

Ville Titoff

Looking Green

Visual Environmental Framing of FIFA –
The Context of the Football World Cup 2014 in Brazil

University of Tampere

School for Social Sciences and Humanities

MDP in Peace, Mediation and Conflict Research (history)

Master's Thesis

February 2017

Abstract

The environment has been studied to have a central role in positively peaceful and sustainable development. Thus, it is important to learn more about the alternative contexts where different actors are shaping the global environmental governance process. My research is mapping these alternative contexts and actors by examining how the global corporation family of the world football federation, FIFA, participated in the environmental framing process in the context of the biggest and the most global popular sports event of the world, the football World Cup. More precisely, the context is the latest World Cup-project in Brazil, between years 2007–2014.

As the visual material is a very powerful tool in different framing processes, the focus in this research has been on the visual publications of FIFA. To be more precise, I have analyzed the environment-related photographs published by FIFA in their official website, *fifa.com*. These photographs have been analyzed with the methods of social semiotics, and by using the contemporary historical approach with a careful source critique and deep understanding of the time period and locational context. Content analysis helped to categorize my findings.

I discovered that the visual image of the environmental sustainability campaign of FIFA was not as environmentally responsible as it looks at a first glance. It seems that FIFA selected environmental topics that were easy to make look good, and which were able to receive a lot of media attention. This makes sense from a neo-liberal, business-oriented perspective, but if the football federation wants to participate in a positively peaceful environmental development, it should not only be focusing on topics that are easy to make look good in the most visible scenes of the World Cup. Environment should be gaining more from the popularity of the World Cup, and not vice-versa.

Generally, this means that the value of popular sports in relation to the environmental development would also be recognized more seriously on the academic level. It would mean that the mega-level sports events, which receive a huge international attention, are thought more as scenes for the global environmental governance. In these scenes corporations and organizations are competing to get their share of the massive international publicity and thus, their share of the possibility to affect the current structures of the global governance.

Keywords: *Visual, framing, environment, FIFA, sports, corporations, structural violence, glocalization, positive peace, contemporary history*

Table of Contents

Introduction	1
Background.....	1
Research Questions	2
Connections to Previous Research	4
Sources and the Approach	6
1. The Approach	8
1.1 Contemporary History and Visual Material	8
1.2 Environmental Politics and Peace and Conflict Research.....	12
1.3 Politicized Environment and the Power of Corporate Visual Media Communications.....	17
1.4 Why Football and FIFA World Cup™?.....	26
1.4.1 “Footballization”, Media and Power	26
1.4.2 Football Mega-Events and the Environment	30
2. The Glocal Environmental Context and the Selected Material	32
2.1 The Global Environmental Political Context – the UN Agenda.....	32
2.2 The Environmental Context of Brazil.....	33
2.3 FIFA, the World Cup in Brazil and Environment.....	34
2.4 The Selected Material	36
3. FIFA Defining the Environment.....	40
3.1 Urban Environment.....	40
3.2 Non-urban Environment: Amazonia in the Spotlight.....	45
4. People and the Environmental Campaign of FIFA	49
4.1 ‘The Civilians’	49
4.2 ‘The Men of FIFA’	55
5. The World Cup Stadiums as Environmental Nexus Places – Maracanã as the Ultimate ‘Flagship’	62
6. Looking Good, or too Good? – The Visual Silence of FIFA.....	70
7. Conclusions.....	76
Appendix	86
Sources	90

"In football, the worst blindness is only seeing the ball."
- Nelson Falcão Rodrigues
(1912–1980: Brazilian playwright, journalist, and novelist)

Introduction

Background

The importance of environmental aspects is nowadays acknowledged in peace and conflict research. Since there is a continuous discussion about the environment on the high political level¹, the environmental dimension should be even more present on the academic level, too. From my perspective, this requires deeper and broader understanding of the global environmental governance structures and different contexts and levels, where this complex environmental dimension can be seen.

High-level political actors and environmental organizations are the most visible participants in environmental discussions. However, the global climate change, sustainability, and the use of natural resources are things, which should also be recognized more seriously in other stages of society. My research will offer space for the perspective of global corporate-organizational level, located in the context of global popular sports.

Immediately after the previous declaration, it is important to mention that the popular sports is not happening in a 'vacuum'. Sports is closely connected to the other dimensions of the society; economics, politics, culture and the everyday life of people. It is a recent phenomenon that sports events are also connected with sustainable *environmental* politics. Moreover, this phenomenon receives a lot of media publicity. For example, there has been discussions in media about the environmental aspects in the Rio Olympic Games.² The Beijing World Championships in Athletics in the summer of 2015 also raised concerns in media about the pollution levels in China.³ What is especially important for this thesis, in addition to the journalistic attention, is that the organizers of

¹ By the time writing this introduction, maybe the best example is the United Nations 2015 –summit, which will have climate change, environment and sustainable development as its main focus.

² See for example: <http://www.theguardian.com/sustainable-business/2015/may/04/brazil-drought-2016-olympic-games-rio-de-janiero-rio-20-climate-change> (Visited 29.9.2015).

³ <http://www.express.co.uk/sport/othersport/599223/British-athletes-Farah-Ennis-Hill-pollution-packs-cope-with-Beijing-smog> (Visited 29.9.2015)

international mega-sports events are publishing their own environment-related news and reports⁴. Previous research has already found this linkage between the environment and media publicity important:

“Environmental conflicts and debates over the past decade have been key sites for struggles to achieve visibility in the media. Growth in networked digital communications technology innovation and use since the 1990s has helped to change the conditions for visibility in environmental politics.”⁵

The use of visual material has increased in these struggles to achieve visibility, and “Scholars of environmental communication acknowledge the importance of visual representations in shaping perceptions and actions in relation to environmental affairs”⁶. In this thesis, I have chosen to utilize visual material, more precisely, photographs, as the primary source.

Research Questions

To specify the context of this thesis, it shows how and why the most global and the most popular sport in the planet, football⁷, offers a scene for environmental discourses. It demonstrates how and why the latest flagship event of football, the 2014 World Cup in Brazil, worked as a theater for introducing environmental contents through *digital visual media*, more precisely, through the Internet. As the mega-level sports events, quite exceptionally, receive almost an un-matched international attention, they become media-events where different stakeholders can bring their voices to the environmental discussions via their own publication channels. Taking an advantage of the massive publicity, these stakeholders can affect the framing-process of the environment and the current structures of the world environmental *governance*. Thus, they can affect the management of sustainable environmental development and positive environmental peace.

In this research, I will analyze the visual environmental perspective of a politically and economically powerful global corporate-organization behind the World Cup, *Fédération Internationale de Football Association* (FIFA). FIFA has the special sustainability programme⁸, which was also

⁴ Look for example London Olympics Sustainability Report.
<http://learninglegacy.independent.gov.uk/themes/sustainability/london-2012-sustainability-plan-and-reports.php>
(Visited 24.2.2012).

⁵ Lester & Hutchins 2012, 848.

⁶ Meisner & Takahashi 2013, 255.

⁷ The global football federation *Fédération Internationale de Football Association* (FIFA), has 209 participant countries. In comparison, United Nations has 193 participant countries.

⁸ <http://www.fifa.com/sustainability/index.html> (Visited 18.1.2016) Environment is one of the main topics in the programme.

implemented in the World Cup of Brazil. Thus, FIFA carries the main responsibility about the environmental effects of the World Cup. This makes it important to analyze how and why FIFA informed people about the environmental aspects of the Cup through visual media publications as it did. The source is the official website of FIFA, the *fifa.com*.

The main research question is rising from this soil. After acknowledging the powerful status of the FIFA World Cup 2014 as a media scene, the main question to my primary source is that how FIFA visually used the *fifa.com* during the World Cup–project as a channel to visually participate in politicized environmental discussions: ***How did FIFA visually represent and frame the environment and its environmental actions?***

The answer to the main question is searched with the sub-questions, which can be found in the chapters where I analyze my material. First, in the chapter three, I will analyze a very basic but still important question about how FIFA is defining the environment. *What does the environment look like?* Then, in the chapter four, I will look *what kind of stakeholders, in other words, people, can be seen in the environmental photographs. How is FIFA representing these people?* In the same chapter, the framing of the environmental governance of the World Cup will be analyzed. In the chapter five, a very visible theme of football stadiums is analyzed. There I will ask *how the stadiums are framed and connected to environmental themes and environmental actions of FIFA.*

FIFA is not an un-dependent actor and it has pressures coming from outside. Because of the strong linkages with the corporate-world it is an important task to problematize why possibly FIFA was publishing as it was? It is also necessary to ask *whether there were some environmental aspects that would have fitted to local or global environmental agenda of the time, but which were not shown by FIFA.* Why was FIFA staying blind about these aspects? Deciding *not to show* something in the public has been studied to be as strong way of using power as showing something.⁹ This theme will be addressed in the chapter six, ‘Looking Good, or too Good? – The Visual Silence of FIFA’. There I will concentrate on environmental aspects that FIFA was framing out from its campaign.

⁹ Lester & Hutchins 2012.

Two themes rising from the agenda of peace and conflict studies are offering me observation tools, which I will use when I analyze the photographs. First, I will look whether it was a global, a local, or a *glocal* environmental level that was in the center of visualizations. Secondly, I will observe if FIFA is framing the environment more as a way for peaceful cooperation or as a source of risks. As I said, these themes are shaping the overall-lenses, which I will be using when evaluating whether FIFA was contributing to the comprehensive, sustainable and peaceful environmental development with its visual framing of the environmental themes described above – or whether the emphasis was more on polishing its own brand image. Of course, both of the perspectives may be seen, but it is interesting to see whether one or the other of these perspectives can be seen more clearly. Was the campaign of FIFA green, or was it just looking green?

Connections to Previous Research

Analyzing the visual perspective of an international sports corporate-organization brings a fresh and a current point of view to the research of politicized environment and media power. Without the journalistic need of explaining the world neutrally, organizations bring their own perspectives to the public discussions directly by themselves. According to Nick Couldry, this can be effective, and has become easier because of the developed digital communications technology:

“The development of the digital world and especially the internet make it possible for different actors to participate in media discussions. [...] all media producers, make representations; they represent worlds (possible, imaginary, desirable, actual). Media make truth claims, explicit or implicit: the gaps and repetitions in media representations, if systematic enough, can distort people’s sense of what there is to see in the social and political domains.”¹⁰

As the famous theory of the world society suggests, through different channels organizations can also participate in the political agenda-setting and affect environmental policy making.¹¹ Using the visual material offers an effective way of doing that.¹²

Similar kind of a discussion has been seen in the field of peace, conflict and security studies. For example Matt McDonald has stated that visual material and different contexts are not used enough even though they could introduce alternative perspectives when trying to understand security questions¹³. McDonald has also argued that the whole concept of security is defined too narrowly,

¹⁰ Couldry 2012, 57.

¹¹ Hironaka 2014, 2–3; 77–103.

¹² Meisner & Takahashi 2013, 255–256.

¹³ McDonald 2008, 568.

usually focusing on the moments of interventions showing immediate danger and threat, and not on larger processes, which are participating in discussion about the whole security framework.¹⁴

This thesis approaches peace and conflict from this kind of a broader perspective, recognizing larger and more subtle long-term processes, which exist in the global governance structures. In-equality and violence are thought to occur not only directly, but also via socially and economically unbalanced world governing structures¹⁵. Together, global popular sports and visual corporate-organizational communications offer a context, which is not yet covered in the academic studies of environmental politics, or in environmental peace and conflict studies, even though the close relations between sports and politics¹⁶, between the sports mega-events and the environment¹⁷, and between the visual and the environmental communications¹⁸, are recognized.

From the perspective of the social sciences of football, Sami Kolamo has studied how the FIFA-World Cup can be seen as a concentrated media spectacle where *the transnational corporation family* of FIFA, the main organizer of the World Cup, uses the massive publicity of the event. Kolamo states that FIFA is communicating via different media channels and building and polishing its own brand image¹⁹. Using the World Cup 2010 as an example, Kolamo argues how FIFA mostly tries to stay on the background as a “neutral, ideal political actor”²⁰. However, interestingly, sustainable social and environmental development, was one area where FIFA campaigned very actively and visibly.²¹ In the Brazil World Cup environment was strongly included in the developmental agenda of FIFA and thus, it is important to examine how this campaign actually frames different environmental aspects. As asked above, it is interesting to analyze whether this visual framing of the environment by FIFA is contributing to sustainable, equal, and peaceful environmental development, and how, and how much the corporate motives are possibly affecting the framing.

¹⁴ McDonald 2008, 564. Critique is pointed mainly towards the Copenhagen School approach to security.

¹⁵ The idea of structural violence. See for example Galtung 1969. More on this in chapter 1.2.

¹⁶ Look for example: Gilchrist & Holden 2011.

¹⁷ Jenkins 2012, Preuss 2013, Schmidt 2006.

¹⁸ For example: Death 2011, Hansen & Machin 2013, Meisner & Takahashi 2013, Rebich-Hespanha & co. 2014.

¹⁹ Kolamo 2014. The term *transnational corporation family* also proposed by Kolamo.

²⁰ Kolamo 2014, 86.

²¹ Kolamo 2014, 100–101.

The ongoing academic discussion about the complex relation between global-local-dimensions is also acknowledged in this research. As stated in the social studies of football, football can be viewed not only as a global or as a local, but also as a *glocal* phenomenon, which is able to connect the global and the local levels²². The environmental aspects have these same characters because local actions can have an effect on the global environmental circumstances and vice-versa. In other words, environment and football are global phenomena, which have their local features in the different parts of the world. As the local conditions shape the global and the global conditions shape the local, there is a close, unavoidable interdependence between the local and the global dimensions.²³ As a whole, my research is located in the theoretical framework of *glocalized* world, which recognizes that not only the environment and football are *glocal* phenomena, but also political discourses and the governance structures of the world need to be interpreted inside the *glocal* framework.

Sources and the Approach

The most important primary source of the research is the official website of FIFA, the *fifa.com*, and the special section for the World Cup 2014. From the variety of the different types of visual publications, like videos, animations and drawings, *photographs* are analyzed. The photographs were found from the news-stories and the official documents, which were related to Brazil World Cup and to the environment. The official documents of FIFA are also being used like editorials in the studies of journalism – the written material tells about what FIFA has officially *said* about its environmental perspective. In these official documents FIFA for example introduces the special themes that are included in their environmental campaign. This helps in answering the question of *why* FIFA has framed the environment visually in a way it has. Possibly these officially reported themes are also seen in the photographs.

The same kind of help is offered by other primary sources. There is no such a thing as the official list of global environmental agenda, but I will use UN Millenium Development Goals (MDGs) as a frame for introducing the most central global environmental concerns during the selected time period, 2007–2014. Because the goals were already set in the beginning of the millennium, I will also

²² Giulianotti & Robertson 2004.

²³ Robertson 1995, Glocalization. "Time-Space and Homogeneity-Heterogeneity", 25–44.

address the annual reports by United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), which can adduce alternative topics compared to the MDGs set earlier. The UN-frame is also interesting because of the existing cooperative link²⁴ between FIFA and the UN. In addition, to characterize the global environmental context, I needed to understand the local context of Brazil. This was extremely important in highlighting the *glocal* framework. It was necessary to understand in what kind of environmental circumstances FIFA operated in Brazil. In this, statistics, previous studies and press publications were utilized.

Methodologically this thesis leans strongly on the traditions of historical research because of the central role of source criticism and understanding the location and the time context. Thus, it is essential to introduce the backgrounds of FIFA and the football World Cup-institution. In the historical sense, the research is contemporary history of visual digital media, global environmental governance and popular sports. Time scale is between the years 2007 and 2014. The beginning year was chosen because in the October 30th, 2007, Brazil was selected to host the World Cup. The time scale will end at the end of the year 2014. This time scale allows me to analyze the publications of FIFA not only during the World Cup, but also before and shortly after the cup.

Since peace and conflict studies and history do not fall under the one strict method, in this study I will not speak about 'the method'. I prefer using the term 'approach'. In my approach, I will use the help of content analysis for categorizing my findings. This means that I will analyze visual contents by placing them in different thematic categories and conclude *what* there has been found and *how* these visual representations are constructed.

In addition, the deeper analysis of the visual material also required specific tools, and I will be using the approach, which is a combination of visual framing studies and social semiotics. The visual material that I am speaking of is a collection of professionally designed, carefully structured and consciously constructed photographs. This means that I am not only interested in the special details of pictures, but also in social structures, contexts and power relations, which environment-related photographs of FIFA represent. Thus, and because of the historical perspective, the questions of *why*, *where* and *when* the meanings have been constructed are relevant. Like stated in previous

²⁴ Sadecky 2006.

studies of the visual, if one is willing to analyze the effectiveness of the visual material on delivering values in society, the analysis cannot be restricted only on the aesthetics of the picture.²⁵

After this introductory warm-up, it is time to blow the whistle and give the first kick. In the first chapter I will elaborate my idea of the perspective, from which I will be approaching my research questions. In other words, it means the theoretical framework and the methodological tools. In the second chapter, I will shortly introduce the glocal environmental context. The analysis of the material of FIFA will begin in the same chapter; the written perspective of FIFA, and the process of selecting the examples will be addressed. In the chapters three, four and five, I will introduce examples from the environmental photographs of FIFA and connect these findings to my theoretical framework, as well as to time and locational context. The chapter six discusses with examples the environmental themes that were not seen in the illustrations of FIFA. The chapter seven is a concluding one.

1. The Approach

1.1 Contemporary History and Visual Material

First, I wanted to comment the use of visual material in the context of contemporary historical research. Visual material has traditionally been less used and even ignored as a source of historical studies. This has evoked a question about the invisibility of the visual in historical research.²⁶ However, this does not have to be the case, because if used with skill, as any other source, visual material can offer an important and informative alternative source for historians²⁷. It is just important to remember that visual material needs to be treated carefully, not only as an illustration (without analysis) of the research, or maybe even worse, as a simple piece of evidence. As I said above in the introduction, in the social studies of visual not only the aesthetics of the pictures need to be analyzed. This applies to historical research, too. The same questions that are asked when working analytically with texts; *who, what, where, when, why, with what consequences*, need to be asked when analyzing visual material.²⁸ As also said above, in understanding the visual, the context with particular social structures needs to be understood. Thus, the historical approach actually

²⁵ Stochetti, Kukkonen 2011, 3.

²⁶ Burke 2010, 9–10.

²⁷ Burke 2010, 184.

