. In order to understand the relevance of globalisation to the identity of Dundee, one needs to know this background. Hence, the UNESCO Application bid (2014) also discusses how the history of Dundee is tied to globalisation. It mentions how Dundee once grew because of large industries which owed their origins to global trade links. Not surprisingly, Patrick Geddes, a Dundonian thinker, who purportedly coined the term 'think global, act local', is also mentioned. Today the city aims to rekindle its global links by focusing on design and culture (UNESCO Application, 2014). This is done

not so much to gain additional benefits, though these are also mentioned, but because being global is part of Dundee's identity.

'Dundee will contribute something different and valuable to the Creative Cities Network – the perspective of an average-size world city. Our scale is smaller than the recognised global cities, but is the median for most cities in most countries around the world. We want to demonstrate how communities our size can contribute meaningfully to our city-region, our country, and to a worldwide network – where design is a common bond, and imagination a universal currency.' (UNESCO Application, 2014)

This extract taken from the UNESCO Application bid (2014) shows a new way of conceiving Dundee and its identity as being truly global. On the one hand, while Dundee is clearly not the size of the cities traditionally viewed as global cities, it in fact represents the median of most cities around the world. The city follows a global trend, even though it does not have as many global companies or as large ethnic populations as the 'conventional' global cities. The experience of Dundee in using design, for example, can thus become universal currency in a very meaningful way. On the other hand, one of the objectives of Dundee is clearly to join the ranks of those global cities. It is argued in the UNESCO Application document (2014) that the V&A Museum of Design will host international blockbuster exhibitions, 'allowing the city to join an exclusive circuit of major global cities'.

Second, the emphasis on international statuses, labels and awards best illustrates the relevance of global justifications. It can be argued that, in the documents, a global or international recognition is often constructed as a measure of success. It thus works as a justification for policies. The older Cultural Strategy (2009), for example, boldly states that 'Dundee's strengths in culture, creative industries, life sciences and bio-research are now viewed in an international context'. The same document continues to name specific achievements of Dundee: 'more recently, in New York in May 2008, and again in 2009, Dundee was voted one of the world's seven most intelligent cities for the second year in a row' (Cultural Strategy, 2009). It even goes on to explain why external recognition should be viewed as a justification for cultural policies:

'While awards and external recognition do not tell the whole story, they are an important indicator of cultural and intellectual health, and hopefully serve to

reassure the public sector that their ongoing investment and commitment is well placed'. (Cultural Strategy, 2009)

The fact that Dundee was awarded the status of UNESCO City of Design is viewed as perhaps the most important cultural recognition so far. The current Cultural Strategy (2014) states that 'the City's successful bid to be designated as a UNESCO City of Design is a tremendous achievement'. Despite or namely because of this achievement, the growing emphasis on international recognition shows no sign of abating. The current Cultural Strategy (2014), for example, declares an important objective to 'create the conditions for a realistic and credible European Capital of Culture 2023 bid (in 2017)'.

While the documents also emphasise the value of transnational collaboration in achieving other ends, the focus on global context is more than just instrumental. The global identity and international recognition are themselves treated as justifications for cultural policies.

6. Key conduits of world cultural influence

This thesis now turns to analyse the documents from the perspective of the second research question: which world cultural institutions have influenced the choice of these particular justifications? One important argument of this paper is that structural and rational choice theories have difficulties in explaining why specific cultural policies are chosen over others. World cultural perspective, on the other hand, does help to identify underlying dynamics at play. The role of global justifications behind cultural policies, which was explained above, is only one example of the extent to which decision-makers are influenced and constituted by the wider global cultural context. World cultural approach does help to identify even those developments which, on the face of it, seem to conform to functional, economic and rational requirements. As mentioned in the theory chapter, world culture theorists are sometimes accused of not paying sufficient attention to the mechanisms and governance methods of policy diffusion. To avoid this, I now turn to observe how ideas flow from global to local level and explicate evidence of this. The analysis reveals that international organisations, universities, statistics and measurement, and global political culture are the key conduits of world cultural influence in Dundee.

6.1. International organisations

A comparison between the older Cultural Strategy (2009) and the most recent Cultural Strategy (2014) reveals interesting aspects. While the former makes only a few mentions of the cultural field of design, the latter makes regular references to design and clearly elevates the role of design in Dundee's cultural policies:

'To highlight our ambition, Dundee wants to be in a position by 2019 to be acknowledged internationally as a successful City of Design'. (Cultural Strategy, 2014)

'We want to ensure Dundee is known as an international city of design'. (Cultural Strategy, 2014)

What then has effectively changed in a matter of a few years? It is important to notice that design is not claimed to lead to any specific economic or social benefits, nor is it claimed to be of more value or more effective in achieving some benefits than any other cultural field. Ultimately, the difference seems to be the fact that Dundee became a member of UNESCO's Creative Cities Network in 2014 and has been awarded the status of UNESCO's 'Creative City of Design'. So far 22 cities around the world have been awarded with this status. The stated aim of the network is to 'strengthen cooperation with and among cities that have recognised creativity as a strategic factor of sustainable development as regards economic, social, cultural and environmental aspects' (UNESCO, 2004). Being part of the network requires yearly reports on the implementation and evaluation of activities related to the specific field, in this case design. The status provided by this international organisation serves as a justification and explains this major shift in focus:

'We will implement the commitments of our UNESCO City of Culture status to ensure design is a signature strength of our City'. (Cultural Strategy, 2014)

'Design will increase in importance as the City establishes itself as a UNESCO World City of Design and welcomes the V&A Museum of Design, Dundee'. (Cultural Strategy, 2014)

In this case, UNESCO has arguably offered important coherence and focus for the cultural policy-making in Dundee. Hence, the current Cultural Strategy (2014) is more focused in its approach to

culture than its predecessor. Neo-institutionalist writers have argued that international organisations are a key conduit of world culture and its associated discourses to local level (see Boli and Thomas, 1997). Importantly, however, I do not argue that it is the influence of UNESCO alone which is behind the policy line of Dundee. This is because the Creative Cities Network of UNESCO consists of altogether seven different cultural fields. Dundee could have just as well chosen to focus on some other field, such as music and media arts, which given the developed games industries in Dundee, would have been a credible policy line. However, Dundee's existing strengths in design, the upcoming V&A Museum of Design and the coherence and focus provided by UNESCO have arguably together elevated the role of design. In contrast, the documents do not provide any evidence for a view that design derives its role from some functional or rational necessity. All in all, the role of international organisations in modern world culture cannot be overlooked.