²⁸ Jordanova 2012, 30–31.

comes quite close to social studies of visual. Only the role of the context and the background of a source are even more emphasized. Because of this, I find it very rational and well-grounded to use visual-historical approach in my research.

To continue, I felt important to define what is meant when speaking about contemporary history, and look how this thesis will take its place in this tradition. In her enlightening article, Saime Durmaz has introduced the key points about the research of contemporary era. Durmaz begins by mentioning that the whole definition of the period of contemporary history is controversial. However, some patterns typical of contemporary can be recognized. First, contemporary history is *world history* and the *worldwide perspective* is needed when scrutinizing contemporary issues.²⁹ This is clearly seen in my research because the framework of glocalization adopts the perspective of worldwide explaining.

The second important remark about the contemporary world related to my research is that “there have been great changes during the twentieth century in terms of the political and economic systems and technology”³⁰. In this study, especially the changes and the development of communication technology, and the effects of these changes to the more and more complex social structures, are recognized.

As we can see, we are able to define trends typical of contemporary historical era. But why the historical approach is needed in the academic research of contemporary issues? Why I find it relevant to examine current phenomena by using historical approach? I completely agree with the perspective of Durmaz:

“[...] as in the case of other professions, the historian has an obligation as a member of society. He should help people to understand not only what happened in the distant past, but also what has occurred during their own lifetimes. Moreover, there is a public demand for a better understanding of the recent past in order to understand what is happening in the world. In particular, in the twentieth century international relations have become far more complex than that they used to be.”³¹

As I mentioned in the introduction, different approaches and different kind of methods should be used, when trying to make the mechanisms of the current, complex environmental policies, and

²⁹ Durmaz 2012, 111.

³⁰ Durmaz 2012, 117.

³¹ Ibid.

other multi-dimensional social structures understandable. Historical approach, with the combination of a fresh theoretical perspective and use of not so mainstream primary sources, offers a relevant way to participate in this world-explanation process.

In the past there have also been arguments against the possibility of writing contemporary history. These have included the arguments concerning the 'historical perspective': the absence of the necessary distance in time, which is essential for neutral approach, and argument of the impossibility to know about the final consequences that contemporary issues will create – in other words, *the difficulty of presenting the overall picture*. Other critique has addressed the source-based problem. It has been argued there are not enough accessible sources.³² These aspects need to be recognized especially when I am observing events and phenomena, which have occurred during the last decade.

To start, it is worth of remembering that the challenges that a researcher of contemporary history faces are not so unique compared to the other subfields of history research or the scientific research in general:

[...] it is no more certain that the contemporary historian will fail than it is that the "ancient", "medieval" or "modern" historian will be successful. Success or failure depends on the historical methods applied on the approach, not the period chosen. So, to what extent is it possible to write a contemporary history? It would appear that we should examine the possibility of writing contemporary history in terms of the availability of sources, objectivity and perspective: the main concerns of a scientific approach."³³

First, it needs to be mentioned that the availability of the material has not restricted my research project. The reports and the news published by FIFA are free and easy to access. One does only need an IT-device and online connection to reach the material. This is not a problem in a Finnish university. Same applies to the materials of UN and UNEP, and to the statistics and reports about Brazil.

Secondly, the remark about the neutral approach is interesting. The personal involvement in different contemporary events can create also advantages: a historian is able to remember the

³² Durmaz 2012, 110.

³³ Durmaz 2012, 113.

atmosphere of the period and the influences of events.³⁴ In turn, contemporary issues, in which a historian has directly involved in, might evoke strong, personal feelings and this may cause problems for impartiality. However, in the discipline of history, any other controversial event or time period carries the same challenges and historian always needs to try to overcome his/her own prejudices.³⁵ In addition, the pure and 'clean' objectivity is quite hard, or even impossible, to apply in any kind of scientific research. By selecting the data, methods and theories, there are already subjective decisions made by a researcher. The style of approach is actively chosen. The most important thing from my perspective is to explain to readers why this particular approach was used.

Thirdly, what comes to the question about historical perspective within this study, I understand that the topic under my scope is still without the final causality relations. Two years after the end of the time scale we do not know the final consequences of the World Cup. We do not know yet how environmental politics and environmental discussions are going to evolve globally or in Brazil. We do not know how the environment and human will exist after several decades. In this sense, it is we need to be careful when speaking of the certain era, because we do not know the trends and themes, which are going to last and which ones are going to diminish. Some of the features of the contemporary era are still unclear. In turn, this can also be seen as an advantage because we are not yet stuck in certain historical explanation models, but we are able to see different possibilities of continuums and different kinds of endings of these continuum-possibilities.

To continue, defining a historical era is always an artificial solution. Historians have also decided what is kept 'modern' or 'ancient'. Moreover, there are things that we *already know*. We know for example that in 2015 a large corruption scandal in global football was revealed. FIFA and many of its officers in chief were part of the scandal. Despite that, FIFA is continuing its environmental programme in the upcoming tournaments. We know that environment is maybe even more strongly tied to world politics than in 2007–2014. We also know that UN set new goals of sustainable development in 2015 to continue the Millennium Development Goals heritage. These new goals are shaped differently than the ones set in 2000. In sum, there have been changes and stability and it is already possible to identify these phenomena. Finally, understanding the challenges in maintaining the historical perspective, I will do my best and be extremely careful not to mirror the findings from

³⁴ Durmaz 2012, 116.

³⁵ Durmaz 2012, 113.

the primary data against the time context of the present moment, but against the context of 2007–2014. Next, I will approach my subject from the theoretical viewpoints, which try to help to understand this complex contemporary world.

1.2 Environmental Politics and Peace and Conflict Research

First of all, in the environmental sense, this study leans on the concept of ‘anthropocene’. This term is the proposed name for the geological era that we are currently living.³⁶ Simply explained, it means that there are so many of us people living so actively in the present world that “we are influencing the atmospheric, geologic, hydrologic, biospheric and other earth system processes.”³⁷ This is the fundamental thought behind the environmental view of this study – we people affect the environment of the Earth, and we need to understand different perspectives on this process better.

Before we can analyze the visual contents of FIFA by including the perspectives of environmental peace and conflict studies, we first need to understand the relation between environment, peace and conflict. Why in a first place environment and environmental governance are important aspects to spot in this relation?

In the area of peace and conflict studies, there spread the ‘greening’ of the discipline³⁸ already in the 1990’s. It meant that environmental aspects were starting to receive more attention in the academic world in relation with politics, conflict and security. What was the most popular form of addressing the relation between these phenomena, was to try and find the causality of how environmental aspects lead to violent conflicts. It was found that natural resources and environmental degradation can play central roles in conflicts, but the empirical causality that environmental problems solely lead to violent conflicts was never found. In turn, it was stated that environmental changes and environmental degradation like pollution, overuse of scarce renewable resources or destruction of the living-space may lead to different *social phenomena*, which may then cause violent conflicts³⁹.

³⁶ Look for example, Dalby 2013, 561.

³⁷ Ellis 2013.

³⁸ For example: Libiszewski 1992.

³⁹ Look: Homer-Dixon 1991, 86 & Libiszewski 1992, 12 –13.

Still, at the present moment when environmental aspects have gained even more political weight, there is the same ongoing academic discussion about the capability of environment to launch conflicts⁴⁰. For example the research conducted by the United Nations has joined the scientific discussion by reporting that:

“Environmental factors are rarely, if ever, the sole cause of violent conflict. Ethnicity, adverse economic conditions, low levels of international trade and conflict in neighboring countries are all significant drivers of violence.”⁴¹

The same report acknowledges that especially natural resources can contribute to outbreak of a conflict, finance and sustain a conflict and undermine peacemaking projects⁴². In turn, the report continues, conflicts can affect the environment (pollution, toxic chemicals etc.) and especially the governance of environmental aspects. Conflicts may lead to the total collapsing of environmental governance, which may then cause severe environmental problems,⁴³ like pollution.

There have also lately been stronger arguments, which support the idea that environmental aspects can solely lead to actual conflicts. Especially evidence about the global climate change has altered the tones of the debate. The most current case is from Syria, where it seems that global climate change, accelerated by human actions, and the drought it has caused, were key factors that launched the conflict in the country⁴⁴.

However important the debate described above is, in this research I will not stick in the fundamental discussion whether the environment can be a sole cause of a conflict or not. For this research, it is important enough that environment *has* this central role and this role is constantly being discussed in academic and political discourses. Interestingly, there are also other branches of studies that have passed this still important, I do not want to deny that, discussion by moving the debate on other levels.

Introducing the branch that argues for the peaceful opportunities of the environment is essential. It has been stated that more attention should be given for the possibility of environment to serve

⁴⁰ Haldén 2011, 406.

⁴¹ UN, From Conflict to Peacebuilding 2009, 5.

⁴² Ibid. 8.

⁴³ Ibid. 15.

⁴⁴ Kelley & co. 2015.

as a strategic tool for peacebuilding and conflict resolution.⁴⁵ This perspective, on the other hand, recognizes the role of environment in conflicts, but on the other, sees also more peaceful options:

“In the short run, failure to respond to environmental challenges can deepen human suffering and increase vulnerability to natural disasters. In the long run, it may threaten the effective functioning of the governmental, economic, and societal institutions necessary for sustained peace. Along with challenges may come opportunities.[...] shared environmental challenges may create peacebuilding opportunities: providing an agenda of shared interests, promoting confidence building, deepening intergroup ties, and fostering the complex task of (re)constructing shared identities. Peace in this context can be thought of as a continuum ranging from the absence of violent conflict to, in its most robust form, the un-imagineability of violent conflict.”⁴⁶

Acknowledging this point of view is very important in a sense that when speaking about peaceful implications of the environment we are coming close to actions of *peacebuilding* and *peace formation*. In these actions the importance of understanding the local, also environmental, context becomes crucial. Only by understanding the local in a globalized world, it becomes possible to achieve sustainable solutions for peaceful development⁴⁷. With ‘peaceful’ I mean in the context of my research not only the absence of direct violence, but also the absence of in-direct, structural violence; the local level should be integrated to the decision making and concrete actions, or at least the grass root-level initiatives should not be blocked by economically and politically more powerful states, organizations or corporations.

The ideas above echo the perspectives of the *glocal* framework and multi-dimensional role of environment and thus, serve the purposes of this thesis perfectly: I am not understanding environment solely as a source or catalyst for conflicts, but also as a channel for sustainable and peaceful development. Both of these dimensions are recognized when the material of FIFA is looked, as well as the position of FIFA in the global-local nexus. These remarks lead us forwards in the theoretical framework. It is worth of spotlighting how environment has actually climbed up to world politics. Certainly it has not just been dropped from the middle of nowhere.

⁴⁵ Conca & Dabelko 2002, 5.

⁴⁶ Conca & Wallace 2012, 64.

⁴⁷ Richmond 2013, 396. Oliver P. Richmond has written intelligently about peace formation: “They should be much more focused on improving the everyday life and potential for individuals and communities in post-conflict states, rather than on the states themselves. The peaceful and legitimate state arises out of everyday consensus, which shapes the state in turn supports local refinements and international stability. **The support of such processes in order to stabilize the polity would also engender contact, reform and modification of both local and international processes, so as not to compromise each other’s standards.**” Bolding made by me.

Already in 1972 in Stockholm, there was the United Nations Conference on the Human Environment, but the environment has mattered more since the end of the Cold War⁴⁸, when the global security atmosphere reached a turning point because of the collapse of the bi-polarized world politics and the instant nuclear threat. Environmental concerns were one theme that started to climb to the new security-political agenda. However, the exact mechanism how the environment has taken the current central political role is still debated. *Environmentalism* highlights the perspective of political recognizing of environmental disasters, but this has also been criticized. It is not self-evident that environmental destruction receives political attention. Based on the world society theory, it has been argued that environmental issues have first taken a central, widely accepted role in the world culture, which has then shaped also the agenda of political attention.⁴⁹ I think these perceptions can exist together, overlapping. Global environmental agenda has been shaped by the actions and acceptance of the world society, but the global (security) political atmosphere was going through a massive change being `open` for different kinds of emphases.

Along with the world culture shaped political interest, the spreading of environmental interest has been seen in other areas too. The dimension of the society, which is under the scope of this thesis because of the corporate-nature of FIFA, corporate-world, has also lately started to see environmental dimensions as important parts to include in their agendas. In addition, business world has started to recognize more positive chances than restrictions in the global phenomenon that could be called the `environmental turn`.⁵⁰

Repeated questions in these different contexts have been how environment and different dimensions of environment are being framed, and this resonates perfectly with the perspective of this thesis, intertwining with the research questions introduced earlier: What kind of environment and what stakeholders are included in the visual frames of the environmental perspective of FIFA? How these have been represented? How was the governance of the environmental aspects framed? Was it a global, local or *glocal* environmental level that was in the center of visualizations? Is FIFA framing the environment more as a way for peaceful cooperation or as a source of risks?

⁴⁸ Dalby 2013, 561.

⁴⁹ Hironaka 2014, 2–3.

⁵⁰ Hironaka 2014, 83.

To make the theoretical limitations and frames of my thesis clear, this research participates in environmental peace and conflict research from the kind of perspective that maps alternative contexts, where the *discussions* and *framings* of politicized and securitized environment can be seen. The very nature of environmental policy discussion is thought from the perspective that does not highlight only immediate threats and dangers, but more larger and subtle and long-term processes, which are participating in the construction of the environmental framework, and which can then affect concrete environmental attitudes and actions of different stakeholders.

To continue, I will not be addressing the role of environment in an ongoing war, or try to find environmental ways to resolve an armed conflict, even though there are social inequalities and direct social conflicts in Brazil, which are related to environmental themes⁵¹. This research is about framing politically charged environmental discourses and environmental aspects in media. More importantly, this research problematizes the societal structures that make these framings possible: global corporate-organizations have economic, political, and communicational power. As these corporations are business-oriented and many times represent short-term neo-liberal values, which are not the most sustainable ones, neither environmentally nor socially, corporations can be seen maintainers of the current world order and social and economic inequality.

This maintenance of social injustice and inequality can be thought also as the maintenance of *structural violence*. In this case “the violence is built into the structure and shows up as unequal power and consequently as un-equal life chances.”⁵² As told above, environmental themes are one dimension in creating and maintaining sustainable peace. Thus, the environmental governance structures and various environmental discourse platforms become important to recognize and understand more deeply and more broadly, especially when mapping the possibilities for *positive peace*, which means the absence of social and economic injustice (=indirect violence) and the absence of in-equal power structures (=indirect violence)⁵³.

To conclude, the most important remark is that *environment matters in political discussions*, which are linked with the sustainability and positive peace. The environment has already been brought to

⁵¹ Especially violent conflicts in *favelas* that lack for example sanitation and clean water.

⁵² Galtung 1969, 171.

⁵³ Galtung 1969, 183.

politics, and now politics need to be concretely brought into the environment⁵⁴ to prevent environmental degradation and social conflicts it might fuel. In this process, the understanding of the roles of different actors, channels and contexts is needed.

Media offers a channel where this politicized environmental discussion takes place, and where different actors can join the discussion. Journalism has been studied before, but better understanding about the alternative media-powers is also required. This is why it is interesting and important to see how FIFA took part to the discussion about politicized environment during the World Cup 2014–project on its own media channel. Because visual media contents are in the center of this research, and visual media, environmental politics and power are closely linked, I will next elaborate ideas about these relations.

1.3 Politicized Environment and the Power of Corporate Visual Media Communications

Media is a one arena of the *public sphere* where the different power relations are debated. In this research, the media discussant in focus is a global, powerful corporate-organization, FIFA. The topic of discussion, the environment, has some specific features, but also qualities that are linked with more general media and communication studies.

First of all, in this thesis, communication is defined as *symbolic action*⁵⁵, which means that communication has the power to have an effect, to create meanings and shape our understanding: to do something more than just transmit the message.⁵⁶ This applies to environmental communication too. Like Robert Cox, a researcher of environmental communications, has written: “[...] our beliefs, attitudes, and behaviors relating to nature and environmental problems are mediated by communication; and the public sphere emerges as a discursive space for communication about the environment.”⁵⁷

Secondly, *visual communication* is defined as communication through *representations*, mainly because the concept of representation helps in understanding how the analysis of visual material

⁵⁴ Swyngedouw 2013, 2.

⁵⁵ The concept first introduced by Kenneth Burke 1966.

⁵⁶ Robert Cox has wonderfully clarified the concept of *symbolic action*. See: Cox 2006, 12.

⁵⁷ Cox 2006, 14.

can be done. Representation is a way of showing an event in a new form. It fills a gap that is left when the event or thing is not present anymore. As a representation replaces the instant interaction, a viewer has to estimate what is going on through a representation, which makes it possible to use power by constructing and structuring representations in a certain manner.⁵⁸

The next important concept in relation with communication and power in this thesis is the concept of *framing*, which, simply put, means in communication studies that something is chosen to be shown, highlighted, and given certain meanings. Robert Entman has used the concepts of “selection” and “salience”.⁵⁹ Framing has been connected to social constructivism theories, which see framing as a way to shape social reality.⁶⁰ This shaping of social reality can be done by different stakeholders via *frame building*. Organizations as interest groups can also participate in this process by framing phenomena from their perspectives and having then influence in the public debate via journalists and the mass media.⁶¹ However, developed communication technology has enabled organizations to communicate directly through their own channels, such as their websites and social media profiles. New and still controversial themes, which environmental aspects still are, are more exposed to different kinds of framing intentions⁶². Our world views are based our frame-perceptions, and our world views are shaping the way we act. As it has been stated: “[...] one cannot avoid framing. The only question is, whose frames are being activated – and hence strengthened – in the brains of the public.”⁶³ Thus, from the perspective of communication studies, it is extremely interesting to analyze environmental political framing intentions of FIFA.

The special dimension of *visual framing* has also been studied. For example Paul Messaris and Linus Abraham have analyzed the characteristics of visual images in their article, published in 2001.⁶⁴ Their main argument is that the visual material can be even more effective when targeting to frame something in certain way, and not only because images can catch the eye and deliver information faster. They state that visual material can convey and hide messages more effectively than text. This

⁵⁸ Seppänen 2005, 82–83.

⁵⁹ Entman 1993.

⁶⁰ Scheufele 1999, 105.

⁶¹ Scheufele 1999, 115–116.

⁶² Scheufele 1999, 116. The remark about environmental aspects is my own argument.

⁶³ Lakoff 2010, 72.

⁶⁴ Messaris & Abraham 2001.

creates a possibility of a very convincing framing without a resistance that the text could receive.⁶⁵ Similar arguments have been introduced by other researchers too; it has been stated that the main psychological mechanism behind this power of images is that pictures can evoke strong feelings and strike emotionally, which helps in persuading people to *remember* and *believe* a certain message.⁶⁶ Messaris and Abraham agree with this and add that visual material can be especially useful when subtle messages and ideologies need to be delivered.⁶⁷ Environment is an excellent example of this kind of subtle context because environment is around every one of us – everyone can have an opinion about the environment.

Messaris and Abraham extend the analysis of the characteristics of visual by introducing three special features, which make visual representations, especially photographs, strong when framing something. These features are analogical quality of images, indexicality of images and images' lack of an explicit propositional syntax⁶⁸. Analogical quality and indexicality address the question of the pictures being usually taken as more natural signs of reality than words. Photos are thought to describe reality more closely than text, and this helps in delivering the framing intention. This debate about the reality of photographs is actually a very fundamental theme in the research of visual, and especially in the research of photographs. In this thesis, I see photographs as *reflective* and *constructive* representations, which are capable of giving information about the surrounding world. First, photographs can be reflections of the reality, and at the same time they can construct the reality when they are viewed. On the other hand, perhaps they do not reflect the actual reality or facts, but the reality that someone wants to represent in a certain way⁶⁹. Pictures may lie, but this lying is also truly happening – it is reality, and it constructs the reality!⁷⁰

Returning to Messaris and Abraham, lack of an explicit propositional syntax means that visual material does not have certain, universal methods and manners for making certain propositions, or they are more unsystematic. At least many times the audience does not look at visual material

⁶⁵ Ibid. 225.

⁶⁶ Joffe 2008, 84–85.

⁶⁷ Messaris & Abraham 2001, 220.

⁶⁸ Ibid. 216–219.

⁶⁹ The audience number of the inauguration day of Donald Trump is a very fresh and interesting example of using photographs in a debate about the reality. Look for example: <https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/2017/jan/22/trump-inauguration-crowd-sean-spicers-claims-versus-the-evidence>.

⁷⁰ As an American sociologist and photographer Lewis Hine has said: "While photographs may not lie, the liars may photograph". Lewis Hine, 26.9.1874–3.11.1940

critically, with the attempt to understand these methods and manners⁷¹, which makes it possible to camouflage framing intentions more easily.

This camouflaging can be done by trying to deceive the audience through *staging a picture, modifying it, editing separate pictures to look like a chain of events, selecting certain type of pictures and framing the pictures falsely*.⁷² In this thesis, these characters and possible ways of camouflaged defection are recognized, and *visual literacy* is practiced to understand the codes of pictures, and to make justified arguments about the visual environmental framing of FIFA. This means understanding the cultural meanings of *visual structures*, which in different times have their special meanings and contents in the construction and looking of pictures. The classic example of a simple visual structure is the angle from which the photo of a person has been taken. The perspective which shows person from a low perspective, looking person up, is usually understood as illustration of the powerful position of that person. This example illustrates well the combination of visual structures, and then understanding these structures via visual literacy.⁷³

I will also remember the theory about the functions of the framing, manipulated or not, introduced by Robert Entman. These framing functions include: 1. Defining issues 2. Diagnosing causes and effects 3. Making moral evaluations and 4. Offering solutions / remedies.⁷⁴ In this process of decoding the messages of visual material, I found the ideas of researchers of visual framing, Lulu Rodriguez and Daniela Dimitrova,⁷⁵ useful. In their article they introduce a four-level style of approach. The multi-layered framework is not interested only in concrete technical elements of pictures or how much certain frames have been visually represented, but also in more subtle and complex themes, like visual metaphors and symbolism. In its level four, the framework recognizes the possibility of understanding why visuals represent what they represent, which comes close to my approach. This brings in the perspective of power and political use of visual. By their own words: "Such a framework takes into account the tangible elements in images as well as the latent meanings and cultural experiences audiences bring to the analysis."⁷⁶

⁷¹ This could also be called 'visual literacy'.

⁷² Messaris 1996, 142.

⁷³ The relation of visual literacy and visual structures, look Seppänen 2002, 35, 148 & 224.

⁷⁴ Entman 1993.

⁷⁵ Rodriguez, Dimitrova 2011.

⁷⁶ Rodriguez, Dimitrova 2011, 61.

When talking about all this visual framing, it is important to include in the questions about the role of text in the framing process of the picture. The fundamental debate has been going on for a long time – do we even need to evaluate text when looking pictures, what is the role of text there? It has been argued that texts can add something to the looking process, and in contrast, it has been argued that text can limit the looking of a picture.⁷⁷ In both cases, text actively *does something*, so it has role. I think both things mentioned above can happen, and from my perspective both ways of interpreting visual representations, with or without commenting texts, are also needed in the academic research. I think there is no right or wrong, as long as the perspective and the selection of the perspective is explained for the reader.

In my research, I will not make a deep analysis of the captions or other texts, like titles, which are shown with pictures. However, I have selected a pathway that recognizes these texts as guiding signals of the looking and framing processes. In many pictures of FIFA, texts are big and difficult to ignore – to *not see*. Thus, these texts actually become parts of the visual representations and they, too, have visual value; it becomes difficult to make difference between image and text.⁷⁸ Because of the central positions of texts, FIFA has clearly wanted to guide the looking (either limiting or adding something), which makes it rational to comment texts in these cases. Other, a rather pragmatics reason for commenting the texts is that I had to restrict the material by searching pictures based on text. I was selecting the pictures that were framed with text to link with environmental aspects. Because of this, texts are shortly commented, even though the analysis of the visual is clearly my main focus. Maybe someday in the future it will also be possible to search pictures by using other pictures?

In contrast to the addressed visibility in the public sphere, we also have to remember the use of the strategic power of *not-showing*, which means using the media power by not bringing particular topics to the public sphere: “In a multimodal, multichannel and multiplatform environment, the ability to *not* be seen at strategically significant moments should be recognized as a sign and source of power.”⁷⁹ Thus, the questions about *what is not shown* and *why*, become important. We need to

⁷⁷ Möller 2013, 32–33.

⁷⁸ They become “conjunctions” of text and image, or “mixed media”, Mitchell 1994, 83–107.

⁷⁹ Lester & Hutchins 2012, 860.

question why FIFA did not participate in some discussions on global environmental agenda or the local context of Brazil. How did it use the power of not-showing?

In the previous paragraph and also earlier in the text, the concept of *power* has frequently been used. I feel that for the purposes of this thesis I have to define the concept and consider more deeply the statement that communication has the *power* to do something. We can question what *power* actually is. My perception of power can be traced back to the theories of Michel Foucault: "Power is not an institution, and not a structure; neither is it a certain strength we are endowed with; it is the name that one attributes to a complex strategical situation in a particular society."⁸⁰ Foucault has also argued that:

"Relations of power are not in a position of exteriority with respect to other types of relationships (economic processes, knowledge relationships, sexual relations), but are immanent in the latter; they are the immediate eddects of the divisions, inequalities, and disequilibriums which occur in the latter, and conversely they are the internal conditions of these differentiations; relations of power are not in superstructural positions, with merely a role of prohibition or accompaniment; they have a directly productive role, wherever they come into play."⁸¹

Foucault also sees that power is "exercised from innumerable points"⁸². The complex and multi-linked Foucauldian perception of power has also been supported in studies discussing the relationship between power and the media. The power of the media has not been thought to be an element owned only by media institutions, but is rather seen as an extensive societal process that functions on many different levels.⁸³

These perceptions can be applied to the political significance of the organizational media communication with regard to environmental aspects. The environmental political media power exercised by FIFA is linked to the complex strategical situation of the society. FIFA is not in a position of exteriority with other types of relationships (such as sponsors, partners, continental football associations, national politics etc.). However, there is no question that FIFA has a productive role. Through its visual publications, FIFA affects the perceptions by constructing the reality. The power is used from many points. It is a complex situation, where the definition of the user of the final

⁸⁰ Foucault 1990, 93.

⁸¹ Foucault 1990, 94.

⁸² Ibid.

⁸³ Couldry 2000, 39.

power is impossible. As it was stated in the previous chapter, the world culture shapes the world politics, and at the same time politics shape the culture.

With regards to Foucault's remark of power as a complicated strategic situation that is linked to many discourses and spaces, it is necessary to think who the players are in these discourses and spaces? Who are those whose 'voices' out there? Where is FIFA taking the place in these spaces? From the environmental perspective, the studies of international environmental policies recognized in 2009 seven different groups of international environmental actors and stakeholders: 1) *Nation State Actors* 2) *Intergovernmental Organizations* (e.g. UNEP) 3) *Multilateral Financial Institutions* (a specific type of Intergovernmental organizations, e.g. World Bank) 4) *Regional and Other Multilateral Organizations* (e.g. the EU) 5) *Nongovernmental Organizations* (e.g. the WWF) 6) *Corporations* and 7) *Treaty Secretariats* (e.g. the Biodiversity Secretariat).⁸⁴

What is a somewhat different, is that in this research the environmental stakeholder is not *straightforwardly* a state-level actor, an intergovernmental organization, nongovernmental organization, corporation or a journalistic source. It is a global, private sector-linked organization, previously called "*transnational corporation family*"⁸⁵. The transnational corporation family of FIFA reaches the co-operational linkages to business life, and at the same time to organizations like UNEP. FIFA and its sponsors and partners have their own aims, own political agenda and own political and economic goals, which have led to strict controlling of the FIFA brand image⁸⁶. Because of these qualities, FIFA is closest to being a corporate-stakeholder. There are specific characters which need to be acknowledged because of this. From what point of view and why would a corporate-organization possibly want to participate in environmental discussions?

According to the studies of environmental communications, the environmentalism and the importance of environmental communication in corporations and organizations were recognized at the same time as the environment received more general security political attention.⁸⁷ Since then, the importance of the environmental dimension has increased. Which is important to know is that the environmental communication of corporations did not spring from legally binding international

⁸⁴ Chasek & Downie 2009, 53–113.

⁸⁵ Great term proposed by Kolamo 2014, 27.

⁸⁶ Kolamo 2014, 71.

⁸⁷ Cox 2006, 4–6, 51. Brophy & Starkey 1998, 175.

rules and does not have legally binding international rules even today. The interest in environmental reporting has instead grown inside the private sector itself, which speaks for the already mentioned combination of political interest and the world society model. The increased environmental attention and awareness in the general community encouraged the business sector to think of the environmental dimensions of their actions.⁸⁸ However, the concern has been that “the still voluntary and unregulated nature of environmental disclosure”⁸⁹ is not used for accurate and realistic environmental information, but rather for public relations purposes.⁹⁰ In other words, this means that the environment serves the purposes of corporations and not the other way around.

To try to avoid this from occurring, global initiatives for forming global frameworks for corporate environmental reporting have been created. Maybe the most famous one is the GRI, Global Reporting Initiative, which works in cooperation with UNEP and United Nations Global Compact (UNGC)⁹¹. UNEP has also set its own framework of standards of company environmental reporting. For example paragraph 47, drafted at the Rio+20 conference in 2012, encouraged governments to help in promoting transparent corporate sustainability reporting.⁹² However, these are not legally binding guidelines. Moreover, there are not even non-legal specific guidelines for *visual* reporting.

From the perspective of organizational environmental communication studies, corporate environmental communication has been categorized into two main parts. First, corporations want “to link corporate goals and behavior to the increasingly popular values of environmental quality”⁹³, and second, they want “to influence – or avoid – additional environmental regulations.”⁹⁴ The former, so called green marketing, is then divided into three sub-categories: Production promotion, image enhancement and image repair. The latter, environmental corporate advocacies, means lobbying by corporation to influence legislation, agency rule making and public opinion.

⁸⁸ Wilmshurst & Frost 2000, 12.

⁸⁹ Arena, Bozzolan & Michelon 2014, 347.

⁹⁰ Ibid.

⁹¹ (<http://www.unep.org/resourceefficiency/Business/SustainableandResponsibleBusiness/PartnershipBuilding/GlobalReportingInitiativeGRI/tabid/78936/Default.aspx#g3>) Visited 26.2.2016.

⁹² Rio+20: Paragraph 47.

⁹³ Cox 2006, 373.

⁹⁴ Ibid.

There is also a third purpose of environmental communication, which is done in order to discredit and intimidate the environmental critics of the corporation.⁹⁵ This all naturally happens through many communication channels, media being just one of those. In this research, I am not evaluating how exactly FIFA has followed or not followed these theories of organizational communications or guidelines of environmental reporting. Nevertheless, for my purposes it is very important to know that these guidelines exist and FIFA has such structure-based motives and pressures coming when framing environmental issues.

Corporations clearly are stakeholders in the communication process of *symbolic action*, which has the power to create meanings and shape the perceptions of people. Corporations can participate in the discussion about the politicized environment framing the environmental themes in a way they choose. These framings can be politically and economically charged, and the grown environmental attention by media and public interest encourage the continuation of this mega-trend. By using the tools of developed digital communication networks, such as websites, it is possible also for organizations to reach global audiences faster and more efficiently. In contrast, it should be mentioned that the role of the digital media nor the internet should be over-estimated as a revolutionary turning point in the media-politics relationship. There are many things that are still uncertain.

It is for example a common myth that the internet is a universal, freely accessible, democratic and neutral forum – in fact, a major part of the information-processing capability of the internet is capitalized by private sector actors. In addition, technology and internet access are not free and universally accessible. There are still masses of people living ‘disconnected’. Moreover, digital media and the internet are actually not the same everywhere; there is no such a thing as one single world of digital media. For example linguistic spheres are also seen in the world of the internet.⁹⁶ As a study addressing the relations between politics and the development of digital communication networks reminds us, technical infrastructure or devices *alone* are not enough to change the structures of politics and publicity.⁹⁷

⁹⁵ Cox 2006, 396.

⁹⁶ Couldry 2012, 39–40.

⁹⁷ Couldry 2012, 281. “[...] communication forms by themselves will not be enough to build and sustain entirely new forms of public politics.”

This leads us back to the idea that what actually makes the difference is how these new communication forms are used. New devices certainly make it possible to use new kinds of techniques to receive attention. For example, they make it easier to utilize the *capability* of environment-related events to become global *media events*, particular centers of global media attention,⁹⁸ which offer scenes for different framing actions of different interest groups. These framing actions are then circulated in different media channels and they can receive even more attention through the fast digital networks. As mega-level sports events are followed by hundreds of millions of people, they also possess these abilities. Thus, it is fascinating to see what kind of environmental image FIFA gave to the media event of the football World Cup. Next, it is time to tell about the powerful status of global football and the World Cup.

1.4 Why Football and FIFA World Cup™?

1.4.1 “Footballization”⁹⁹, Media and Power

It is essential to understand how sports, and more precisely football, can become a scene for politics and different power discourses. As I already wrote in the introduction, sport cannot be separated from the other dimensions of the society. Researcher of international relations, Cynthia Weber, has argued that all the areas of cultures can be seen as effective scenes for political struggles. Politics are culture and culture is politics.¹⁰⁰ Sport and football are cultural phenomena in their highest meaning, so they can be political, too.¹⁰¹ Politics are then closely related to power, and media is an arena for power struggles. Thus, regarding to this chapter, it is the most important task to map the connections between *Football and power*, *football and media communications* and *football and environment*. First two will be addressed under this subtitle. The relation between football and environment will have its own treatment.

Generally, sport is a dimension of societies, which has been an “international vehicle” for national values and policies since the First World War.¹⁰² It has also been studied that sports can serve as a

⁹⁸ Eide & Kunelius 2012, 17–19.

⁹⁹ The term was introduced by Giulianotti & Robertson 2009, 63.

¹⁰⁰ Weber 2001, 188.

¹⁰¹ About the sports and politics, look also Gilchrist & Holden 2011.

¹⁰² Arnaud & Riordan 1998, Introduction. The concept of ‘international vehicle’ is provided by them.

force that affects to the perception of people about a certain nation or political regime.¹⁰³ In other words, sport is capable of delivering *representations* of different *states, ideologies* and *values*. At the present world, when following big sports events like football World Cup, we can also see that sport has become an ‘international vehicle’ for international organizations and corporations. They are willing to pay lots of money to gain visibility and publicity for example in the context of football, wishing “[...] to benefit from its [football’s] auratic blend of excitement and everyday life”¹⁰⁴. These organizations and corporations, just like states, have their own *goals, ideologies* and *values*. In sum, popular sports has become a popular venue when trying to gain publicity – for national, for organizational or for corporate purposes. Thus, sports events, like the FIFA World Cup™¹⁰⁵, can be seen as *media events*¹⁰⁶, or as *media spectacles*, which can be centered and carefully planned by their organizers.

In different societies, different sports are the most popular ones. However, football is considered to be the most global venue of sports. That is simply because football is played and followed in most parts of the planet, and in many countries it is the most popular sport. The international football federation, FIFA, has even more participant countries than UN.¹⁰⁷ In the light of this information, it is not very surprising that it has been stated that “football has become one of the most relevant venues of spotting the trends of globalization”.¹⁰⁸

In turn, football and especially international competitions are stages for nationalistic pride and emotions. In a first place, strong nationalistic emotions are driving forces why international World Cup gains this huge popularity.¹⁰⁹ This is also why the global event of World Cup and the following of it have local characters in different parts of the world. In this sense, the World Cup is also situated inside the global phenomenon of *glocalization*. In the debate about the ultimate power of football, can football change the world trends or is it the world that changes trends of football, I am taking my ‘*foucaultian*’ place by understanding the power as more complicated phenomenon than just a

¹⁰³ Arnaud & Riordan 1998, 5.

¹⁰⁴ Miller 2016, 2.

¹⁰⁵ Kolamo 2014, 14.

¹⁰⁶ Tomlinson & Young 2003, 1.

¹⁰⁷ FIFA, 209 countries. UN, 193 countries.

¹⁰⁸ Giulianotti 2004, 545.

¹⁰⁹ Tomlinson & Young 2003, 1–2; Kolamo, 14.

black-white confrontation about who has power and who does not. Global football and FIFA definitely have their own *producing* and *constructive* roles in the power process.