6.2. Universities

The impact of universities on cultural policies is significant in Dundee, and the higher education institutions provide another crucial conduit of world cultural influences. Klaic (2012, p.62) argues that the impact of universities on cultural policies is stronger in small cities, where there is a lot of potential for city-university partnerships. In Dundee, the most important institutions include the University of Dundee, the University of Abertay Dundee, and the Dundee and Angus College. The fact that Dundee has the largest proportional student population in all of Scotland (which makes the education sector a significant employer in the city) (Dundee City Council, 2016), underlies the influence of the higher education sector.

This influence of the higher education institutions of Dundee on the cultural policies is evident in the documents. Due to the Dundee Partnership model, universities are mentioned as collaborators in all three documents. According to the UNESCO Application bid (2014), for example, the Implementation Team responsible for the delivery of policies related to Dundee Creative City of Design (DCCD), consists of secondments from the Dundee City Council, University of Dundee, Abertay University and Creative Dundee, in other words experts from two universities. The same document also states that:

'Our research institutions in the city are a particular strength, especially in areas that link design and the creative industries with life sciences and social research. We would like the network to consider that Dundee lead on the creation of a comparative Index of Creativity that could be applied across the cities to assess the growth and development of the creative industries and their direct and indirect contribution to the social and financial economy of the city'. (UNESCO Application, 2014)

The influence of universities is ultimately based on the salience of scientific knowledge in modern world culture. 'Scientists and professionals have become central and prestigious participants in world society. Their authority derives not from their strength as actors - indeed, their legitimated postures are defined as disinterested rationalised others rather than actors - but from their authority to assimilate and develop the rationalised and universalistic knowledge that makes action and actorhood possible' (Meyer et al., 1997, p.165). The universities channel research to local decision-makers and the research done in the universities also forms an important justification for further policies. As was discussed in the theory chapter, scientists have identified a varied rationale for cultural policies. As a result, the documents use a wide variety of justifications for cultural policies, all of which are common discourses in world culture and by no means restricted to Dundee.

6.3. Statistics and measurement

Related to the important role of science in world culture, is the growing use of statistics and measurement in justifying policy decisions. Mirja Liikkanen (2014) discusses how statistics, mainly economic statistics, play a major role in the change of cultural policies. She argues that this development, namely the emphasis on statistics, strengthens the economic rationale behind cultural policies. I agree with Liikkanen that this emphasis on the use of statistics in understanding cultural as well as most other policy fields is a global development, and that in the field of culture it is driven by international organisations, such as UNESCO. I would not, however, attribute this emphasis on statistics and measurement solely to the overarching influence of economic discourse or capitalist markets. Different actors do, after all, take advantage of many other types of statistics in addition to economic ones as I will shortly discuss with reference to the documents of Dundee. World culture theorists have also noted the growing use of statistics. For instance, Marjaana

Rautalin (2013) has examined how the OECD's international PISA rankings have been used by local actors to advance their causes in domestic settings. It appears that in modern world culture, quantitative measurements in general are important for the scientific understanding of social reality.

All three cultural policy documents of Dundee agree on the need to measure the impact of cultural policies. In fact, it is so clearly foregrounded that I would like to suggest that many of the justifications, which have been identified as either economic, social, intrinsic or global, have become prominent simply because they are easier to measure. This is surely a bold claim, but the documents provide evidence for it.

While the older Cultural Strategy (2009) admits the difficulty of measuring the impact of cultural activities, not least because of the difficulty of establishing and maintaining a relevant set of quantitative data, it does identify a few key measurements. For example, it mentions the Nova Scotia Genuine Progress Index (GPIAtlantic, 2017) as well as the model provided by Francois Matarasso (1999) in his *Towards a Local Cultural Index* as good ways to measure the social benefits of culture (Cultural Strategy, 2009). Also the economic benefits of culture can and have been measured. The UNESCO Application document (2014) says that its measurements of success include, for example, the increase in visitor numbers and the increase in locally owned design retail businesses. The current Cultural Strategy (2014) emphasises both social and economic measurements, as it specifically aims to measure the impact of cultural policies on economic growth, educational attainment, social inclusion and health inequalities. Finally, in addition to economic and social impacts, global successes serve as justifications in themselves. An international award or label, such as the UNESCO City of Design, or a good result in global comparative ranking are celebrated achievements and serve as justifications for cultural policies. There are also ways to measure the global visibility of Dundee. The UNESCO Application bid (2014), for example, notes that the media coverage on Dundee's cultural initiatives will be monitored and measured.

On the other hand, the intrinsic value of culture is a tricky thing to measure or present as quantitative statistics. This is particularly the case because the older Cultural Strategy (2009), for instance, wants to avoid pitting different cultural forms against each other:

'There was a general view that it is important to have an inclusive view and not to measure the cultural value of different types of cultural activity, or ascribe preference for one against the other, e.g. it would be redundant to compare the merit of electronic v live experience, or writing v reading, or opera v country music'. (Cultural Strategy, 2009)

It can thus be argued that the economic, social, and global justifications have become more prominent, while at the same time the previous importance of intrinsic justifications has declined, due to the growing role of scientific measurement in world culture. As such, an intrinsic justification does not provide a very good justification for cultural policies as Matarasso (1999) explains:

'The principal issue here is that cultural activity is still seen principally as a goal, rather than a means. Local authorities tend to see theatres, museums and libraries as intrinsic goods, things which any self-respecting place should have. As such they very often come low on the list of local priorities because of the widespread recognition that schools, social services and housing must come first'.

To conclude in line with neo-institutionalist thinking I argue that the scientification of world culture is the trend which pushes cities such as Dundee to use statistics and to measure the impact of their cultural policies. I do not find evidence that global capitalism or economic imperatives alone would drive this trend (contra Liikkanen (2014)). It just happens to be that monetary calculations are often more straightforward to compile and to understand than other types of measurements. When scientists come up with sound ways to measure the social and global impacts of cultural policies, these too are paid attention to. The documents of Dundee show just this. The intrinsic side of cultural policies is, however, problematic to measure for a number of reasons, which reduces the strength of intrinsic arguments in justifying cultural policies.

6.4. Global political culture

This thesis talks a lot about the impact of world culture, but does not pay much attention to local political culture. This is because the influence of worldwide political culture appears to be more apt to explain the adopted model of cultural policy decision-making in Dundee. I will shortly give

evidence for this claim, but first I want to explain what is meant by this global political culture. Terry Clark (2000) has identified a new worldwide political culture which steers urban policy-making. In short, this new political culture 'implies a weaker role for at least traditional political parties, unions, and organised groups and a stronger role for citizens, the media, and outside experts who can encourage policy innovations' (Clark, 2000, p.24). In the same way as this thesis has argued throughout, Clark's research has also shown that many urban policy-lines have their origins in worldwide trends. But right now I want to discuss how the whole cultural policy-making process in Dundee follows a typical global model.