To understand better how the football World Cup reached this powerful media event status we need to go back in the history for a short moment because the real opening shot for the global spread of football, for so called 'footballization', was seen after the Second World War. Increased prosperity and spare time of people in Western countries was one big reason for the growth of the role of popular entertainment. For the topic of this thesis, the most important phenomenon was the development of media technology, which enabled the spreading of football faster. Media time also lured in advertisers, and the contract between FIFA and Coca-Cola Company in 1974 was the first contract ever made between a corporation and an organization of popular, worldwide sports. Later, in 1990's, satellite TV played a major role in the spreading of football all over the world. The era of more close relation between football, media and business-world had begun.¹¹⁰ The recent development of digitalization has enabled even faster global spreading of football and this trident-linkage between *media*, *private companies* and *sports*, has been described as a "golden triangle"¹¹¹, which works together for their common good via gaining more wealth, power and visibility. FIFA is strongly playing its role in this triangle.

The primus motor of the 'footballization'-process has been the World Cup, which is played every fourth year. It is the biggest international football competition and at the same time it is a flag-ship of FIFA in promoting football, the 'product' of FIFA. In the past 21 years, FIFA has granted the hosting of the World Cup to USA (1994), to France (1998), to South-Korea and Japan (2002), to Germany (2006), to South-Africa (2010) and to Brazil (2014). Next two World Cups will be played in Russia (2018) and in Qatar (2022). This shows well the strategy of FIFA to spread football to every continent of the world, and to not so traditional football countries like South-Africa and especially Qatar. The strategy of FIFA is to make football even more popular globally¹¹², and the most famous event of the football by any measures is used in achieving this. At the same time, the World Cup serves as a way for promoting other values of the corporation network¹¹³ of FIFA.

¹¹⁰ Nevala 2010 226–228.

¹¹¹ Nixon, 2014, 23–24.

¹¹² Kolamo, 2014, 46.

¹¹³ Main partners of FIFA in World Cup of Brazil: Adidas, Coca-Cola, Hyundai & KIA-Motors, Emirates, Sony, Visa. Sponsors included for example McDonald's, Yingli, Castrol and Budweiser.

The World Cup and especially the World Cup–host selection processes have also introduced one of the negative sides of the ‘footballization’. There have been bribery scandals related to hosting selection, and possibly the biggest scandal has taken place during this research. The chair of FIFA, Sep Blatter, and many other high-position officials of different football associations around the world are accused of giving and taking bribes to strengthen their own power positions and gaining more personal wealth. The scandal has also included the Brazil World Cup¹¹⁴.

It is crucial to recognize this and also the other negative side effects of ‘footballization’: there are huge amounts of money moving in the world of football¹¹⁵. FIFA, as a leader of the transnational corporation family that globally governs and monitors football related actions, is actually a heavy-weight player in the world economics and politics¹¹⁶, which are as stated, closely related to environmental dimensions. What makes it more interesting is that FIFA is actually an organization that is free from nation state control or any other authority¹¹⁷. It is also known to locate its economic affairs in Switzerland, which makes it possible to be economically very un-transparent.¹¹⁸

Neo-liberal values and structural inequality (=structural violence) based on these values has said to be grown also in the world of football¹¹⁹. Because of its global governing position and strong links to corporate-world, FIFA can be seen as another global corporation that supports and maintains these neo-liberal values. Brand-thinking is another sign of this. FIFA strictly controls its media image and plans how it looks like,¹²⁰ and especially development-related actions are areas in which FIFA wants to be seen connected to¹²¹. Because of all this, the main promotion scene of global football and corporation family of FIFA, the media spectacle of the World Cup, should be under a specific, critical focus, also environmentally – big power comes with a big responsibility.

The modern digital social media has also allowed these organizers of the Cup to take care of the media-image of the event. They do not need to count only on journalism to gain publicity. Has FIFA

¹¹⁴ Gibson 2015.

¹¹⁵ For example in 2001, the turnover of global football was estimated to be at around £250 billion. Giulianotti & Robertson 2004, 545.

¹¹⁶ Kolamo 2014, 27.

¹¹⁷ “Completely out of reach”, as Sugden & Tomlinson have said: Sugden & Tomlinson 2003, 83.

¹¹⁸ Kolamo 2014, 111–112.

¹¹⁹ For example: Nevala 2012, 257.

¹²⁰ Kolamo 2014, 83.

¹²¹ Kolamo 2014, 100–104.

only promoted its own, business-oriented and neo-liberal values, or has it really tried to understand the local and global environmental needs? These are important questions when analyzing the visual material of FIFA. Next, I will continue shortly about the relation between environment and football and introduce what kind of environmental themes are generally linked to football mega-events.

1.4.2 Football Mega-Events and the Environment

Just like in politics and in the field of communications, environmental attention spread in the world of sports in the beginning of the 1990's. The two main areas have been "the reducing of environmental consequences of sports and exploiting the huge popularity of sport to raise environmental awareness in general."¹²²

When speaking particularly of football, there are recently published studies that introduce the environmental themes, which are especially familiar in the world of football. Especially mega events, like the English FA-Cup Final and international competitions like the World Cup have received attention. Within these studies it has been found out that the main environmental themes linked with football are the use of water (for watering the pitches), the transportation of people to stadiums, the energy efficiency (for example stadium lights), the packaging of the food and beverages in stadiums and the waste or recycling challenges. Supply chains are also important because of the massive volumes of different kind of products related to big football events.¹²³ These include not only food and drinks, but also the huge variety of fan-products.

Challenges seem to have gathered most of the attention, but there have been some studies examining the possibilities of positive environmental effects of mega-level sports events like the World Cup of football:

"For example, a sensitive and sustainable event and sophisticated green technology can affect the way the host city and country are seen. They can be seen as a business attempting to increase awareness of opportunities available for investors, such as newly developed green technology (for example stadium cooling systems in Qatar or Dioxin remediation techniques in Sydney). They can also be seen as a tourist destination trying to attract visitors looking for sustainable sites or eco-tourism. Other things that mega events can signal are

¹²² Schmidt 2006, A287.

¹²³ Jenkins 2012, Schmidt 2006.

sustainable planning skills, sensitivity to the environment and biodiversity, and advanced ability to invent green technology.”¹²⁴

From the perspective of communication, it is interesting that the huge visibility of mega-sports events has also been proposed to work as a way for spreading the environmental information and helping in environmental education.¹²⁵ However, the environmental concern about for example the World Cup has been quite the same as in the studies of corporate environmental communications: the World Cup is a stage where the corporate-sponsors of FIFA search positive visibility, so called social license for their operating, and space for advertising and increasing not so sustainable trend of mass consumption, which, in turn, many times heightens the inequality between poor and rich people of the world¹²⁶ (= again, structural violence). At the same time they try look environmental-friendly and green, which creates a dissonance that makes it important to ask if the environmental campaigns are only looking green?

It is important to recognize these environmental aspects related to football and mega-events of sports. In addition to organizational motives and pressures coming from global environmental agenda and from partners of FIFA, football-specific environmental dimensions are possibly recognized and covered in the visual material of the football federation.

In the next chapter I will first scratch the surface of the glocal environmental context to shortly introduce the environmental circumstances where FIFA was campaigning. Then, I will begin to introduce the environmental perspective of FIFA. First, I will tell about the official perspective of the environmental campaign of FIFA: what FIFA has said about its environmental actions? This is needed in a same way that the editorials of newspapers are needed in the analysis of visual journalism – for understanding the official perspective of the publisher. After that, I will tell how I found and selected the visual material that I have used.

¹²⁴ Preuss 2013, 3591.

¹²⁵ Ibid, 3590.

¹²⁶ Miller 2016.

2. The Glocal Environmental Context and the Selected Material

2.1 The Global Environmental Political Context – the UN Agenda

As said in the introduction, there is no such a thing as the official global environmental political agenda. However, as an international organization, governed by nation states, UN sets values that are recognized, at least on a paper, by the majority of the nations of the world. Thus, the environmental agenda of the UN is one of the leading environmental political discourses in the world. I want to emphasize that I am not considering the environmental goals promoted by UN as objective facts. UN is a one stakeholder in environmental politics and it frames the environment from one perspective. UN Millenium Development goals and the annual reports by UNEP were selected as a framework for environmental political agenda because of the publicity and attention they receive globally. 191 countries signed the agreement on millennium declaration, which was the basis for the development goals.

UN Millenium Declaration was given in 2000. Together 191 nations, including 147 heads of State and Government, adopted the Millenium Declaration. Millenium Development Goals were established after the adoption of the Millenium Declaration. The environment was among the areas focused on peaceful and sustainable development. As the self-definition of the UN says:

“At the Millennium Summit in September 2000 the largest gathering of world leaders in history adopted the UN Millennium Declaration, committing their nations to a new global partnership to reduce extreme poverty and setting out a series of time-bound targets, with a deadline of 2015, that have become known as the Millennium Development Goals.

The Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) are the world's time-bound and quantified targets for addressing extreme poverty in its many dimensions-income poverty, hunger, disease, lack of adequate shelter, and exclusion-while promoting gender equality, education, and environmental sustainability. They are also basic human rights-the rights of each person on the planet to health, education, shelter, and security.”¹²⁷

In this thesis, the focus is on the dimension of environmental sustainability and thus, on the MDG number 7¹²⁸, which addresses the environment. The targets 9, 10 and 11, seen in the appendix 1, are very broad. Central themes that can be picked up are *the loss of environmental resources, water-related goals* and *improvement of conditions of people living in slums*. The “indicators” clarify the

¹²⁷ <http://www.unmillenniumproject.org/goals/> (Visited 26.3.2016)

¹²⁸ Appendix 1. United Nations Millenium Development Goal number 7.

targets: *forests, protecting biological diversity, carbon emissions and use of solid fuels* are selected to be in the center of the environmental sustainability goals. In relation with water issues, *sustainable access to safe drinking water and sanitation* are emphasized.

These general themes seen in MDG 7 are also repeated in different forms in the annual reports of UNEP. Themes of reports have been almost the same from 2007 until 2014: Climate Change, Ecosystem Management, Environmental Governance, Resource Efficiency, Harmful Substances and Hazardous Waste. These themes are seen in every report since 2007, and in the annual report 2009 they are actually defined to be the “six cross-cutting thematic priority areas identified for UNEP in its medium-term strategy 2010-2013”.¹²⁹ Shortly introduced now, the perspective of the global agenda will be deepened within the material-analysis chapters. Next, it is necessary to introduce the context of Brazil in a same way than the global one.

2.2 The Environmental Context of Brazil

Brazil is a vast country that has huge diversities on the different levels of society. The environment does not make an exception in this. The country has Oceanic coastal zones, wet-lands, grass-lands, huge urban centers and the famous Amazonia, one of the world’s biggest freshwater reserves, which is at the same time a home for the most diverse flora and fauna in the Earth.

With the diverse circumstances come also diverse environmental problems. Deforestation of the Amazon area, which endangers also lives of various plants and animals, has been a big environmental concern. Pollution of water and air and waste problems are dimensions of environmental problems seen especially in the biggest urban centers of Brazil. Mining activities have also caused water pollution and land degradation. Degradation of wetlands is also one current topic in the environmental context of Brazil.¹³⁰

Because of the huge environmental potential, positive and negative, Brazil has integrated environmental themes to the official policies of the country. In the studies that analyze the politics of Brazil, Brazil has been seen as an emerging environmental power¹³¹. This means that Brazil is, and

¹²⁹ UNEP Annual Report 2009, Table of Contents.

¹³⁰ CIA: The World Fact Book (<https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/br.html>) Visited 5.5.2016.

¹³¹ Barros-Plataiu 2010.

has been, very active in the sector of environmental development. It has hosted for example the UN Conference on Environment and Development in 1992. More recently in 2012 it was the home for the UN RIO+20 Conference for Sustainable Development. When it comes to concrete environmental actions, Brazil has for example fought against carbon emissions-based air pollution with the 40-year-old national ethanol-use programme. Renewable energy and clean sources, like biofuel, have been motors also for the international developmental diplomacy of Brazil. The country has used the ethanol-based biofuel as an answer to energy, climate change and poverty challenges of the world.¹³²

It seems that from Brazil FIFA found a friendly, environmentally rich context for promoting environmental themes. Brazilian official policies on domestic and foreign levels were already interested in promoting environmental development. As FIFA organizes the World Cup in a close cooperation between the hosting country and its cities, it can be assumed that the cooperative link in environmental themes was easy to establish. Both FIFA and Brazil were benefitting from this two-way relationship: FIFA was able to use these environmental friendly circumstances to include environment to its campaign¹³³, and Brazil was able to use the World Cup as a scene for promoting their environmental policies.

2.3 FIFA, the World Cup in Brazil and Environment

Already in the annual activity report of 2012, the background of the sustainability strategy of the 2014 World Cup is revealed: “The strategy builds on the experience gained from environmental and social development programmes at FIFA tournaments since 2005, on international standards such as ISO 26000 and the Global Reporting Initiative (GRI), and on the development policies of the government of Brazil.”¹³⁴ Based on this statement by FIFA, it is clear that FIFA has acknowledged the global environmental standards. At the same time, it seems that FIFA has recognized the environmental aspects that are familiar more generally in the world of football; energy saving at the stadiums, transportation, wastes management and supply chains of different products¹³⁵:

”Based on the experience gained from the FIFA World Cups since 2006 (see §1.2) and after the materiality analysis (see §1.3), environmental protection measures were focused on waste management (see §3.3), transportation (see §3.4) and procurement (see §2.3) as well

¹³² Dauvergene & Farias 2012, 912–913.

¹³³ The diverse environmental circumstances were already recognized in the inspection report about the host country of Brazil in 2007. Look: Brazil Bid. Inspection Report for the 2014 FIFA World Cup™, 14.

¹³⁴ FIFA Activity Report 2012, 72.

¹³⁵ Jenkins 2012, Schmidt 2006.

as climate change and carbon offsetting through low-carbon projects in different regions of Brazil including the Amazon (see §3.2).

For the first time, environmental education was also an important part of activities. Using the 2014 FIFA World Cup official mascot Fuleco, recycling was promoted inside and outside the stadiums (see §3.3) and a training programme was specifically developed to strengthen the sustainability know-how of stadium authorities, including water and energy saving measures (see §5.2).¹³⁶

In addition to these themes, FIFA also declares that it has understood the “The Brazilian government’s policy agenda, which outlines the essential issues and topics for sustainable development in Brazil.”¹³⁷ Thus, FIFA at least states that it has recognized the local perspective. The including of the local perspective was also tried to realize by organizing the sustainability programme in cooperation with the Local Organizing Committee (LOC) that FIFA defines in following way: “The LOC is a private entity, which receives FIFA funding, whose role is to help to organize the competition.”¹³⁸ The depending of the LOC on FIFA funding makes the impartiality of the LOC questionable. Being difficult to make difference between LOC and FIFA, I will treat it as a one additional FIFA-controlled governing organ.

When thinking the global environmental agenda, it is important to notice that FIFA talks about the certain themes of its environmental programme. As seen in the citation above, waste management, transportation and carbon offsetting were the most central themes for FIFA. These partly resonate with the general environmental agenda of UN. Carbon emissions, including the transportation issues, was an important theme for UN too. Waste management was not a separate theme in UN Millennium Goals, but it was introduced in UNEP annual reports¹³⁹. In turn, UN themes of Water management and improving the conditions of slum dwellers were not in the centrum of the official environmental agenda of FIFA.

This was the official perspective of the environmental campaign of FIFA in a nutshell. The local perspective is said to be acknowledged. From a global perspective, in sum, FIFA seems to have recognized certain parts of the environmental agenda. Most of the themes from the general relationship of football mega-events and environment have been acknowledged too. Additional,

¹³⁶ FIFA Sustainability Report 2014, 44–45.

¹³⁷ FIFA Development of the Sustainability Strategy 2013, 4.

¹³⁸ (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2011/m=9/news=landmark-moments-the-brazil-2014-trail-1511287.html>) Visited 21.4.2016.

¹³⁹ For example: UNEP Annual Report 2014.

useful and more detailed examples about the official environmental perspective of FIFA are introduced in the following pages, where I will analyze the visual framing of the environment by FIFA.

2.4 The Selected Material

The *Fifa.com* is the official website of the Federation of International Football, FIFA. FIFA has also other online channels, like social media profiles, but the official website seems to be the most comprehensive digital media channel for FIFA to share knowledge about its actions, and about football generally. At the website, visual material is used a lot; photographs, other pictures and videos are everywhere on the pages. During the World Cup 2014 in Brazil, FIFA used *fifa.com* as a platform for “Global Stadium”-project, which tells that the website is important channel for the organization:

“FIFA Digital’s responsibility was to utilise technology in order to provide a seamless web user experience of the world’s greatest sporting event to a demanding, global digital World Cup audience and convey the mission from football’s world governing body: *For the Game. For the World*. The ambition was to increase global audience reach and enhance engagement of FIFA’s platforms, using FIFA.com as the digital hub, mostly within a live context.”¹⁴⁰

By the information given by FIFA, during the thirty one days of the World Cup action on pitches, *fifa.com* was visited by 189 million people. The total attendance of the “Global Stadium” exceeded 1 billion users, which was estimated to be two times as big audience as the World Cup 2010 received in *fifa.com*.¹⁴¹ In addition, the website reached users from every country belonging to the Football Federation.¹⁴² Of course, this information is given by FIFA itself. Still, the active and enthusiastic promotion of digital technology and investment on web-based “Global Stadium” by FIFA make it interesting to focus on *fifa.com*. At least FIFA appreciated the *fifa.com* as a communication channel, which means that communication was very likely to be well-planned.

The website of FIFA consists of different specific sectors like “About FIFA”, “Sustainability”, “Governance” and “FIFA World Cup™”.¹⁴³ The website is a massive collection of data, flooded with

¹⁴⁰ <http://www.fifa.com/webbys/website.html> (Visited 9.3.2016)

¹⁴¹ http://resources.fifa.com/mm/document/tournament/competition/02/40/55/72/digiuser_en_english.pdf (Visited 9.3.2016).

¹⁴² Ibid.

¹⁴³ Fifa.com (Visited 9.3.2016).

visual material. The biggest challenge of the website regarding the academic purposes is to limit the amount of the data. Luckily, there is an own search engine on *fifa.com*. For me, it was an essential tool in the beginning of the process of finding the relevant photographs. In the further process of analyzing the data, the ideas of content analysis proved to be useful.

As a basic tool of every kind of qualitative analysis¹⁴⁴, content analysis was suitable for the aims of this qualitative research. By categorizing my material thematically, based on the findings themselves, the research took a material-driven, but theory tied direction. Particular themes were rising from the primary source itself, and what is typical of theory tied research approach, the purpose was not to test the previous theories but rather create new ways of thinking. Still, in this approach it is possible to recognize the role of previous knowledge.¹⁴⁵ Here, it means the themes found from the primary sources are connected to the theoretical background.

As said, for finding the visual material related to World Cup of Brazil, I used the search engine offered by the *fifa.com*. First, I chose the section under the search to be “FIFA World Cup™”. Then the search words that I used were *Brazil 2014*, *environment*, *environmental*, and *sustainable*. The filter was set in a way that a report or news story had to include *Brazil 2014* and then one of the environmental and sustainability-related words. I chose the words *environment* and *environmental* because they managed to reach best my point of view, which is to address the environmental perspective of FIFA. *Sustainable* is arising from the policies of FIFA because the official campaign of FIFA, environment being one of the main themes¹⁴⁶, is called the ‘Sustainability Programme’. Because there was no possibility to search pictures based on captions only, I looked illustrations of news stories that were linked to search words based on the caption, title or the news text itself.

Altogether, the search engine offered me 190 news stories inside the chosen time scale. Further on, all the 190 news stories did not address the environmental aspects of the FIFA World Cup in Brazil. Many of these news stories were linked to the World Cup of 2010 in South Africa. The sports jargon

¹⁴⁴ Tuomi, Sarajärvi 2004, 93.

¹⁴⁵ Tuomi, Sarajärvi 2004, 98.

¹⁴⁶ “We received today, for the first time, a very in-depth update on the status of preparations in all aspects, including **the important sustainability strategy plan**. This is vital as we have a responsibility that goes beyond the provision of the facilities for the event. We must ensure that we maximise the positive effects for the benefit of all Brazilians and also **minimise the negative impact, especially on the environment**,” said committee chairman Nicolás Leoz. (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2012/m=3/news=organising-committee-for-the-fifa-world-cuptm-starts-its-2014-mission-1607382.html>) Visited 19.4.2016. Boldings by me.

about the 'game environment' also made a bunch of news worthless for my research. Finally, after clearing the minefield of irrelevant news, I had 35 news stories left. Some of these came with multiple illustrations. Pictures were illustrating the environment itself, and the governing actions of the environmental campaign of FIFA.

Historically, the distribution of the environment related news stories with pictures is not regular. There is only one sustainability news story related to Brazil World Cup offered by *fifa.com* in 2010 and not a single one before that. This could be explained by the fact that there was the FIFA World Cup in South Africa in 2010. The main attention of FIFA was there – not yet in Brazil.

Two additional remarks need to be mentioned about the dividing of the news stories. First, 2012 was a top year with 15 articles. One reason for this could be that in 2012 FIFA participated in Rio+20 UN conference on sustainable development¹⁴⁷ and was very enthusiastic environmentally because of this. The second interesting remark is that there were only two environment-related news in 2014 during the month of the World Cup games. The explanation to this might be that the main attention of FIFA and the audience was in the competition on the stadiums. The publishing of informative news stories in the *fifa.com* was probably not thought to be very important in this phase because the environmental campaign was in full throttle within the concrete football actions taking place in Brazil.

In addition to the news stories, I searched visual material from the official reports and documents released by FIFA. These reports could be found from the *fifa.com*, under the section of "Official Documents"¹⁴⁸. The most important reports are the environmental reports directly related to the World Cup in Brazil. I also included annual "activity reports" of FIFA to the analysis. These annual reports include sections for the sustainable campaign of FIFA, and also for the World Cup. Thus, they too help to understand the environmental agenda of FIFA. In addition, in these reports FIFA was using a lot of visual material. Altogether, from these environment related reports or parts of the reports I found 18 pictures that were tied to environment by captions, titles or by the overall theme

¹⁴⁷ <http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2012/m=6/news=brazil-set-new-sustainability-standard-1653133.html> (visited 5.4.2016)

¹⁴⁸ <http://www.fifa.com/about-fifa/official-documents/index.html> (Visited 2.4.2016).

of the report¹⁴⁹. Like the pictures of the news reports, these illustrations of documents included photographs of not only environment, but also of the governance of the environmental campaign.

When looking the annual activity reports, it is remarkable that, like in the news reports, the World Cup of Brazil was present only after the previous World Cup in 2010. The second interesting thing is that the environment was generally receiving more space in the reports after 2010. Before that, developmental programmes of FIFA were addressing more social developmental dimensions like health and education. Environmental aspects seem to have gained more weight in the developmental policies of FIFA in relation with the World Cup in Brazil. This observation is verified by FIFA in its annual activity report edition 2012: “The 2014 FIFA World Cup Brazil will be the first FIFA World Cup to have a comprehensive sustainability strategy.”¹⁵⁰ This statement makes Brazil 2014 environmentally exceptional World Cup.

Finally, I found the total amount of 61 visual representations linked textually with the environment and environmental sustainability. From this sample I decided to rise four thematic categories, choosing the most descriptive examples to illustrate my findings. The first category is about what the environment looks like in the visual material of FIFA: how environment is defined visually? The second one is about how FIFA was framing the relation between people and environment and environmental actions of FIFA. The third category addresses the most visualized environment related theme of FIFA, the venues of the World Cup, the stadiums. The fourth category discusses how and why FIFA was not visualizing some themes fitting to global or local environmental agenda.

¹⁴⁹ This means that if the topic of report was for example carbon emissions, which was one sub-theme of the environmental campaign of FIFA, visual representations in this report were thought to be related to this theme and thus, to environment.

¹⁵⁰ FIFA Annual Activity Report 2012, 72.

3. FIFA Defining the Environment

3.1 Urban Environment

Because one of the fundamental dimensions of environmental discussions is the question of how environment is defined and framed, a good way to start the analysis is to look what the environment looks like in the material of FIFA. What environment is from the perspective of FIFA? Based on the material, I came up with two sub-categories: visualizing of the *urban environment* and visualizing of the *non-urban environment*. Let us start with the representations of the more often visualized category, the urban environment.

First two examples come from the Annual Activity Report of 2014. In this report the environmental sustainability campaign of FIFA is addressed in the section called “Build a Better Future”. In the opening page of the “Build a Better Future”-section, there is a large and an eye-catching two-page picture¹⁵¹, which gives a great overall view of the sustainability campaign and thus, is a good picture to start the analysis. First, this picture illustrates well *how* FIFA connects the environment with its general sustainability campaign. Second, it begins to characterize *what* kind of environment FIFA links to the sustainability campaign.

In the picture, the colors of green and yellow are striking. As said in the caption¹⁵², colors are the colors of the Brazilian flag, but green is also very strongly linked to nature. It is also worth of noticing that the most visible text in the picture is not the small caption, but the title: “Build a Better Future”. The picture is textually framed more strongly with the title than with the caption, and the text “Build a better future” links the picture with the message of the text. A viewer more likely connects the illustration with the theme of building a better future than with the caption written in a small font size.

The environment of the illustration seems urban because there are human made constructions and paintings in the picture. When looked carefully, the shadows in the picture seem to be coming from leaves of a tree and this, together with the green color, connects the urban environment to nature.

¹⁵¹ Picture 1: Football, Brazil, Sustainability and Environment. FIFA Annual Activity Report 2014, 70–71.

¹⁵² “A child runs with a football on a street decorated in the colours of the Brazilian flag near the Arena Amazônia in Manaus”.

The nature is present, but only as shadows and as a green color. In this picture urban seems to be visualized more directly than nature.

There is a little boy running in the picture with a ball. Green and yellow, the main colors of the flag of Brazil, and a boy with a ball wearing the shirt of *Seleção*,¹⁵³ strongly link the picture with Brazil and football. The little boy is running or jumping. We can see the face of the boy and he seems to be very concentrated, looking forwards to the ground. In the studies of advertising, showing a person in a picture has been studied to be a very effective way of delivering messages about the products or thoughts, which are advertised¹⁵⁴. It is also important to notice that especially showing the human face makes it easier for viewer to identify with the persons in the pictures. A viewer can see the face expressions and interpret messages from the face. One purpose of face expressions in communication is to replace speech¹⁵⁵, which becomes extremely important in pictures that do not include sound. Seeing faces in pictures bring pictures closer to viewer. It has also been studied that the visibility of faces in pictures increases the reliability of the argumentation of the pictures.¹⁵⁶

The photograph seems to be constructed to evoke feelings about the campaign of FIFA. At the same time, the picture connects Brazil, football, urban and nature. These are the pieces which the “building a better future” is made of. FIFA possibly wants to make viewer to identify him/herself with the boy of the picture and this way create a strong visual proposal: Building a better future, is done with football and Brazil, moving dynamically forwards in the urban environment, where nature is closely present. The concentrated gaze is pointed forwards.

If the example above shows how FIFA connects environment to its sustainability campaign, the second example picture from the same report shows even more strongly how the environment itself is framed by FIFA. The photograph is an iconic two-page photograph of the city of Rio de Janeiro¹⁵⁷. There is no caption in the photo. Maybe it is left out because it has been thought that the landscape with Sugar Loaf Mountain is recognizable and famous enough. The most visible text linked to the picture is the title “Protecting the Environment”.

¹⁵³ The national football team of Brazil.

¹⁵⁴ Rose 2012, 114.

¹⁵⁵ Knapp & Hall 2010, 294.

¹⁵⁶ Larson 2007, 260.

¹⁵⁷ Picture 2: Urban Meets Nature. FIFA Annual Activity Report 2014, 78–79.

There is now a strong connection between the urban and the nature in the photograph. The representation shows how the city of Rio is in the middle of water, green areas and mountains. Thus, together with the title, it frames, from the perspective of FIFA, what kind of environment needs to be protected. In this picture there is no straight visual link to football and FIFA – only the fundamental idea that the World Cup was held in Brazil and the final played in Rio de Janeiro, where the picture is taken from. This naturally beautiful urban center is a scene of the World Cup.

Urban environments are polluted in many big cities of the world, and big urban centers themselves are also big polluters, which has been recognized in the global environmental agenda – not only currently, but also earlier in the 20th century. Especially the theme of urban growth management has been an area of environmental politics and international environmental agreements that tries to answer the question of how to make urban areas grow without the un-controlled degradation of nature.¹⁵⁸ One recent answer to this has been an international standard to build more dense cities to protect the surrounding nature from urban sprawl¹⁵⁹, which has, in turn, made it problematic to integrate green areas in the daily life of people in big urban areas. It has been stated that this way the dividing between urban and nature might strengthen instead of a better integration of these two.¹⁶⁰ In this photograph of Rio de Janeiro, a dense urban area and green nature seem to hug each other without any dividing.

As mentioned, the biggest cities in Brazil have also problems like water and air pollution. Proposition made by the picture links the actions of FIFA strongly to this global and local Brazilian theme of developing the environmental sustainability of the urban areas¹⁶¹. The picture can be thought also other way round – the nature needs to be protected from the urban. However, in both cases it is clear that the intertwining of nature and urban is *selected* and *made salient*. When thinking the framing functions, defining function is clearly fulfilled: environment is defined to be an intersection of nature and urban. In addition, picture with the title tells that urban areas are important in environmental protection. Thus, it can fulfill the functions of *offering solutions* to environmental protection and *making moral evaluations* about the importance of urban areas and their growth management in environmental protection.

¹⁵⁸ Wang & al. 2016, 1.

¹⁵⁹ Look for example Aalborg Commitments, 2004, Section 5.

¹⁶⁰ Niemi 2017, 213.

¹⁶¹ Look for example: UNEP 2011-Annual Report, 79. Towards a Sustainable Urban Areas.

It needs to be mentioned that this exactly same picture is also used in the World Cup 2014 Sustainability report, published after the World Cup. In this case, the picture framed with the text “Football for the Planet”, and the link with the football is created with the title, more directly than in the previous case. However, the picture and text together offer a very similar kind of framing of the environment. The phrase “For the Planet” makes the global perspective of FIFA even clearer. Still, at the same time FIFA strongly frames “the Planet” to be this kind of intersection of urban and natural environments: on the other hand, Rio de Janeiro is shown as a densely built urban center, but on the other, the picture also shows the green side of the city. It almost looks like FIFA manages to show a global environmental ideal with the picture.

The next example continues the theme of linking the urban to the environmental campaign of FIFA. This picture from the Sustainability Report¹⁶² introduces another dimension of urban environments, which is familiar in the context of sports events¹⁶³, and has also been present in the global environmental agenda¹⁶⁴: sustainable mobility and transportation. The photograph itself is a simple representation of a bus parked in the front of a building, which looks like a football stadium. The bus is painted with the pictures and brand-colors of the Brazil-World Cup. With this, the visual connection with the World Cup is created.

This picture is a very good example how the context and page-layout of visual material matters much when the viewer is looking the material. The picture is located in the “Transport”-sub-section under the “Football for the Planet” –main title. At the previous page, next to the picture, there is a section “FIFA World Cup vehicle fleet”, which tells about low-carbon emission buses. By using the illustration of the bus in this textual context, FIFA shows how it has especially recognized the role of public transport in lowering the carbon emissions. The bus of the picture is used as an example of this. It is also interesting that the bus, not the driver, is at the center of attention, even though, when closely looked, it is possible to see the hand of the driver hanging from the window. However,

¹⁶² Picture 3: Environmentally Sustainable Bus. FIFA Sustainability Report 2014, 51.

¹⁶³ Jenkins 2012

¹⁶⁴ For example: UNEP Annual Report 2012, 23–24: “The Global Fuel Economy Initiative – set up by UNEP with the International Energy Agency, the International Transport Forum, the International Council for Clean Transportation and the FIA Foundation – targets improving the fuel efficiency of the global fleet by at least 50 per cent by 2050. The initiative supports close to 20 countries in Africa, Asia, Latin America and Central and Eastern Europe to implement policies that target inefficient cars, provide tax breaks to efficient cars, regulate used vehicles imports, and require labels informing consumers about emissions and fuel consumption.”

the role of the FIFA-bus in environmental protection is highlighted more than the role of the driver. This is how FIFA emphasizes its own role, but at the same time the role of green technology¹⁶⁵ in environmental work. Technology is framed to be a way of achieving success in the sector of environmental sustainability.

At the same time, this picture is also my first (but definitely not the last!) example of the visual material where the business-partners of FIFA are receiving a central position in the representations. Thus, this picture is the first example of how the previously described corporation family of FIFA can be seen, or more exactly, *cannot be unseen*, in the context of the World Cup. The logo of Hyundai is at the center of the photograph. Meanwhile the picture is boosting the environmental image of FIFA, Hyundai, too, gets the brand-polishing make-up by being shown as a part of the environmental-friendly planning of the World Cup.

Transportation theme was seen also in other visualizations of FIFA, like in the one picture of a news report published in March 2012. Picture is showing the construction of the new “Bus Rapid Transit-system” in one of the host cities, Porto Alegre¹⁶⁶. In this picture, there is no straight visual link to football or FIFA, but the picture still shows how the World Cup is ‘causing’ this kind of environmental-friendliness in the urban context. Like the city major of Porto Alegre, Jose Fortunati, is cited in the text below the illustration: “The FIFA World Cup is already happening in Porto Alegre”¹⁶⁷. Again, the role of technology in environmental work is selected and made salient.

The urban environment and selected elements of it are present in most of the illustrations of FIFA. It is clear that FIFA connects the environment and its environmental actions strongly with the urban environment. FIFA *frames* the environment to be urban, strongly connected to human actions, but being still in a close interaction with the nature. FIFA visually makes a framing proposition that urban areas are important in the protection of natural environment. This all links the perspective of FIFA with the global challenges of urban growth, like pollution, wastes management and protecting of green areas, as well as with the context of Brazil, where the biggest cities are definitely not without their own environmental problems.

¹⁶⁵ Introducing developed green technology is studied to be one dimension where sports-events can make an impact. Preuss 2013, 3591.

¹⁶⁶ Picture 4: Constructing BRT-System in Porto Alegre. FIFA.com.

¹⁶⁷ <http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2012/m=3/news=porto-alegre-begins-work-brt-system-1599633.html>

What we need to remember that the concrete actions of the World Cup are mostly seen in urban environments, in other words in the host cities, which are scenes for the game-events. As known, FIFA is well aware of the fact that the TV-cameras of the world are pointed in these cities. That makes it easier and rational for FIFA to concentrate more on urban issues and not so much for example on agrarian themes. In selected urban environments FIFA can easily show how it works for the environment. This, in turn, is very important for building the environmental-friendly brand-image. This specialization on themes that are easy to show was seen in its most extreme form in the visualizing of the stadiums, which will be addressed later in its own chapter. Next, I will introduce some visual representations of FIFA, which were *not* showing the urban environments. These pictures came low in numbers, but they were building frames of non-urban environment. Thus, it is important to give few pages also for these pictures.

3.2 Non-urban Environment: Amazonia in the Spotlight

Images that are showing pure nature are not seen much in the visual material of FIFA. The only 'pure' natural theme that is shown by only one picture was the rainforest theme. There were not much pictures about non-urban, but not purely natural, environment either. I was able to find two examples about this kind of natural environment, which was still linked to human actions. Because there are not many of these kind of pictures, these few pictures have much weight when it comes to perception of FIFA about the natural and non-urban environment. This is why I wanted to include these illustrations in the analysis.

The first example comes from the Sustainability Report, published after the World Cup. The textual framing of the illustration is again made with the title "Protecting the environment". The picture is on the front page of the environmental section of the Sustainability Report and it is a big, almost a two-page picture¹⁶⁸. This makes the photograph very eye-catching.

In this picture, there is no sign of human beings, human-made constructions or any other human-society related thing. There is not even a one single boat sailing at the river. It is a representation of pure natural environment. It is not mentioned where this picture is taken from, but a viewer recognizes that there is a big river and large area of rainforest in the picture. If the picture is taken

¹⁶⁸ Picture 5: Pure Nature. FIFA Sustainability Report (2014), 42–43.

from Brazil, it must be from the area of *Amazonas*. The picture is taken from the bird's-eye perspective, which is the best way to capture large landscapes, which in this case means showing how vast an area the rainforest and the river cover. The river and the rainforest reach as long as it can be seen, disappearing into horizon.

The exactly same picture was previously published within the news story of FIFA, in April 2014.¹⁶⁹ This news story addressed FIFA's campaign to minimize the environmental effects caused by the international air-travelling related to World Cup in Brazil. FIFA promised to offset all the travelling-based carbon-emissions of ticketholders that register the campaign of FIFA. The same representation of pure nature was used in this context, too, linking it with one central theme of the environmental campaign of FIFA, reducing the carbon emissions.