The Dundee Partnership, which is responsible for comprising all three cultural policy documents, represents a new organisational model which spreads rapidly worldwide. In its own words, 'the Dundee Partnership pools together the strengths of key City agencies including Dundee City Council, Scottish Enterprise, Tayside Police and NHS Tayside, along with local academic institutions and representatives of the business, voluntary and community sectors, providing a vehicle for co-ordinated inter agency working' (Dundee Partnership, 2017). Such a trend has been identified in academic literature as well. For example, Bayliss (2004) argues that public-private partnerships are increasingly chosen as preferred organisational models in urban policy-making. While the partnership approach is itself a global trend, it also means that global influences are more likely to become policies. This is because the academic institutions, businesses, many voluntary institutions and outside experts who can influence policy decisions are typically highly networked and have connections all over the globe. More than this, the notion of global political culture shows how the decision-makers of cultural policies are in fact constituted by the wider global cultural context and not only influenced by it.

7. Underlying contradictions as evidence of world cultural impact

This final analysis chapter deals with the third research question: how can world culture help make sense of the interplay between different justifications? This is an important question because while rational theories may be able to explain individual justifications, the interplay between these may reveal incoherent practices. The cultural policy documents of Dundee indeed reveal some contradictory features which do not conform to functional requirements. The world cultural

perspective can, however, help to make sense of these. To detect these contradictions, one needs to pay close attention to the underlying messages. This is because the documents contain specific narratives which, on the face of it, manage to sustain the appearance of coherence and functionalism. I will end this part with an analysis of these narratives, but first I will explain what is meant by these contradictions.

7.1. Underlying contradictions in the documents

There is no denying the fact that an amalgam of different instrumental justifications of cultural policies can become problematic. This is because economic benefits often require totally different policies than social and global impacts. Furthermore, compared to economic, social and global effects, it takes a completely different set of criteria to determine what type of culture is intrinsically valuable. While cultural policies have increasingly come to be seen as strategies for economic development, this thesis has shown that other types of arguments, such as social and intrinsic ones, have by no means been abandoned, at least in Dundee. Rather, different ‘arguments coexist, often uneasily, within the agenda of city governments... [giving] rise to contradictions and tensions’ (Bianchini, 1993, p.3). I argue that the world cultural perspective is especially useful in trying to make sense of these contradictions.

Perhaps the most obvious example of these underlying contradictions in the documents has to do with the uneasy cohabitation between economic and social justifications. From social point of view, cultural policies should be aimed at benefiting as many as possible and taking into account the diverse needs and interests of different people. The following extract from the older Cultural Strategy (2009) echoes this:

‘There was a clear preference amongst consultees to ‘give people the tools’ and let them decide their own cultural values and priorities, by creating the environment that allows a diversity of opportunities to be experienced and by advocating an interest in them’. (Cultural Strategy, 2009)

On the other hand, economic rationale requires different approaches. As the same older Cultural Strategy (2009) points out, ‘the cultural landscape is also a key feature of making Dundee an attractive location for the attraction of talent within a global marketplace’. This need to attract the educated can at the same time isolate large segments of society who do not consume the same

type of culture. According to Anders Lund Hansen and his colleagues (2001), for example, culture-led economic regeneration does not benefit everybody the same way as some groups become marginalised because of gentrification and low-paid jobs. Economic and social aims can thus be in direct conflict with each other.

Not only can different aims contradict each other, but there can also be disagreement over the question of whether or not it is appropriate to associate certain aims with cultural policies in the first place. From the point of view of economic liberalism, for example, even the use of cultural policies as economic instruments is fundamentally problematic. This is because the perspective holds that the governments should only provide for public goods and thus focus on the social and intrinsic aims of cultural policies, while at the same time they should try to avoid meddling in and distorting the free markets. As a result, many have argued that in order for the creative economy to truly take off, the link between cultural sectors and traditional arts and cultural policy needs to be cut altogether (see discussion in Oakley, 2009). Yet, as I have shown throughout the thesis, the cultural policy documents of Dundee draw frequently on the economic justifications of cultural policies and they discuss boosting the economy with traditional means of cultural policy. This is because such justifications are rather standard ideas in global cultural policy discourse. From pure economic point of view, if we accept that economic liberalism represents that, the whole idea of emphasising economic justifications of cultural policies does not make sense. As a result, this lends credence to the idea that the individual aims of cultural policies are not the only possible results of rational or functional deliberations, and we instead need to pay more attention to why certain ideas gain relevance in global discourse.

The topic of how to engage the wider population in cultural initiatives and planning of cultural policies is a prevalent theme in global cultural policy discourse, and this also gives rise to obvious inconsistencies. According to Virolainen (2015), much cultural policy discussion now revolves around the question of how to promote cultural participation and social inclusion. For example, most of the speeches in the Better Cities Together-seminar organised in Helsinki in 2016 also handled just this topic. Not surprisingly then, in 2013 Dundee created a website (www.wedundee.com) to encourage people to share their ideas and views about the city. According to the UNESCO Application document (2014):

'Our application for UNESCO status is based on the expressed desire of the citizens of our city to determine a design-led approach for the future'. (UNESCO Application, 2014)

'Out of 1,039 ideas received, nearly a third (291) contained an element of design'. (UNESCO Application, 2014)

First of all, I consider the claim that the citizens of Dundee chose to focus on design a bit far-fetched. 291 mentions of design from of a population of around 150 000 is hardly a comprehensive sample. Moreover, it is unlikely that those who share their ideas represent a random sample either. While there is a myriad of research trying to identify the typical consumers of culture, the question of which types of people contribute to the discussion and decision-making concerning cultural policies is not comprehensively researched in a similar manner (Virolainen, 2015). In the absence of reliable data, it is safest to assume that many who contribute to different cultural engagement initiatives are already, if not professionals in the cultural field, then at least frequent consumers of culture. The second illogical point which comes up is that if the people of Dundee have really chosen the line of cultural policies, cultural policies can hardly be justified drawing on intrinsic, economic, social or global benefits. It is unlikely that the people, who are not experts, would know which policy lines lead to what type of benefits. It thus seems that the discourses which can be identified in the documents are essentially a collection of globally prevalent themes, and do not necessarily conform to the dominant political economy or rational choice models of urban policy-making.