In addition to this, it is interesting how the text "protecting the environment" is also used with the visualization of the urban-nature link. As seen in the previous sub-chapter, in the Annual Activity Report 2014, FIFA used the picture of Rio de Janeiro with the textual framing "protecting the environment". Now the same theme is illustrated with another kind of environmental theme. However, the urban-nature link was generally seen much more often than the pure nature theme. This makes the picture of the rainforest and river exceptional.

If mirrored against the global and local contexts, the rainforest introduced the themes of deforestation and biodiversity protection seen also in the UN Millennium Development Goals¹⁷⁰. At the same time, the degradation of the Amazon rainforests and protecting their vulnerable biodiversity have been very central environmental concerns in the context of Brazil¹⁷¹. With this picture, FIFA strongly frames rainforests to be one specific area that needs protection.

The other two examples, which are representing other than urban environment, come from the news-reports of FIFA. The first one is a photograph published in June 2014, during the World Cup. The second picture is published after the World Cup, in December 2014, which shows that FIFA did not completely abandon the environmental campaign after the end of the World Cup.

¹⁶⁹ <http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2014/m=4/news=ticketholders-encouraged-to-limit-environmental-impact-and-win-tickets-2326107.html> (Visited 3.5.2016)

¹⁷⁰ Appendix 1: UN Millenium Development Goal 7.

¹⁷¹ CIA: The World Fact Book.

The first picture of these is a photograph of a boat at a river¹⁷². The title says: “FIFA to offset all its operational carbon emissions through certified projects in Brazil”. The caption is revealed when the mouse is dragged over the picture: “Transport boat of the Purus Project in the state of Acre”. There is also text in the picture itself. This text, written on the poster on the boat, confirms that the boat is linked to the Purus Project. The picture does not tell much about the Purus Project. However, the picture connects the project supported by FIFA to rainforest and river.

Like the previous picture, the natural environment of Brazil is framed to be rainforests and rivers. It is interesting that FIFA has chosen to show the rainforest theme, when at the same time there are many other types of endangered natural environments in Brazil. For example the unique woodland savanna ecosystem of *Cerrado* is also suffering from degradation caused by soy-bean cultivation and cattle-ranching¹⁷³. Possibly rainforests are chosen because, as the largest tropical rainforest area of the world, Amazonia is the most famous natural environmental context of Brazil, and at the same time the rainforests of the Amazonia, and their degradation, have been global symbols for environmental degradation and deforestation¹⁷⁴.

The second picture continues with the forest-theme¹⁷⁵. At this time, there is no river in the picture, but the picture is linked to Amazon-area with the caption: “The power plant located in the small town of Itacoatiara in the Brazilian Amazonas region, supplies the approximately 80,000 inhabitants with climate-friendly power.” Thus, FIFA again introduces how it is participating in climate-friendly projects, using the Amazon as a context.

The picture shows a portrait of a power plant. The power plant seems to be working because there is smoke coming out from the pipe of the factory. Like in the previous sub-chapter I introduced the example of environmental-friendly bus that was green, in this picture too, *the technology* of the power plant is shown as environmental-friendly. People working at the plant are not brought to the center of attention, as it was in the case of the environment-friendly bus. This framing style again

¹⁷² Picture 6: The Purus Project. (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2014/m=6/news=fifa-to-offset-all-its-operational-carbon-emissions-through-certified--2379123.html>) Visited 9.5.2016.

¹⁷³ WWF: Environmental Problems in Brazil.

¹⁷⁴ UNEP 2009. Vital Forest Graphics, 44 – 45.

¹⁷⁵ Picture 7: The Power Plant in Amazonas.

(<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/photos/galleries/y=2014/m=6/gallery=2014-fwc-carbon-offsetting-programme-2379610.html#2379620>)

emphasizes the role of the investments of FIFA in green technology. Visually, the power plant of the picture is framed to be very close to nature because trees and green areas are surrounding the plant. This supports the information about climate friendliness, given in the caption.

As seen, in the illustrations of FIFA the image of the non-urban environment was extracted to visualizations of rainforests of Amazonia. There were not many of these pictures, but it still is interesting that FIFA was representing only this side of the diverse environmental circumstances of Brazil. Possibly the symbolic value of Amazonia, also on the global level, made FIFA to select it as a nature-theme of its environmental campaign. Of the four visualizations of Amazonia, three were linked textually with one of the main environmental themes of FIFA, carbon-emission reducing. This framing makes these images define Amazonia as an important for global climate challenges. By this framing, FIFA is offering a solution where the protection of the rainforests has an important role when fighting against climate problems caused by carbon-emissions.

To summarize this chapter, framing of the environment in the visual material of FIFA is divided to the definitions of the urban and the non-urban environments. The urban environment is far more visualized than the non-urban, which is partly because all the concrete World Cup-actions were taking place in the host cities of the World Cup and the main media attention was pointed at there. In both of the categories, urban and non-urban environment, FIFA seems to acknowledge the global environmental agenda. Urban environments, like big cities, are found from Brazil, as well as the lungs of the planet, the rainforests, but these themes are also central parts of the global environmental agenda of the selected time period. This global and very general-level perspective is a safe solution for FIFA, because the audience of the publications is very global, too. To conclude, the framing of the environment in the campaign of FIFA is more focused on urban than non-urban environment. At the same time, from the local context of Brazil FIFA seems to have introduced environmental aspects, which have been possible to link with the topics of the global environmental agenda.

As seen above, there was only one picture showing the pure nature without human-related signs. Most of the pictures were representing environment linked to human actions, mainly in the urban context. In addition to these visual linkages to human actions, in many of its environmental pictures

FIFA also represents people. How is this link between people and environment visualized and framed? In the next chapter, I will address this linkage.

4. People and the Environmental Campaign of FIFA

4.1 `The Civilians`

As we have already learned in the beginning of the previous chapter¹⁷⁶, showing people in pictures can make frame building intentions stronger and more convincing. This has been found out in previous studies, where showing people has been proved to increase the possibility of pictures to make the wanted effect through the mechanism, where a viewer identifies him/herself with people in a picture. FIFA used a lot of persons in its visual material related to its environmental campaign. This visual evidence about people working within the environmental campaign was possibly made to get more weight for the words of the football federation. In this following section, I will give examples of who these people were, and how they were connected with environmental themes that were represented in these pictures.

Again, I divided pictures into two categories. In this first sub-chapter, I will focus on representations showing people outside of the governance of FIFA working for the environmental campaign. I call these people the `civilians`. In the second sub-chapter, I will introduce how the governance and monitoring of the environmental campaign was visualized focusing completely on the officials of the football federation, in other words, on the `men of FIFA`.

I will begin with the examples coming from the “Final Report of the Sustainability Training Programme for 2014 FIFA World Cup™ Stadium Operators”, published in August 2014 after the World Cup. The pictures of this report show one perspective from which FIFA was showing the people who are working for the environmental campaign. The pictures are seen in the section of the report that is particularly addressing environmental protection. The section is called “2nd Workshop: Environmental protection and sustainable procurement”.

¹⁷⁶ Picture 1 analysis, p.39.

The first example from the report is a picture of a woman speaking with the microphone¹⁷⁷. There is not any caption in the picture. The woman is speaking in the seminar-type of context. The picture is taken from the perspective of the audience, and the viewer is put in a position that he/she can identify him/herself with the audience. Faces of the audience are not shown, we can only see the face of the woman. With this picture FIFA has given space for an un-named 'civilian' woman, to show in the spotlight, which indicates the cooperation of FIFA with the 'civilians'. The representation of the woman also shows that the environmental work is not only business done by men.

In the second picture¹⁷⁸ from the same section of the same report there are four men sitting. Again, there is no caption within the picture. The men seem to be listening something, maybe a presentation. One of the men is writing something on a paper, possibly making notes. One man in the back is not watching to the point where the picture is taken from, but two others seem to be concentrated on the presentation.

The main message of these two pictures is to show how the 'civilian' people are working for the environmental sustainability campaign of FIFA. People are speaking and listening in conference rooms. These seminars seem to be very official, because persons have patches around in their necks. Pictures are also highlighting that a lot of planning-work is done within the environmental campaign. Planning is of course an important aspect of the environmental work, but are there any pictures showing the concrete environmental actions taking place?

The next example shows one example of this concrete environmental work. The photograph¹⁷⁹ is an illustration of a news story published in June 2011. The title is once again the most eye catching text that participates in the framing process. The title declares: "Arena Pantanal construction to be carbon neutral". This title immediately links the picture with the carbon emission reducing programme of FIFA. The caption (again, revealed when the mouse is dragged and kept over the picture) simply says that "Girl plants tree seedling". When the news story is read forwards, FIFA tells that the tree planting is made to compensate the carbon emissions caused by the stadium project. FIFA is financially supporting the tree-planting project, locals are doing the concrete work.

¹⁷⁷ Picture 8: Seminar speech.

¹⁷⁸ Picture 9: Men in Seminar.

¹⁷⁹ Picture 10: Planting Trees – Looking Good.

What is important is that this photograph is showing how ‘civilians’, local people of Brazil are concretely participating in the environmental sustainability campaign of FIFA. The picture of the happy woman makes it difficult to criticize the environmental campaign of FIFA. Local people seem to be participating in the environmental campaign of FIFA and seem to enjoy it. However, it would be too easy to pass this picture by just saying that it is just perfect. What we do not see in the picture are the structures of the whole environmental programme. As studied before, a high amount of the corporate environmental developmental projects that utilize sport as a context include so called ‘astroturf’ organizations, which means that these seemingly grass root organizations working for the corporate campaign are actually faux-grass root organizations, not raising from grass root-level, but being actually launched by a corporate initiative.¹⁸⁰

Based on this particular picture it is impossible to say if that is the case here, but it is important to recognize this possibility. Everything is not what it seems and picture can lie more than thousand words. And there is at least one thing that is not seen in the picture, the concrete cooperation between FIFA and the local level. The ‘men of FIFA’ and ‘civilians’ are kept apart and not shown together.

The same pattern can be spotted in other pictures introducing ‘civilians’ that are working for the environmental campaign of FIFA. A special photograph report about the carbon offsetting programme of FIFA includes these kind of pictures that introduces carbon emission reducing programmes, as well as Brazilian people working for the environmental-friendly projects funded by the carbon offsetting programme of FIFA. The following three pictures are all from the same photograph-report published in *fifa.com*¹⁸¹.

The first picture¹⁸² shows women working in the factory-circumstances. The caption says: “Women working in ceramics factory in Tocantins that implements a low carbon project.” It is remarkable that FIFA has shown women working for the campaign. However, the picture does not show faces of women, which makes the women of the picture not that easy to identify with. Women are more

¹⁸⁰ Miller 2016, 2.

¹⁸¹ <http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/photos/galleries/y=2014/m=6/gallery=2014-fwc-carbon-offsetting-programme-2379610.html#> (Visited 10.5.2016).

¹⁸² Picture 11: Women in a Factory.

shown as utilizers of the technology of the factor, which is described to be a green one. The role of green technology stays on the framing-agenda of FIFA.

In the second picture¹⁸³ of the report, there are four people standing in the picture, in the front of a green building. Now the faces of people can be seen. Everyone, three men and a woman, have green shirts. Thus, the color of nature, green, is at least well-represented. In this picture, all the people are very passive. People are not shown to work actively for the environment, they are just represented to pose for the camera in the front of their “site office”. In the third picture¹⁸⁴ of the report, a Brazilian man is posing to the camera next to the ceramics firing oven. He keeps the door of the oven open so it can be seen how the firing oven is working. The man has earmuffs, helmet and safety glasses, which gives a well-controlled and professional image. Once again, technology is shown as a loyal servant of the sustainability programme of FIFA.

All of these pictures are representing ‘civilians’ that are participating in the carbon emission offsetting programme of FIFA. The role of green technology is clearly made salient. When first looked, there is nothing straightforwardly wrong in these pictures, and they are very neutral. FIFA is clearly being very careful with the visual publications. However, one can ask if these pictures are almost too un-informative? What is actually happening in these factories? How long do the funding of FIFA last? Should there be more signs of the active co-operation with FIFA? Could there have been some pictures where the officials of FIFA are visiting these places that are funded and supported by FIFA? The whole picture report leaves many open questions and a feeling that these pictures are loose and disconnected to FIFA. They are just happening without anyone monitoring these processes. It is also interesting to ask why FIFA and all the sponsors did not want to be seen on this grass-root-level context.

In contrast, in the urban context, sponsors started to show. The previous examples were all related to carbon emission control programme of FIFA. The other sector where ‘civilians’ were shown to work concretely for the environment was the waste management sector. In contrast to the carbon emission programme, the waste-management theme was completely located in the urban milieu.

¹⁸³ Picture 12: Green but Passive.

¹⁸⁴ Picture 13: Man and the oven.

My example of these pictures is the picture that represents workers of the waste management campaign¹⁸⁵. This picture was published in November 2013. It is a picture of two women and three men standing next to trash bins. The title of the picture links the illustration with the environmental campaign of FIFA: “Waste management policy shows social and environmental focus of World Cup”. The caption is revealed when the mouse is dragged over the photograph. It says: “Volunteers and workers from local cooperatives who were part of the waste management activities in the FIFA Confederations Cup.” Based on the caption, these two women and three men have participated in realizing the waste management campaign of FIFA.

When we look at picture closer, we can see that the workers of the campaign are dressed in the colors of FIFA Confederations Cup 2013 and Coca-Cola. Two workers on the left are wearing Coke-shirts, while three others are wearing shirts of FIFA. The picture has been taken at the moment when workers are not doing anything else than posing for the camera. Next to the workers, there are two waste collectors with Coca-Cola logos, which seem also to be posing for the camera. The trash bin on the right side is transparent, which makes it easy to see that there truly are bottles in the bin – the campaign is working.

The picture is a great example of the showing policy of FIFA. ‘Civilians’ are represented to participate to the concrete actions of the environmental campaign. Which is remarkable in this representation is that the purpose of this particular photograph seems to be that the close and friendly cooperation in the waste management programme is represented in a way that not particularly the cooperation between the ‘civilians’ and FIFA, but rather between FIFA and FIFA’s partners (here, Coca-Cola) is highlighted. The locals are the ‘tools’ that bring these organizations together to work with the environment. Why the cooperation between the locals and FIFA was not shown on personal level if it existed? Why there was no FIFA-officials in pictures with the ‘civilians’?

Another example of the participation of the ‘civilians’ shows how FIFA is willing to take the full advantage of environmentally eager Brazilian citizens. This photograph¹⁸⁶ is a picture of a smiling woman, standing next to cloths and bags. The title of the picture says that “Workers' uniforms recycled to raise funds for charitable cause”. The caption is again revealed only when the mouse is

¹⁸⁵ Picture 14: Wastes, Coke and FIFA.

¹⁸⁶ Picture 15: Tatiane Soares.

dragged over the photograph. The caption is written in Portuguese and it says that “Tatiane Santana, colaboradora da Arena Fonte Nova, mostra os produtos feitos com os uniformes dos operários reciclados”.¹⁸⁷

It is at least questionable that Tatiane Santana is used by FIFA in this way, because what is found when the news text itself is read that “And while this project does not come under the direct auspices of FIFA or the 2014 FIFA World Cup Brazil™ Organising Committee (LOC), it remains perfectly in line with the issue of waste and recycling, a crucial part of the overall strategy for Brazil 2014.” FIFA reveals the true nature of the illustration but with the title and the caption it already manages to frame the project to belong to their campaign, taking the credits of the environmentally sustainable actions of this smiling Brazilian woman. It is also good to remember that this rather small project is not enough to compensate the resource-use of the massive World Cup–event.

As we can see, FIFA connected the environmental campaign with Brazilian people. Visualizations show people in conference rooms speaking and listening to these speeches – planning the environmental campaign. ‘Civilian’ people participating in concrete environmental actions are mostly shown in relation with two themes familiar from the official environmental campaign of FIFA: battling against carbon emissions and working for the waste management programme. The people working for the offsetting the carbon emissions were shown in more non-urban circumstances, while the planning and waste collection was shown in urban milieus. The waste management-theme was closely linked to the stadiums, and signs of corporate partners of FIFA were visible in these pictures. The most striking ‘void’, I would say, was that the personnel of FIFA and these locals were not shown together. The link between the football federation and the ‘civilian’ environmental actions was not represented especially in pictures of carbon offsetting programme. In one picture FIFA was also using the environmental enthusiasm of the Brazilians to polish its own image and the public environmental image of the World Cup.

Because of the mentioned ‘void’ in showing the ‘civilians’ and FIFA-officials, the next sub-chapter will be analyzing how these governing officials of FIFA were shown. The governance of the

¹⁸⁷ Tatiane Santana, collaborator of the Arena Fonte Nova, shows products made with recycled uniforms of workers.

environmental campaign, and people in charge of the governance, were shown big in volume, and thus, the next chapter will introduce these ‘men of FIFA’.

4.2 ‘The Men of FIFA’

The governance and the monitoring of the sustainability campaign of FIFA was an important theme for the football federation. The importance of the governance and the control of the environmental campaign was also seen in the visual material of FIFA because of the massive volume of the photographs representing the governing people. In the Sustainability Report, FIFA explains how the governance of the campaign was realized:

“The sustainability efforts of the FIFA World Cup are guided by the principles of accountability, transparency, ethical behaviour and respect for stakeholder interests, the rule of law, international norms of behaviour and human rights. Furthermore, FIFA and the LOC aim to leave a positive legacy in the host country.”¹⁸⁸

The integration of different stakeholders, also on a local level, and transparency in decision making are themes that are also supported by ideas of sustainable environmental peace. If thinking the locational context, the official environmental political enthusiasm of Brazil should have offered a fertile soil for FIFA to integrate the local level to its campaign. At the same time, the official governance principles of FIFA give a promising base for a comprehensive environmental governance that could utilize local expertise and recognize local needs.

Interestingly, photographs of the governance of FIFA construct a very different kind of image about the environmental governance of FIFA than FIFA has written about. In the visual material of FIFA, the governance of the sustainability campaign was personified almost completely on well-dressed men, ‘the men of FIFA’, who FIFA had named to be responsible for the environmental campaign. First, without forgetting football and Brazil, the Brazilian legendary ex-football player, Ronaldo Luiz Nazário de Lima, known as “Ronaldo” was one of these persons named to monitor and control the campaign of FIFA. Second person that gave his face to the campaign of FIFA was Jerome Valcke¹⁸⁹, known as the Secretary General of FIFA since 2007. Thirdly, the head of FIFA Corporate Social Responsibility, Federico Addiechi, was often seen in environment-governance related illustrations.

¹⁸⁸ FIFA Sustainability Report 2014, 23.

¹⁸⁹ Jerome Valcke has also been part of the current corruption scandal of FIFA, which came to daylight in 2015. Valcke got dismissed from his position in the 13th of January 2016.

The first example of these pictures is a series of pictures published in September 2011 within the news article.¹⁹⁰ The title of the article says: “Sustainability the Goal for Brazil 2014”. The caption says that “Seminar on sustainability in Manaus, Brazil”. Texts frame pictures to be about the sustainability issues in Brazil 2014 World Cup. There was a seminar held in one of the host cities, Manaus, and this is where the pictures are taken from. The first picture of the series shows how Federico Addiechi is speaking. On the background, there is a poster that says in Portuguese “Sustentabilidade e legado Copa 2014”, which means sustainability and legacy of World Cup 2014. In this poster, there is lot of green color and different plants seen. On the background of the poster, there is also an urban landscape, which again connects the nature to urban. Including this poster to the picture links the seminar visually to environment in a way that FIFA has linked it in its campaign.

Addiechi seems to be speaking to the audience even though the audience is not shown in the picture. A viewer recognizes the situation and complements the picture by assuming that there is an audience. The picture is taken from a perspective that the viewer is positioned to be part of the audience. There are two other people in the front of the assumed audience. These persons are not introduced, but the other one is woman, which is remarkable because men are clearly seen more in visualizations of FIFA’s environmental campaign governance. However, the woman is in a very passive role in the picture, and her role is not described.

Based on the picture it seems that the seminar is taking the form of a traditional press-conference. Addiechi and the two other persons are sitting in the front of the audience and in the front of their personal microphones. What is interesting that there are other three illustrations for this news article of FIFA, and they are all showing Addiechi in a very similar way, speaking with the microphone. The environment-related poster is in the background of every photograph. Thus, the sustainability campaign is visually strongly linked to environment, and Addiechi, a high-ranked official of FIFA, is strongly linked to this campaign. Addiechi is shown in all of the pictures of the news story, speaking to the audience. These pictures emphasize the important role and powerful position of Addiechi.

¹⁹⁰ Picture 16: Addiechi Speaking.

The other example comes, too, from the illustration of a news story, published in June 2012.¹⁹¹ In this picture, there is Addiechi with two other men in suits. The man in the most left is the executive secretary of the Brazil's Ministry of Sport, Luis Fernandes, which is revealed in the caption. The man in the middle is not introduced. The photograph is taken from a low perspective, making viewer to look up the persons of the picture. This usually emphasizes the power and strength of the people illustrated in the picture.

What is interesting in this picture is that when we look the background, we can see the UN-logos on the wall. We also see the logo of the "Governo Federal Brasil", and Rio+20 Conference. The text actually reveals that the discussion illustrated in the photo was taking place at the UN-conference. The linkage with UN and Brazil is built not only in text, but also visually. FIFA shows how it has, in cooperation with the government of Brazil, participated in the global sustainability conference arranged by UN.

This picture illustrates well how FIFA has represented the governance of the sustainability campaign: environmental sustainability is showed to be planned by well-dressed and high-ranked male-officers. Like in this picture, concrete environmental actions conducted by these officers are not visualized in the publications of FIFA. FIFA has focused more on showing how these high-ranked men are talking about environmental campaign together. In this particular picture, Luis Fernandes is talking actively, and Addiechi of FIFA is concentrated on listening what Fernandes says. The picture is framing the governance in a way that FIFA is not only talking, but is also capable of listening what the government of Brazil is saying. This was exceptional because in most photographs FIFA-officials were illustrated to take the active role of a speaker.

One of the most visible themes of the environmental sustainability governance was the monitoring of the environmental campaign. The showing of these monitoring tasks was mostly culminated on two persons of the football federation¹⁹²: on Ronaldo, which was a member of the LOC of the World Cup, and on the secretary general of FIFA, Jerome Valcke.

¹⁹¹ Picture 17: FIFA, Brazilian Government and UN. <http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2012/m=6/news=brazil-set-new-sustainability-standard-1653133.html> Visited 28.4.2016.

¹⁹² Because the LOC of the World Cup was funded and organized by FIFA, it is difficult to make difference between FIFA and the LOC. This is why I will treat governing members of LOC as same as governing members of FIFA.

In the first example picture¹⁹³, which is published in June 2012 within a photograph report, the close and inseparable relations between the governing members of FIFA and LOC are illustrated in a very clear way. In this picture, as the caption of the picture declares, Ronaldo, Valcke and Bebeto¹⁹⁴ are visiting one site of the World Cup, Recife. The picture delivers a strong message about the close and friendly relation between Ronaldo of LOC and Valcke of FIFA. These two men seem to be like best friends when they smile and hug each other in an extremely relaxed way.

When continuing to view the photograph report, Valcke, Ronaldo and Bebeto start to take their central and powerful positions. Especially the representation is emphasizing their powerful position and high value. Ronaldo is for example shown¹⁹⁵ from low camera angle, which is a typical manner to show a person to be very powerful. In other picture¹⁹⁶ Ronaldo is shown to play with a football, when Valcke, Bebeto and a group of 'civilians', mainly stadium construction workers, are surrounding Ronaldo and taking photos with their phones. In another picture of the photograph report¹⁹⁷, Bebeto is writing autographs in the shirts of construction workers. These workers seem to be very passionate and extremely happy about this. Thus, the atmosphere in the picture is close to fanatic, when Bebeto alone is facing a mass of fans, which are rushing towards the ex-football star with their hands, shirts and smartphones.

Ronaldo and Valcke continue their monitoring trips in various cities that are preparing to host the World Cup. For an unknown reason, Bebeto is not illustrated as much as these two other men are. In most of the pictures, Ronaldo and Valcke are visiting the construction zones of the World Cup stadiums and texts of news stories tell how they are monitoring different aspects of the stadium building process. One theme is of course the environment. In one picture¹⁹⁸, published in August 2012, Valcke and Ronaldo are in Manaus, smiling together for the camera and looking, according to the title, how FIFA World Cup is flourishing in the rainforest. Day later, in another picture¹⁹⁹ from Manaus, the low camera angle and central positioning of Valcke and Ronaldo among the other officials are once again emphasizing their importance and power. In addition, in this picture Valcke

¹⁹³ Picture 18: Best friends.

¹⁹⁴ José Roberto Gama de Oliveira. He is also a Brazilian football legend.

¹⁹⁵ Picture 19: Mighty Ronaldo.

¹⁹⁶ Picture 20: Center of Attention.

¹⁹⁷ Picture 21: Bebeto and Passionate Fans.

¹⁹⁸ Picture 22: Monitoring the Flourishing Rainforest.

¹⁹⁹ Picture 23: Valcke and Ronaldo, a Powerful duo.

is represented to take an active role by pointing something and this way showing something to others that are looking in the direction where Valcke points and following what Valcke is saying. In an additional picture²⁰⁰ of the monitoring tour, Valcke and Ronaldo are actively looking and pointing something inside a football stadium. In this photograph the two men are not only centers of the attention of the construction site workers, but also of the TV-cameras, which are pointed towards the monitoring tandem.

The monitoring trip, where Ronaldo and Valcke were often represented was not the only context of showing the men of FIFA. As we already saw in the beginning of this sub-chapter, the 'men of FIFA' were seen in seminars and meetings. Another context was the press-conference context. What is interesting is that in these illustrations from the cabinets and conferences, football legends Ronaldo and Bebeto are not shown. In addition, Valcke is not smiling and being relaxed anymore. The overall atmosphere is much more serious and official than in these relaxed monitoring trips. Interestingly, in these more serious pictures the logos of the partners of FIFA are included in.

One example of this is a picture from a news story about a press conference in November 2012²⁰¹. In this picture, Jerome Valcke is again represented, and again from a low-camera angle. Thus, the power-element is still the same. However, Valcke is shown as a more serious person than during the monitoring trips. The picture is taken from a Soccerex-event, which, according to the website of the Soccerex, is an organization that brings business and football together:

“Soccerex has been bringing together the global football industry to network, gain insight and socialize for over 20 years. From daily market insight to events across the globe, we provide a platform to connect your business with the game's key stakeholders. We are committed to growing the beautiful game around the world and our love of football is at the heart of everything we do.”²⁰²

Thus, Valcke is basically speaking in a football-business conference, which is again a sign of the corporate-nature of FIFA. The event is shown to be a very official seminar, and the Valcke is still represented to be strong and powerful. On the left side of the head of Valcke is a logo of IMG, which is a “Global leader in sport, events, media and fashion”.²⁰³ In 2010 IMG Sports Media made a contract with FIFA, which gave rights to IMG to exclusively represent FIFA distribution

²⁰⁰ Picture 24: TV-Attention.

²⁰¹ Picture 25: Serious and Powerful.

²⁰² <https://www.soccerex.com/about>. Visited 13.10.2016.

²⁰³ <http://img.com/home.aspx>. Visited 13.10.2016.

rights for inflight and ship-at-sea market. This all makes it very interesting. In the relaxed pictures with Ronaldo there was no signs of partners present. However, when the signs of partners start to exist, Valcke is suddenly represented as a very official way, being serious yet powerful. Football-business and organizing the World Cup are serious business.

The same serious showing pattern is seen in another picture where the signs of partners, and in this case, sponsors of the Brazil World Cup are present²⁰⁴. In this picture Valcke is not sitting alone. The chief officer of the LOC, José Maria Marin and the executive secretary of the Brazilian Ministry of Sport, Luis Fernandes are sitting on the right side of Valcke. Fernandes is not an officer of FIFA, but as previously stated, Marin is treated in that way because of his position in LOC.

In this picture the camera angle is more neutral, but the central positioning keeps the 'men of FIFA' in power. In addition, Marin is shown to be active, speaking to the audience that can be complemented into the picture by the viewer. In the wall behind the men there is poster of sponsors stating "Juntos num só ritmo", which is the official slogan of the World Cup: All in one rhythm. At least the sponsors and 'men of FIFA' are shown with this slogan. In the pictures of 'civilians', the slogan was not seen.

Two additional pictures show another way how FIFA has represented its hegemony in the power hierarchy. In these picture, 'civilians' are included in, but FIFA, particularly Addiechi in this time, is represented to give prizes and diplomas to the Brazilians selected by FIFA. In the first of these pictures²⁰⁵ Addiechi, with chief members of the LOC is granting a certificate to a Brazilian woman that has worked for the environmental campaign of FIFA. Everyone is smiling and looking happy. In another picture, Addiechi is posing with a Brazilian man and woman, who have won the tickets to the World Cup final through the lottery of the Carbon Offsettin Programme of FIFA.²⁰⁶

As seen above, high-ranked personnel, 'men of FIFA', are being illustrated a lot in the material of FIFA. From these men, Ronaldo, a Brazilian player legend, and Jerome Valcke, the secretary general of FIFA, are the most-represented persons. With an analogical visual framing these men are shown

²⁰⁴ Picture 26: Serious Business.

²⁰⁵ Picture 27: Certificate.

²⁰⁶ Picture 28: Winners.

to have the majority of the power in the governance of the World Cup and the sustainability campaign of the cup. Similarly like 'civilians' are shown to discuss with other 'civilians', the 'men of FIFA' are represented to work together. Concrete environmental actions are missing, and the 'men of FIFA' are mostly shown to monitor the environmental campaign and discuss about the campaign. In the pictures representing the 'field work' during the monitoring trips, the image of the 'men of FIFA' is more relaxed, but it still emphasizes the power of the FIFA-men. When shown in press conferences and seminar rooms, where the signs of sponsors and partners of FIFA are present, the atmosphere is more serious. Football-stars are not being visualized in these more serious circumstances.

The 'Men of FIFA' are always represented with visual tools that emphasize their powerful positions. Stylish clothes, close shots, central positions in photographs and even the low camera-angles are emphasizing their strong role. It is also important to recognize the message that the title of this chapter already delivers: men of FIFA were truly *men* of FIFA, and no women are shown in high-level positions of FIFA-governance. Women are more visualized in the picture category of concrete environmental actions of the 'civilians'.

What is still the most striking remark is that there is no concrete environmental cooperation between the 'men of FIFA' and the 'civilians'. This link is at least not visualized in the material of the *fifa.com*. When these 'civilians' are rarely shown in the same pictures with the 'men of FIFA', they are taking photographs of FIFA-officials or receiving prizes from them. This kind of showing policy seems to be strengthening the power hierarchy in a way that the FIFA officials are illustrated to have the ultimate power in organizing the World Cup and different campaigns, including the sustainable environmental campaign, during the World Cup-project. In the whole photograph material, there was only one exceptional picture where one 'man of FIFA' was represented to be one of the 'civilians', we will come to that later in next chapter. Based on the visual material, there is an apparent gap between FIFA-governance and the local level, and FIFA has visually emphasized the powerful governance role of themselves. Sponsors and partners seem to be looming behind these men of inner circle.

The visual perspective is against what FIFA said, because football federation was speaking about including the local level to the sustainability campaign. At least in the visual material published by

FIFA, this was not seen. This showing policy is strengthening the image of the governing of the sustainability campaign to be mostly FIFA-dictated, which was actually the unpleasant truth at least in the previous World Cup in South Africa²⁰⁷. The local cooperation is important for a comprehensive, sustainable and peaceful environmental governance, but FIFA does not manage to represent this in the visual environmental publications.

As we are about to proceed into next chapter, it is necessary to mention that in this current chapter another much-visualized theme was already present. This means the venues of the World Cup, the stadiums. Especially Ronaldo and Jerome Valcke were many times monitoring the success of the World Cup preparations and sustainability campaign particularly in the stadium milieu. In the next chapter, I will talk more about how the stadiums were represented as places, which combined environmental themes promoted by FIFA, and how the most famous stadium of the World Cup became as the ultimate nexus-place not only for the World Cup football, but also for the environmental campaign of FIFA.

5. The World Cup Stadiums as Environmental Nexus Places – Maracanã²⁰⁸ as the Ultimate ‘Flagship’

One of the most visible aspects of the publications of FIFA is the stadium-theme. Interestingly, stadiums are often linked with the environment and the environmental sustainability with texts and illustrations. The stadiums are naturally important theme for the FIFA, because the matches are played in these venues. They become centers of attention because tens of thousands of people are watching the games there. Even more importantly, the eyes of the world are looking the stadiums through the television and online broadcasts. It is not a coincidence that FIFA officially describes green stadiums to be “flagships of the 2014 FIFA World Cup”²⁰⁹.

In this chapter, I will analyze how exactly the indisputable role of the stadiums can be seen in the visual environmental-related publications of FIFA. What environmental aspects are linked to

²⁰⁷ Kolamo 2014, 113.

²⁰⁸ Official name: *Estádio Jornalista Mário Filho*

²⁰⁹ Green Stadiums for the 2014 World Cup. (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/videos/y=2014/m=2/video=green-stadiums-for-the-2014-fifa-world-cup-2275956.html>) Visited 25.5.2016.

stadiums, and how this is done? As a whole, the environmental-related pictures of stadiums were repeating themes seen in other visual publications of FIFA. However, the stadiums brought all these themes together, becoming nexus-places for the environmental campaign of FIFA – just like they become nexus-places for the football actions of the World Cup.

The first example²¹⁰ shows in a very concrete way how stadiums are linked to the environmental campaign of FIFA. This photograph is from the Annual Activity Report 2013. The picture is taken inside the Maracanã-stadium, which is a football stadium in Rio de Janeiro. In World Cup 2014 it served as the stage for the final, increasing its already legendary status²¹¹ in the footballing world. Probably because of this huge symbolic value, Maracanã was the most visualized stadium in the material of FIFA.

In this picture, Maracanã is shown as empty. The sun is shining on the green pitch, which illustrates well how the green color of the football field is actually quite easy to link with 'green' values. Green is also the color of the sustainability section of the report. In addition to green linkage, the blue seats of the stadium seem to merge with the mountains, which are looming on the background of the open-roof stadium. With these colors Maracanã is visually connected with the natural environment. The caption of the picture says: "View of an empty Estadio do Maracanã: some of the water that falls on the roof is collected, filtered and then used in bathrooms". By introducing the already familiar developed green technology, Maracanã is represented as a sustainable and environmental-friendly stadium.

What is even more direct way of linking the stadium with the environmental campaign of FIFA, is the layout of the text-boxes of the photograph. The titles of these three themes are written on the green background. In addition to "Sustainability of Football Stadiums", "Smoke-free Events" and "Waste Management" are both themes that are shown *inside* Maracanã. This frames and defines Maracanã and stadium milieu to be very important for the environmental campaign of FIFA.

²¹⁰ Picture 29: Environmental Campaign inside Maracanã.

²¹¹ It was a stage of World Cup final in 1950. The estimated spectator number then was almost 200 000 people. Brazil lost the final, which was played against Uruguay. The scorer of the winning goal, Alcides Ghiggia has said that there has been three people in the history that have silenced the Maracanã: Pope John Paul II, Frank Sinatra and himself. Maracanã will also be the stage for the opening and ending ceremonies of the Summer Olympic Games 2016.

The second example comes from the Annual Activity Report 2014 and it is a very good example how stadiums are linked with the urban environment that is in close interaction with nature, which is the main frame given for the environment by FIFA. The picture is an illustration of an article about the sustainable FIFA World Cup. There is a big, whole page picture of a stadium and circumstances around the stadium at the page²¹². Caption says that the stadium in the picture is “the Estádio Castelão, which was awarded with the Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED) certification”. However, the most eye catching text is the title, which says: “Staging a more sustainable FIFA World Cup™”. Because of the visible position, the title becomes an important part of the textual framing of the picture. Together with the caption they make a proposition that the FIFA World Cup is staged to be more sustainable and this environmentally sustainable stadium in the picture is a part of it.

Then we look at the picture. The largest part of the picture is clear, blue skies. Some clouds can be seen in the lower corners of the photograph. These clouds make the sky look more natural. Whether the picture is edited or not to make the sky look clear, FIFA has wanted to connect the stadium with the image of clear skies and beautiful weather and give attention to this. We know that polluted air is a major problem in many urban areas of the world and the carbon emissions were a central theme of the UN Millenium Development Goals²¹³. Carbon emissions were also one of the three specific environmental themes of the environmental campaign of FIFA²¹⁴. This image seems to represent that these problems were not seen in the World Cup of Brazil – this is partly because of the sustainable staging actions of FIFA, and environmental friendly, green stadiums.