As was mentioned in the theory chapter, cultural policies often take centre stage in the branding efforts of different cities. This is done in order to highlight something unique about a city. Therefore, flagship cultural facilities such as museums designed by star architects spring up all over the world. It was also mentioned that this strategy is paradoxical given the fact that this trend merely results in greater global homogenisation (Ponzini, 2012; Kong, 2012). Nevertheless, Dundee follows a similar global trend as it invests heavily in the Victoria & Albert Museum of Design. The UNESCO Application bid (2014) talks about the V&A in the following manner:

'The first design museum in the UK outside London, an international centre of design for Scotland, in an iconic building designed by world-class architects Kengo Kuma Associates'. (UNESCO Application, 2014)

'An iconic world design institution and an international architect ... come together'. (UNESCO Application, 2014)

'The Waterfront Project aims to fundamentally change the image and perception of the city ... [and] has chosen to invest in V&A Museum of Design, Dundee as its flagship'. (UNESCO Application, 2014)

'The main exhibition space will be the largest in Scotland and is designed specifically to host the V&A's international 'blockbuster' exhibitions, allowing the city to join an exclusive circuit of major global cities'. (UNESCO Application, 2014)

The V&A is also specifically mentioned as a 'unique asset' and it is hoped that this can really put Dundee on the map. For example, Tomlinson and Whatley (2001) say that the V&A Museum of Dundee carries with it high hopes that 'Dundee can benefit from the rise in cultural tourism and other spin-offs of the kind that have resulted from the spectacular Guggenheim Museum of modern art in Bilbao, opened in 1997'. But in fact there is nothing unique about building a large museum designed by world-class architects. As was pointed out in the theory chapter, this same discourse, often termed as Bilbao effect, is utilised the world over, from Abu Dhabi to Dundee. And this is the way we should really understand the phenomenon: as a widespread discourse and a trend in modern world culture. Here I want to be clear that I am not arguing against building beautiful museums. I myself very much enjoy visiting those and I am sure the V&A can benefit Dundee in many different ways. But from purely rational perspective it would be paradoxical to argue that this is what makes Dundee unique.

One final point I want to address is the tendency in the documents to emphasise the benefits of global networks. It is true that individual cities can gain valuable knowledge by cooperating with other cities on different initiatives, and by sharing experiences and learning from one other. However, when these networks grow in size to include more and more cities, it becomes increasingly difficult to coordinate cultural initiatives and cooperation. For example, the UNESCO Creative Cities network, of which Dundee is a member, has been growing in size over the years. It is hard to tell what is the optimal number of cities which should be included in the network, but in order to maintain the efficient functioning of the network, it cannot grow indefinitely. Yet, it can be expected that the growing impact of world culture will result in more cities all over the world filing their applications to join the network. It might therefore be more efficient to cooperate with

different cities on a case-by-case basis, instead of operating under the auspices of less functional organisations.

7.2. How do the documents manage the contradictions?

I have now established that Dundee's cultural policy documents use mainly four types of justifications, namely economic, social, intrinsic and global ones. I have also discussed how, taken together, these do not necessarily create a coherent line of argument but instead different justifications may and indeed do contradict each other. How do the documents then maintain the appearance of internal coherence and structural functionalism in the light of these findings? I will now utilise the approach of Maarten Hajer (1995) explained in the methodology section as a sense-making device.

The uneasy cohabitation between different cultural policy justifications can be overcome or at least downplayed by maintaining a level of vagueness. The current Cultural Strategy of Dundee (2014) has 'regeneration through culture' as its main objective. In other words, 'Dundee will aim to be recognised as Scotland's leader of culture-led regeneration by 2018' (Cultural Strategy, 2014). The UNESCO Application document (2014), for its part, talks frequently about 'design-led regeneration'. These statements presuppose that culture leads to regeneration, but it is left unclear what is meant by regeneration. This vagueness serves a purpose. The term can be interpreted in a number of ways depending on the preference of the reader. For example, it may refer to economic regeneration, regeneration of social relations, architectural regeneration etc. Commentators on both sides of the debate, i.e. those who argue for the economic benefits of culture (Bayliss, 2007; Pratt, 2008) and social impacts of cultural policies (Griffiths, 2006; Landry et al., 1996), frequently use the term and they obviously mean different things. The fact that regeneration is initially left unexplained helps to unite different perspectives and helps not to isolate any potential participants in the process.

Hajer's (1995) notion of discourse-coalitions, which was discussed in the methodology chapter in more detail, helps to show how different discourses can be united under one discourse. The process of forming a discourse coalition requires actively combining previously independent practices so that they get a meaning in a common political project. In this process, a specific set of story-lines attracts and unites actors with different and even opposing interests. In the cultural

policy documents of Dundee, cultural regeneration provides such inclusive story-line which unites different discourses on the role of culture.

The current Cultural Strategy of Dundee (2014) later outlines three core objectives which 'help guide ... continued regeneration through culture over the next ten years'. First, the focus on culture helps to 'contribute actively to creating a healthy, more equitable, [and] economically successful City'. Second, it will help to 'make ... cultural sector sustainable'. Third, it will help to 'build the confidence and self-esteem of ... individuals and communities in their abilities'. These three core objectives explain what is meant by cultural regeneration. As a final note, the same document also recognises 'the importance of outstanding creativity as an end in itself'. As a result, cultural regeneration has been transformed into a very inclusive concept, referring to economic, social and intrinsic benefits of cultural investments. The UNESCO Application bid (2014), for its part, associates three projects with design-led regeneration. The first event brings together representatives from the Creative Cities to 'agree the common issues, challenges and opportunities in this area, and to share models of good practice in approaching it'. The second project focuses on improving literacy, while the third project will create employment. So in this document too, design-led regeneration refers to different justifications, such as economic and social benefits.

To conclude, the initially neutral and somewhat vague concept of regeneration is interpreted widely to accommodate different perspectives. The easily approachable and inclusive story-line of cultural regeneration helps to create a discourse coalition. The created discourse coalition has the advantage that it avoids producing subject positions which would oppose proposed cultural policies.

The older Cultural Strategy (2009) does not use the concept of regeneration as a main objective for cultural policies. Instead the strategy has one basic premise - 'that investing in and supporting cultural activity will provide a solid foundation for developing the creativity of Dundee's citizens'. Again, different actors are likely to interpret the idea of creativity differently. Those who value the economic benefits are likely to associate it with the ideas of creative economy, which depends on creative people. The advocates of social benefits may come up with different connotations behind the concept, such as images of personal learning. Finally, because culture is created by the people,

creative citizens are obviously needed to produce valuable art in the future as well, and the idea is thus likely to appeal to the proponents of intrinsic justifications.

This notion of creativity, which is initially left unexplained is later illustrated by saying that ‘creativity and culture can deliver on many aspects of economic growth, regeneration and employment, as well as community engagement, empowerment and leadership’ (Cultural Strategy, 2009). Hence, both economic and social benefits are clearly attached to the notion of creativity. In addition to these economic and social benefits, the notion of ‘creative city’ is said to include the important question of how ‘the intrinsic benefits of creativity [are] fully acknowledged and supported’ (Cultural Strategy, 2009). So this can be interpreted as a nod to those favouring the intrinsic justifications of cultural policies. All in all, as is the case with regeneration, the discourse on creativity constitutes another inclusive story-line in Dundee which bolsters the discourse coalition.

Finally, the documents also use some terms which strengthen the created discourse coalition. The key institutions, organisations and individuals who are responsible for compiling the strategies are named in the documents. The current Cultural Strategy (2014) has mainly been developed by ‘the Dundee Partnership in collaboration with a network of cultural agencies in the City, informed by a series of meetings with representatives of the City’s cultural, community, academic, public and private sectors, and facilitated by Creative Services (Scotland) Ltd’. The regular use of collective words such as ‘we’, ‘us’ and ‘our’ emphasises the unity of the collaborators. But the subject positions the document assigns go beyond the responsibilities of the above mentioned institutions. Take the following examples:

‘To highlight our ambition, Dundee will aim to be recognised as Scotland’s leader of culture-led regeneration by 2018’. (Cultural Strategy, 2009)

‘Build the confidence and self-esteem of our individuals and communities in their abilities’. (Cultural Strategy, 2009)

It is no longer clear who is doing what and what is meant by ‘we’. The aim of Dundee becomes the same as the writers’ ambition. The aims of the writers of the document represent the aims of the city itself. Those who share these ideas are part of ‘us’. The emphasis on the collective terms makes it difficult for the proponents of either economic, social or intrinsic benefits to challenge

these ideas and initiatives. If someone opposes the ideas, they cannot be one of us, they are outsiders. They do not represent the city nor its citizens. The cultural policy discourse coalition in Dundee is very inclusive, but it is such because it aims to be the only influencer in the city.

8. Conclusion and discussion

This thesis set out to examine the ways in which world cultural approach can help to make sense of the cultural policies of Dundee. While a growing number of researchers have turned to neo-institutionalist and world cultural theories to make sense of different aspects of our social reality in recent years, as was discussed in Chapter 3, relatively little attention has been paid to urban cultural policy-making from the world cultural perspective (with the exception of Alasuutari, 2013). This thesis aimed to fill this gap in existing research. To this end, I set three main research questions to guide the thesis. First, how are the cultural policies justified in the official cultural policy documents of Dundee? Second, which world cultural institutions have influenced the choice of these particular justifications? And third, how can world culture help make sense of the interplay between different cultural policy justifications?

To answer these questions, this thesis has analysed three official cultural policy documents of Dundee which form an excellent collection of different discourses on the topic. Using critical discourse analysis I found that the cultural policy documents of Dundee use four different types of justifications of cultural policies. These include the economic, social, intrinsic and global justifications. Each type of justification in turn consists of a larger group of more specific justifications. In other words, the economic arguments are divided into different benefits such as growing tourism, cultural industries and creative economy, and the social justifications include, for example, the educational and health benefits associated with culture. While the literature review showed that the economic, social and intrinsic justifications have also been identified in earlier research on cultural policies, it also revealed that most research on cultural policies tends to focus on just one group of justifications, either economic, social or intrinsic justifications. This thesis

argues that this practice results from the normative nature of most research⁵, as well as from the fact that different aims of cultural policies are widely viewed to require different types of policies.

In addition to these three justifications, the analysis has identified one further group of justifications, which I term as global justifications. Given the insights and findings provided by world culture theorists elsewhere, it was possible for this thesis to take special notice of previously undetected discursive practices in the field urban cultural policies and thus distinguish these global justifications as a specific set of cultural policy justifications. Global justifications refer to the tendency of justifying cultural policies by drawing on international authorities, awards and comparisons, and by discussing the very identity of the city in a global context. The analysis has uncovered evidence of each of these factors in Dundonian cultural policy discourse. For example, the fact that UNESCO, an international organisation and global authority, has designated Dundee a 'Creative City of Design', is in turn clearly used as a justification for existing and future policy lines in Dundee. The use of global justifications is the first evidence of the direct influence of world culture on the urban cultural policies in Dundee.

What is more, the thesis has found evidence that the other three justifications also have their origins in global cultural discourse and as such they manifest the world cultural impact as well. In line with Fairclough's critical discourse analysis, I have sought to place different discourses in their wider social contexts. By comparing the justifications used in Dundee, which were identified in Chapter 5, with the previous research on cultural policies elsewhere outlined in Chapter 2, the economic arguments, the various social benefits, and the intrinsic justifications in Dundee clearly consist of themes which are prevalent topics in the global discourse on cultural policies. As a result, this study argues that the world cultural context provides a relevant social context for the cultural policy justifications used in Dundee. The analysis of the documents further revealed that world cultural institutions, such as international organisations, universities, statistics and global political culture, act as key conduits of world cultural influence and as such they have facilitated the spread of these global ideas to the local level in Dundee. Finally, in order to make sense of the underlying contradictions between different justifications which are evident in the documents, this thesis argues that the cultural policy discourses in the policy documents must be understood

⁵ Chapter 3 discussed the tendency of many studies to explicitly or implicitly promote a preferred aim behind cultural policies.

first and foremost as collections of prevalent global themes, instead of products of rational or functional deliberations.

I have linked these findings to my overall theoretical perspective and as such they give credence to the explanatory power of neo-institutionalism and world culture theory. The dominant theories in the field of urban policy-making, such as the rational choice and structural theories, struggle to make sense of the wide variety of different justifications evident in the documents as well as the underlying contradictions which my research has identified. Such contradictions are particularly problematic for rational choice theory. Furthermore, the impact of the economic structures cannot explain the prevalence of social, intrinsic and global justifications. In addition, the dominant theories fail to explain why certain policies, such as those related to design in Dundee, are chosen over others. The inability of dominant rational choice and structural theories to make sense of the cultural policies of Dundee in their full complexity calls for a cultural approach to urban cultural policy-making. This thesis has shown that in today's globalised world characterised by worldwide connections, this cultural perspective is essentially global in nature.

I am aware of the possible limitations regarding my study. As mentioned in the methodology section, it is not possible to generalise the findings of a case study to always exist. I have shown that world culture perspective can help us make sense of the cultural policies of Dundee. However, we need more studies on the phenomenon elsewhere and we need to relate these findings to other knowledge about cultural policy-making. Having said this, we should not forcefully stick to our dominant functional and rational ideas of how the world operates, since such thinking can hinder our understanding of the phenomenon. At the very least I have shown that it would be beneficial to combine knowledge from world cultural perspective with other theoretical perspectives to get a fuller picture.

One way to find out whether the dynamics I have identified exist elsewhere is of course to conduct more similar case studies. For instance, it would seem that a world cultural approach is required to make sense of a recent cultural policy battle over the proposed Guggenheim museum waged in my home country of Finland and in Helsinki. I would argue that such an approach is much needed given the widely varying understandings regarding the overall discourse and the reasons why the proposal failed. For instance, Lehtonen (2014) (who is presumably against the project) argues that the proponents of the Guggenheim Museum in Helsinki used mainly economic arguments to

justify the building of the museum, while those who were against emphasised the value of culture in itself. Stuba Nikula, the Cultural Director of Helsinki and a supporter of the project, has a very different take on the issue. He argues that the project failed exactly because it was framed as an economic issue and because other benefits such as the social benefits were not discussed (in YLE, 2016). Such views are completely at odds against each other. Different analyses of cultural policy issues reflect differing understandings of what culture is or should be. Using world cultural approach to study the phenomenon would clarify the bigger picture beyond individual preferences, and thus form a more complete picture of different discourses.

I argue that neo-institutionalism and world culture theory can offer important contributions to our understandings of social reality in general. I want to end to this thesis by discussing how some recent political developments also call for new theoretical approaches to complement the dominant theories. While structural functionalism and rational choice are powerful sense-making devices, in that people have a need to justify actions to themselves and to others in a logical manner, they are often not that helpful in making sense of the actual world. In contrast, the insights provided by world culture theory are very useful in trying to make sense of our complex world. I will illustrate this point by bringing up one of the most debated political developments of the past year, namely the rise of Donald Trump as the president of the USA. The discussion has been revolving around the questions of which of his statements are true and which are false. I agree with Dominic Smith (2017), from the University of Dundee, who thinks the fundamental problem with Trump is of making sense, and not so much of establishing truth or falsity. Smith (2017) explains this distinction by saying that 'to be true or false, statements have to make sense – that is, to judge the accuracy of their correspondence, it must be possible to understand them independent of their truth or falsity'. Trying to understand the appeal of Trump using traditional rational choice models is somewhat problematic given the fact that much of what Trump says, does not actually make any sense. His own words are often incoherent and the words and actions of his administration also frequently contradict his statements. When someone or something does not make sense, it is not rational to rely on this person to deliver one way or another. It would therefore be important to study in detail different narratives which challenge the dominance of scientific explanations and logic in modern world culture and which clearly appeal to large numbers of people.

List of references

- Ahearne, J. and Bennett, O., 2009. Introduction. *International Journal of Cultural Policy*. [e-journal] 15(2). Available through: EBSCOhost [accessed: 2.10.2016]
- Alasuutari, P., 2013. Spreading global models and enhancing banal localism: The case of local government cultural policy development. *International Journal of Cultural Policy* [e-journal] 19(1). Available through: Taylor & Francis Online [accessed: 2.12.2016]
- Alasuutari, P. and Qadir, A., 2014. Epistemic governance: an approach to the politics of policy-making. *European Journal of Cultural and Political Sociology* [e-journal] 1(1). Available through: Taylor & Francis Online [accessed: 5.12.2016]
- Anderson, B., 1983. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the origins and Spread of Nationalism*. London: Verso
- Anheier, H. and Isar, Y. eds. 2012. *Cities, Cultural Policy and Governance*. London: SAGE Publications
- Antaki, C., 2008. Discourse Analysis and Conversational Analysis. In: Alasuutari, P., Bickman, L. and Brannen, J. eds., 2008. *The SAGE Handbook of Social Research Methods*. London: Sage. Ch. 25
- Bayliss, D., 2004. Creative Planning in Ireland: The Role of Culture-led Development in Irish Planning. *European Planning Studies* [e-journal] 12(4). Available through: Taylor&Francis Online [accessed: 20.10.2016]
- Bayliss, D., 2007. The Rise of the Creative City: Culture and Creativity in Copenhagen. *European Planning Studies* [e-journal] 15(7). Available through: Taylor&Francis Online [accessed: 19.10.2016]
- Bianchini, F., 1993. Remaking European cities: the role of cultural politics. In: Bianchini, F. and Parkinson, M. eds. 1993. *Cultural policy and urban regeneration: The West European experience*. Manchester: Manchester University Press. Ch. 1

Boli, J., 2005. Contemporary Developments in World Culture. *International Journal of Comparative Sociology* [e-journal] 46(5-6). Available through: Sage Journals [accessed 1.3.2017]

Boli, J. and Thomas, G., 1997. World Culture in the World Polity: A Century of International Non-Governmental Organization. *American Sociological Review* [e-journal] 62(2). Available through: JSTOR [accessed: 22.4.2016]

Büttner, Sebastian. 2014. Global trends in European regional development: EU Cohesion Policy and the case of region-building in Poland. In Alasuutari, P. and Qadir, A. eds. 2014. *National Policy-Making: Domestication of Global Trends*. London: Routledge. Ch.5. [e-book] Available through: EBL [accessed: 2.12.2016]

Castells, M., 1996. *The Rise of the Network Society*. Oxford: Blackwell

Clark, T., 2000. Old and New Paradigms for Urban Research: Globalization and the Fiscal Austerity and Urban Innovation Project. *Urban Affairs Review* [e-journal] 36(1). Available through: SAGE Journals [accessed 5.3.2017]

Criminal Sanctions Agency's Central Administration Unit, 2016. Rikosseuraamuslaitoksen kansainvälisen toiminnan suuntaviivat. [online] Available at: <http://www.rikosseuraamus.fi/material/attachments/rise/julkaisut-muut/vqogalJsf/Kansainvaliset_suuntaviivat_netti.pdf> [accessed: 9.9.2016]

Czarniawska, B., 2002. *A Tale of Three Cities: Or the Glocalisation of City Management*. Oxford: Oxford University Press

De Beukelaer, C., 2014. The UNESCO/UNDP 2013 Creative Economy Report: Perks and Perils of an Evolving Agenda. *The Journal of Arts Management, Law, and Society* [e-journal] 44(2). Available through: Taylor & Francis Online [accessed: 20.4.2016]

DiGaetano, A. and Strom, E., 2003. Comparative Urban Governance: An Integrated Approach. *Urban Affairs Review* [e-journal] 38(3). Available through: Sage Journals [accessed: 1.10.2016]

Dundee City Council, 2016. *Dundee City Economic Profile: March 2016*. [online] Available at: <https://www.dundee.gov.uk/sites/default/files/publications/Dundee%20Economic%20Profile%20March%202016_FINAL_0.pdf> [accessed 15.2.2017]

Dundee City Council and Creative Services Scotland, 2009. *Creative Dundee: the City's Cultural Strategy 2009-2014*. [online] Available at:

<https://www.dundee.gov.uk/dundee-city/uploaded_publications/publication_2348.pdf>
[accessed: 20.1.2016]

Dundee Partnership, 2014a. *Dundee Cultural Strategy 2015-2025*. [online] Available at:

<http://www.dundee.gov.uk/downloads/Dundee%20Cultural%20Strategy_online.pdf>
[accessed 20.1.2016]

Dundee Partnership, 2014b. *UNESCO Creative Cities Dundee City of Design: Summary of Application*. Submitted 20th March 2014. [online] Available at:

<<http://www.dundee.gov.uk/downloads/Dundee%20City%20of%20Design%20-%20Summary%20Document.pdf>> [accessed: 20.1.2016]

Fairclough, N., 1992. *Discourse and Social Change*. Cambridge: Polity Press

Florida, R., 2002. *The Rise of the Creative Class*. New York: Basic Books

GPIAtlantic, 2017. *Genuine Progress Index for Atlantic Canada website* [online] Available at:

<<http://www.gpiatlantic.org/>> [accessed 13.2.2017]

Griffiths, R., 2006. City/culture discourses: Evidence from the competition to select the European capital of culture 2008. *European Planning Studies* [e-journal] 14(4). Available through:

Taylor&Francis Online [accessed: 20.10.2016]

Hafner-Burton, E., Tsutsui, K. and Meyer, J., 2008. International Human Rights Law and the Politics of Legitimation: Repressive States and Human Rights Treaties. *International Sociology* [e-journal]

23(1). Available through: Sage Publications [accessed 20.1.2017]

Hajer, M., 1995. *The Politics of Environmental Discourse: Ecological Modernization and the Policy Process*. Oxford: Oxford University Press

Hajer, M., 2017. *Frequently Asked Questions*. Website of Maarten Hajer [online] Available at:

<<http://www.maartenhajer.nl/wordpress/>> [accessed 20.4.2017]

- Hall, P. and Taylor, R., 1996. Political Science and the Three New Institutionalisms. *Political Studies* [e-journal] 44(5). Available through: Wiley Online Library [accessed: 26.1.2017]
- Hannerz, U., 1987. The World in Creolisation. *Africa: Journal of the International African Institute* [e-journal] 57(4). Available through: JSTOR [accessed 17.1.2017]
- Hansen, K. and Krejci, D., 2000. Rethinking Neoinstitutional Interaction: Municipal Arena-Specific Strategies and the Base Closure Process. *Administration & Society* [e-journal] 32(3). Available through: Sage Publications [accessed 20.1.2017]
- Hesmondhalgh, D., 2007. *The Cultural Industries*. 2nd ed. London: Sage.
- Heywood, A., 2011. *Global Politics*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan
- Howkins, J., 2002. *The Creative Economy: How People Make Money From Ideas*. London: Penguin Books
- Hudson, R., 1995. Making Music Work? Alternative Regeneration Strategies in a Deindustrialized Locality: The Case of Derwentside. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* [e-journal] 20(4). Available through: JSTOR [accessed 17.1.2017]
- Jessop, B., Peck, J. and Tickell, A., 1999. Retooling the Machine: Economic Crisis, State Restructuring, and Urban Politics. In: Jonas, A. and Wilson, D. eds. 1999. *The Urban Growth Machine: Critical Perspectives, Two Decades Later*. Albany: State University of New York Press. Ch.9
- Kantor, P., Savitch, H. and Haddock, S., 1997. The Political Economy of Urban Regimes: A Comparative Perspective. *Urban Affairs Review* [e-journal] 32(3). Available through: Sage Journals [accessed: 4.4.2017]
- Klaic, D., 2012. Cities and Universities: A Virtual Cultural Policy Nexus. In: Anheier, H. and Isar, Y. eds. 2012. *Cities, Cultural Policy and Governance*. London: SAGE Publications. Ch. 4
- Kong, L., 2012. City Branding. In: Anheier, H. and Isar, Y. eds. 2012. *Cities, Cultural Policy and Governance*. London: SAGE Publications. Ch. 6

- Kuusela, H., 2014. Luovuuden uusi aalto. In: Lehtonen, M., Valaskivi, K. and Kuusela, H. eds. 2014. *Tehtävä kulttuurille: Talouden ja kulttuurin muuttuvat suhteet*. Tampere: Vastapaino. p.95-123
- Landry, C., Greene, L., Matarasso, F. and Bianchini, F., 1996. *The Art of Regeneration: Urban Renewal Through Cultural Activity*. London: Comedia
- Lehtonen, M., 2014. Tehtävä kulttuurille? In: Lehtonen, M., Valaskivi, K. and Kuusela, H. eds. 2014. *Tehtävä kulttuurille: Talouden ja kulttuurin muuttuvat suhteet*. Tampere: Vastapaino. p.11-38.
- Lichbach, M., 2003. *Is Rational Choice Theory All of Social Science?* Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press
- Lichbach, M. and Zuckerman, A. eds. 2009. *Comparative Politics: Rationality, Culture, and Structure*. 2nd ed. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Liikkanen, M., 2014. Tilastot kulttuuripoliittisen käänteen palveluksessa. In: Lehtonen, M., Valaskivi, K. and Kuusela, H. eds. 2014. *Tehtävä kulttuurille: Talouden ja kulttuurin muuttuvat suhteet*. Tampere: Vastapaino. p.144-169.
- Lund Hansen, A., Andersen, H. and Clark, E., 2001. Creative Copenhagen: Globalization, Urban Governance and Social Change. *European Planning Studies* [e-journal] 9(7). Available through: Taylor & Francis Online [accessed: 12.12.2016]
- Mabry, L., 2008. Case Study in Social Research. In: Alasuutari, P., Bickman, L. and Brannen, J. eds., 2008. *The SAGE Handbook of Social Research Methods*. London: Sage. Ch. 13
- Matarasso, F., 1997. *Use or Ornament: The Social Impact of Participation in the Arts*. Stroud: Comedia
- Matarasso, F., 1999. *Towards a Local Cultural Index: Measuring the cultural vitality of communities*. London: Comedia
- Meyer, J., Boli, J., Thomas, G. and Ramirez, F., 1997. World Society and the Nation State. *American Journal of Sociology* [e-journal] 103(1). Available through: JSTOR [accessed 10.4.2016]
- Meyer, J. and Bromley, P., 2013. The Worldwide Expansion of "Organization". *Sociological Theory* [e-journal] 31(4). Available through: Sage Journals [accessed 2.2.2017]

- Nieminen, H., 2014. Tiedollisten yhteis maiden lyhyt historia: Tiemerkinä Suomi. In: Lehtonen, M., Valaskivi, K. and Kuusela, H. eds. 2014. *Tehtävä kulttuurille: Talouden ja kulttuurin muuttuvat suhteet*. Tampere: Vastapaino. p.39-67
- Oakley, K., 2009. The disappearing arts: creativity and innovation after the creative industries. *International Journal of Cultural Policy* [e-journal] 15(4). Available through: Taylor and Francis Online [accessed 10.1.2017]
- Peck, J., 2005. Struggling with the Creative Class. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* [e-journal] 29(4). Available through: Wiley Online Library [accessed 23.1.2017]
- Ponzini, D., 2012. Competing Cities and Spectacularizing Urban Landscapes. In: Anheier, H. and Isar, Y. eds. 2012. *Cities, Cultural Policy and Governance*. London: SAGE Publications. Ch. 7
- Powell, W. and DiMaggio, P. eds. 1991. *The New Institutionalism in Organizational Analysis*. Chicago: Chicago University Press
- Pratt, A. C., 2008. Creative Cities: The Cultural Industries and the Creative Class. *Geografiska Annaler: Series B, Human Geography* [e-journal] 90(2). Available through: Wiley Online Library [accessed 20.10.2016]
- Protasel, G., 1988. Abandonments of the Council-Manager Plan: A New Institutional Perspective. *Public Administration Review* [e-journal] 48(4). Available through: JSTOR [accessed 14.1.2016]
- Rautalin, M., 2013. The role of PISA publicity in forming national education policy: The case of Finnish curriculum reform. In: Alasuutari, P. and Qadir, A. eds., 2014. *National Policy-making: Domestication of Global Trends*. London: Routledge. Ch.6
- Rautiainen-Keskustalo, T., 2014. Taide palveluna ja taide arvonluojana – Musiikin arvosta ja lisäarvosta kilpailukapitalismissa. In: Lehtonen, M., Valaskivi, K. and Kuusela, H. eds. 2014. *Tehtävä kulttuurille: Talouden ja kulttuurin muuttuvat suhteet*. Tampere: Vastapaino. p.71-94
- Robertson, R., 1992. *Globalization: Social Theory and Global Culture*. London: Sage

- Ross, M., 2009. Culture in Comparative Political Analysis. In: Lichbach, M. and Zuckerman, A. eds. 2009. *Comparative Politics: Rationality, Culture, and Structure*. 2nd ed. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Ch.6
- Schofer, E., Hironaka, A., John, D. and Longhofer, W., 2012. Sociological Institutionalism and World Society. In: Amenta, E., Nash, K. and Scott, A. eds. 2012. *The Wiley-Blackwell Companion to Political Sociology*. Chichester: John Wiley & Sons. Ch.6
- Scott, A., 1997. The Cultural Economy of Cities. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* [e-journal] 21(2). Available through: Wiley Online Library [accessed 20.10.2016]
- Smith, D., 2017. Never mind truth and lies – ‘Trumpism’ rejects the very idea of making sense. *The Conversation* [online] 2.3.2017. Available at: <<http://theconversation.com/never-mind-truth-and-lies-trumpism-rejects-the-very-idea-of-making-sense-72824>> [accessed: 3.3.2017]
- Steger, M., 2013. *Globalization: A Very Short Introduction*. 3rd ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press
- Stern, M. and Seifert, S., 2017. The Social Wellbeing of New York City's Neighborhoods: The Contribution of Culture and the Arts. *Culture and Social Wellbeing in New York City (2014-16)*. 1. [online] Available at: <http://repository.upenn.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1001&context=siap_culture_nyc> [accessed: 4.4.2017]
- Stone, C., 1995. Political Leadership in Urban Politics. In: Judge, D., Stoker, G. and Wolman, H. eds. 1995. *Theories of urban politics*. London: Sage. Ch.6
- Thomas, G., 1987. *Institutional Structure: Constituting State, Society, and the Individual*. Newbury Park: Sage
- Thomas, G., 2009. World Polity, World Culture, World Society. *International Political Sociology* [e-journal] 3(1). Available through: Wiley Online Library [accessed 10.11.2016]
- Throsby, D., 2001. *Economics and culture*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. [e-book] Available through: Ebrary [accessed: 2.12.2015]

Throsby, D., 2008. Modelling the cultural industries. *International Journal of Cultural Policy* [e-journal] 14(3). Available through: Taylor & Francis Online [accessed: 20.1.2017]

Tomlinson, J. and Whatley, C. eds. 2011. *Jute No More: Transforming Dundee*. Dundee: Dundee University Press

UNESCO, 2004. *Creative Cities Network: Mission Statement*. [online] Available at: <http://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/sites/creative-cities/files/Mission_Statement_UNESCO_Creative_Cities_Network.pdf> [accessed 2.1.2017]

UNWTO, 2016. *UNWTO Tourism Highlights: 2016 Edition*. [online] Available at: <<http://www.e-unwto.org/doi/pdf/10.18111/9789284418145>> [accessed 20.10.2016]

Virolainen, J., 2015. *Kulttuuriosallistumisen muuttuvat merkitykset. Katsaus taiteeseen ja kulttuuriin osallistumiseen, osallisuuteen ja osallistumattomuuteen*. [online] Cuporen verkkojulkaisuja 26. Available at: <http://www.cupore.fi/images/tiedostot/kulttuuriosallistumisenmuuttuvatmerkitykset_000.pdf> [accessed 12.4.2017]

YLE, 2016. *Helsingin kulttuurijohtaja: Tunkkaiset nykymuseot syynä Guggenheimin kaatumiseen*. [online] 1.12.2016. Available at: <<http://yle.fi/uutiset/3-9327854>> [accessed: 26.3.2017]