The stadium itself is seen in the lower part of the image. It seems that lot of people are arriving to the stadium and surrounding it. In this case these people are neither ‘civilians’ working for the environmental campaign nor ‘men of FIFA’, but they are audience of the World Cup. Two people in the lower left corner of the picture seem to be taking photographs – the stadium is framed to be worth of taking photos, or at least the event at the stadium is worth of taking photos and telling others with them that ‘I am here’. As told in previous chapters, showing a person in a picture has been studied to be a very effective way of delivering messages about the products or thoughts,

²¹² Picture 30: Sustainable Stadium.

²¹³ <http://www.unmillenniumproject.org/goals/gti.htm#goal7> (Visited 26.3.2016)

²¹⁴ FIFA Sustainability Report 2014, 44–45.

which are being advertised²¹⁵. Seeing other people in the picture makes the viewer to identify him/herself with the people in the picture. In this picture, there are masses of people coming to the stadium, which emphasizes the popularity of the green stadiums.

Within the stadium-theme FIFA seems to have also believed in another effective way of visual persuasion than showing people in pictures. That is the way of making viewers to build stories. This means that when we look a picture, we do not see only that particular moment, but we start automatically build a background story, and possibly the future, for the moment captured in the picture²¹⁶. By framing this picture with a strong textual proposal, FIFA persuades a viewer to build their version of a story: sustainable staging of the cup and green stadiums are helping to keep sky clear. At least World Cup has been organized in a way that it is not polluting the air.

The picture of a stadium again links urban and nature by combining the blue skies and stadium, which seems to be located in an urban environment; there is a road in the left border of the picture and many buildings can be seen in the horizon. In turn, the symbol of nature is the clear blue sky and clouds. Like stadiums, urban environments are centers where the most actions of football world cups are taking place. However, it needs to be acknowledged that the cities where these stadiums are located receive this huge attention only for a short moment. These places usually become only temporary, well-staged and beforehand planned scenes for FIFA and its partner corporations to promote their own brands and values²¹⁷.

In this picture, at least with the caption, there is a strong propositional message: the clear skies are linked not only with the urban environment, but also with the venue of the World Cup. They are linked not only in the caption, but also visually. The framing function can be again *defining* environment as urban, but in this case the function can also be *solution offering*: Football and the World Cup can be a way for reaching the clear sky and thus, cleaner environment. For building the connection between positive environmental work and football, FIFA does not need to show its own logo in the picture because the stadium links the picture to the football, and the stadium as a

²¹⁵ Look chapter 3.1.

²¹⁶ Hietala 1993, 85–86.

²¹⁷ Kolamo 2015, 81.

representation of football is enough to link the picture to FIFA. In addition, FIFA is mentioned in the title.

Another picture links the stadiums to the environmental campaign of FIFA, but this time without showing people. This picture is an illustration of a news story, published in May, 2012. The picture is a bird-eye perspective photograph of the Maracanã-stadium²¹⁸. As the caption says: “An aerial view of construction work underway on the Maracanã Stadium”. Stadium is shown to be located in an urban landscape. Blocks of flats are surrounding the stadium and there is a rail road in the front of the stadium. This way, the stage of the World Cup final is also linked to urban environment, fitting to the general environmental frames of FIFA.

What is a little bit different in this photo is that the title of the news report links the picture with the energy issues: “Yingli brings solar power the Maracanã”. The urban football stadium is immediately linked with renewable solar energy, which does not cause immediate carbon emissions. FIFA is showing how it is supporting this kind of renewable energy-use on stadiums. The theme of environmental-friendly technology is connected to the urban stadium-theme, as well as the theme of fighting against the carbon-emissions, which was mostly linked with the non-urban representations like Amazon-rainforests.

At the same time, this picture proves how the corporation family behind the organizing of the World Cup works. Stadiums are one context where the partners of FIFA, this time a Chinese solar-panel company Yingli, sneak in the World Cup-business. Yingli, by their own words, “as one of the world's largest solar panel manufacturers”²¹⁹, has received a lot of football-related publicity by joining the partner-family of FIFA²²⁰. What is interesting is that football actually seems to be one central part of the general strategy of the corporation, because on its homepage Yingli uses star-players of one of the biggest clubs of the world, FC Bayern München, to promote its solar panels.²²¹

²¹⁸ Picture 31: Maracanã and Solar Power

²¹⁹ <http://www.yinglisolar.com/en/about/> (Visited 23.5.2016).

²²⁰ More about Yingli-FIFA-contract. “FIFA World Cup Goes Green Again”. (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2011/m=6/news=fifa-world-cuptm-goes-green-once-again-1448277.html>). Visited 20.5.2016)

²²¹ <http://www.yinglisolar.com> (Visited 23.5.2016)

Another illustration of a news story of FIFA, published in the 25th of July 2014, twelve days after the World Cup final, shows another theme of the environmental campaign that was connected with stadium milieu: waste-management²²². In this picture there are two recycling bins at the stadium. The caption is revealed again when the mouse is dragged over the picture. The caption makes sure that the picture is understood correctly: “Waste management in stadiums”. The title also strongly participates in the framing intentions of the picture: “World Cup Waste Management Programme exceeds expectations”. With the frames given by the title and caption, these two visualized recycling bins are representing the successful Waste Management Programme. The illustration makes things concrete and kind of convinces the viewer that these recycling bins really have been in the stadiums and they have served well, “exceeding the expectations”.

The picture is at the same time, again, a very concrete example of the cooperation of the corporation family of FIFA. The recycling bins are decorated with the logos of another global brand, Coca-Cola. This was because Coca-Cola was participating in the waste-management campaign during the World Cup process²²³. Thus, again, the stadium-theme is connecting different aspects of the environmental campaign of FIFA. The stadiums are milieus where the concrete environmental actions of the World Cup organizing-machine are made to be visible. Because the photograph was published after the World Cup was finished, it shows that FIFA was not completely abandoning its environmental campaign immediately after at the end of the World Cup, even though the amount of the environmental material clearly declined.

The last example of this chapter introduces yet another aspect of the environmental campaign that is brought into the stadium context. As seen in the fourth chapter, “Environment and People”, FIFA was showing how people cooperate for the environmental campaign. Many times this cooperation was taking place inside the conference-rooms. However, this picture²²⁴ from the “Final Report of the Sustainability Training Programme for 2014 FIFA World Cup™ Stadium Operators”, visualizes how the stadiums also were a context for this cooperation.

²²² Picture 32: Wastes and Coke.

²²³ Look for example: (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2012/m=11/news=fifa-partner-coca-cola-launches-innovative-sustainability-campaign-brazi-1900720.html>) Visited 24.6.2016 & (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2014/m=7/news=world-cup-waste-management-programme-exceeds-expectations-2408125.html>) Visited 24.6.2016.

²²⁴ Picture 33: Cooperation in Maracanã.

Not that surprisingly, this picture, too, is taken from Maracanã. The symbolic value of the stadium is again used to link the environmental campaign of FIFA with positive connotations. In this picture, participants of the environmental campaign of FIFA are standing inside Maracanã, under the blue sky, which almost merges with the blue seats of the stadium. The sun is shining and everyone seems to be in a good mood and even smiling. Again, the persuasion power of persons is utilized because viewer has the possibility to identify her/himself with the *happy* people of the picture.

What is interesting and totally exceptional in this picture is that it is the only picture representing local level actors, 'civilians', and 'men of FIFA' (man of FIFA) together, and more importantly, as equal. When we look the photograph very closely, we can see that Federico Addiechi of FIFA is standing in the back row. Starting from the left, he is the fourth man in the back row. The most important visual aspect is that Addiechi is represented as one of the 'civilians' in this picture. There is not any barrier or power-hierarchy separation in this picture. It seems that the absolute nucleus of the whole World Cup, the magnificent Maracanã, has been a place for a co-operational climax, where FIFA has been ready to come up with a photograph where the 'men of FIFA' merges with the 'civilians'.

As I have now demonstrated, stadiums visually link many environmental themes that are parts of the general framings of the environmental campaign of FIFA. First, the pictures of stadiums are showing that these venues of the World Cup are located in the urban environment, which is in close relation with nature. Stadiums are shown as places, which not only connect the urban environment and nature, but also become scenes for environmental actions familiar from the official environmental agenda of FIFA; fighting against carbon emissions and against waste problems. As seen in the previous chapter, the monitoring tasks of FIFA were also often represented to happen in the stadium construction sites.

Stadiums are also shown as places for the cooperative work for the sustainability campaign of FIFA. Especially the corporation partners of FIFA are enjoying of the huge visibility of the stadiums. This is seen in the pictures, where for example Coca-Cola and international solar-panel company Yingli were linked with environmental actions in the stadium context. From the perspective of the framing functions, FIFA clearly *defines* stadiums to be important in environmental work. At the same time

FIFA frames stadiums to *offer solutions* for reducing the environmental emissions by framing them to be advanced green-technological constructions.

The stage of the World Cup final, legendary Maracanã of Rio de Janeiro was especially used as a visual nexus place for the environmental campaign of FIFA. Maracanã, with its symbolic value, was shown as a home for waste campaign, for the carbon-emission reducing campaign, for sustainable solar energy and finally, for the cooperation between the 'men of FIFA' and the 'civilians' that are working for the environmental campaign of FIFA. Maracanã was also a very clear cut example of how stadiums were visualized to merge in the urban environment and surrounding natural elements like blue sky and mountains. Especially the visual choice of the colors in the photographs of Maracanã were strengthening this merging. This all makes Maracanã to look to be the ultimate flagship of the environmental-friendly stadium campaign of FIFA.

The stadiums naturally are an important milieu for FIFA because they are centers of the World Cup attention, and this was also recognized and told by FIFA in its material. As seen in the previous studies about environmental impacts of football mega-events, stadiums indeed are an important context for minimizing environmental impacts of the event. In addition, their central status makes them natural contexts for promoting green technology, which is also typical of organizers of mega-level sports events.

However, there are some problems in this. What we need to remember is that stadiums are centers of attention only for a short time. During the one month World Cup actions attention is pointed to stadiums, which undeniably makes it rational for FIFA to promote their values and various campaigns in the stadium-context. Sadly, after the competition is over, stadiums lose their auratic status in many ways: they are not anymore places for FIFA and its corporation partners to promote their products and values. Stadiums lose their status also in promoting environmental aspects and they may become even environmental burden. Thus, the huge monetary investments made for the sustainable stadiums are actually starting to look 'greenwashing'²²⁵, where more funds are directed

²²⁵ *Greenwashing* is disinformation disseminated by an organization so as to present an environmentally responsible public image. —10th edition of the *Concise Oxford English Dictionary*.

to campaigns that make an organization *look good* environmentally, than in actual, long-term environmentally sustainable projects and processes.

Because the environment is seen in a very positive way also in other visualizations of FIFA than in the stadium context, it can be said that the environment and the work done with the environment always *looks good* in the pictures of FIFA. People are cooperating and happy, weather is good and there are no signs of environmental degradation or pollution. In the light of the information about Brazil, there are also environmental problems inside the borders of the vast country. This raises a question was FIFA looking *too good*? Why? Next chapter will look more detailed this question of looking environmentally good and being silent about the environment-related problems, utilizing examples also from other contexts than stadiums.

6. Looking Good, or too Good? – The Visual Silence of FIFA

We have already seen how FIFA has defined the environment. FIFA mostly frames environment to be urban, but still closely linked with nature. The role of green technology has been shown to be important in concrete environmental-friendly actions. Local people have been shown in relation with environmental campaign. We have also seen how the governance of the sustainability campaign was represented: well-dressed ‘men of FIFA’ were shown to have powerful role in monitoring and controlling campaign. The main remark there was that there was a visual vacuum in representing these ‘civilians’ and ‘men of FIFA’ working together. Only one exception broke this and it was the mythical Maracãna-stadium. In addition to this, stadiums had a major overall-role tying multiple environmental frames of FIFA together and showing ‘green’ stadiums as the nexus-places of the environmental campaign of FIFA.

What is remarkable is that within all these categories, the environment and the environmental actions of the campaign of FIFA always look good. There are no problems of any kind: not any kind of visualizations of environmental degradation can be seen. People in the charge of the environmental actions are cooperative and even smiling happily in some pictures. Only people who seem to be in good mood, and milieus that seem to be in good condition, are represented.

From the perspective of comprehensive peaceful implications of the environment, it is refreshing that FIFA frames environment in such a positive way and as a way of cooperation. In addition, it is encouraging that FIFA seems to have acknowledged and shared information about environmental themes that need to be addressed in mega-level football events. Especially for the stadiums FIFA gave a lot of attention. At the same time, FIFA has actively participated in framing process of environmental themes found from global agenda. However, knowing that there are also environment-related challenges in the local context of Brazil, it is important to ask why some of these challenges were not shown at all. Why only good-looking sides were shown? Was FIFA looking *too good* environmentally?

The answer to the why-part of the question can be traced back to the background of FIFA. As it is clear at this phase, FIFA is a transnational corporation family, which is very closely linked to private sector with its international corporate partners, including global brands like Coca-Cola and Hyundai, which were seen in examples above. Because of this, FIFA has to be very careful about its brand image – these partners are funding the actions of FIFA and they also want to use World Cup as a social license for strengthening their positive brand-image. These pressures can be very significant when FIFA plans its environmental campaigns. More difficult themes, which bear the possibility to look distracting and un-successful, are left out from the agenda of FIFA. Safe themes that are easy to show and make look good in the context of the host country and in the context of football seem to have been preferred. Visual perspectives seem to have been chosen in a way that even potential controversial themes have been shown in a positive, or at least in the neutral, light.

For the question about was FIFA looking environmentally *too good* in Brazil, I will answer by using examples. I will show visual representations from the environmental campaign, where FIFA is not showing the other side(s) of the coin. This means that at a first glance these pictures look to bear very environmental-friendly message, but when analyzed more detailed, they start to look only tricks that make the football federation look greener than it really is. These are moments when FIFA uses the power of silence in the frame-building process by leaving certain topics out of their visualizations. However, a little bit more careful analysis of these pictures breaks this silence and changes it at least to whispering by disclosing backgrounds that these visualizations are linked with.

The first example is the photograph of the mascot, *Fuleco*²²⁶. As FIFA has said, *Fuleco* symbolizes the linkage between environmental concerns, ecology and football. The photograph²²⁷ itself is quite modest. It simply shows *Fuleco* standing at a football stadium construction site. In this sense, it is also a very good example how visual material can look technically very modest, but when starting to consider the structures behind the representation, the picture suddenly starts to look very interesting. From this point of view, this picture is also a very good example of my methodological perspective. Looking the hidden structures behind the pictures is important, because these kind of 'silent' pictures are also strong, when affecting on viewers' constructions about the reality.

The picture of *Fuleco* is placed in the end of the "Building a Better World"-section of the Annual Activity Report 2014. There is no caption or any other textual guide for the picture. Text is only seen in the picture itself, where *Fuleco* is wearing a shirt with the text: "2014 FIFA World Cup Brazil". As a symbol for the link between sport and environment, *Fuleco* kind of concludes the chapter of the report. It reminds how FIFA was thinking the environment during the World Cup-process because *Fuleco* itself is a visual symbol for the environment-friendliness. However, what FIFA actually did, was that it used three-banded armadillo as a visual symbol for their environmental campaign, like in this photograph, totally forgetting the endangered species itself²²⁸. FIFA clearly uses *Fuleco* to *look environmentally good*.

Example of looking *too good* can also be the already introduced picture of the rainforest²²⁹, which in a first place is just one aspect of the vulnerable natural environments of Brazil. In the bird's-eye perspective photograph of the rainforest area FIFA connects with text the environmental protection and struggles to reduce carbon emissions to *Amazon*, but FIFA does not show any pictures where the rainforest has been hacked down or damaged in some other way. FIFA introduces the rainforest theme, but is careful not to link any negative visual connotations with it. It is a very good example how framing can be done with the power of not showing something. Rainforest is shown to be important, but the degradation of the rainforest itself has not been acknowledged.

²²⁶ *Fuleco*-word comes from the mix of the words 'futebol' and 'ecologia'. The mascot took a form of endangered Brazilian three-banded armadillo (*Tolypeutes tricinctus*).

²²⁷ Picture 34: *Fuleco*.

²²⁸ Melo, Siqueira, Santos, Álvares-da-Silva, Ceballos & Bernard 2014.

²²⁹ Picture 35: Amazon Rainforests.

Third example of a too good look of the visual environmental campaign of FIFA is the picture of Maracanã-stadium in Rio de Janeiro. This photograph can be found from the World Cup 2014 carbon emission report²³⁰. The picture is at the same time a great example of very simple, technical framing, which is still quite difficult to recognize without more time-consuming work or special knowledge about the local context. The picture again represents the urban environment, but one problematic aspect of urban environments, which is recognized on the global and on the local Brazilian level, is framed out. The picture is taken from a perspective that does not show the nearby *favela* neighborhood of *Mangueira*, which is located next to Maracanã²³¹.

It is surprising, because making the living conditions of slum-dwellers was one specified theme also in the UN Millenium Development Goals²³². In addition, this theme is very hot topic in Brazil, where *favelas*²³³ have been, and they still are, scenes for long-term social conflicts. These conflicts also have their environmental dimensions because some underdeveloped *favelas* lack sanitation, clean water and proper health care. As *favelas* are particularly an urban phenomenon, it would have been easy for FIFA to visualize them, especially when they are located as close to the much-visualized and symbolic Maracanã, like *Mangueira* is. Maybe the showing of *favela* with Maracanã would have linked the stadium with too negative connotations. Importantly, the example that I used here was not the only Maracanã visualization without *Mangueira*, but *Mangueira* was framed out from all of the photographs of the selected material that were representing the stadium.

The ignorance of *favelas* becomes quite interesting when putting the theme in a larger context. Since the first *favelas* were established, they have been “rejected by ‘formal’ city and have continually been threatened with destruction”²³⁴. However, *favelas* have been, and are still, growing in size. Attempts in local politics of Rio de Janeiro have been made to actively restrict *favelas* to grow. For example in 2009, a project of building concrete walls around *favelas*, was launched. The reason was to manage the uncontrolled (urban) growth of *favelas* and protect the natural environment, and at the same time control the drug trafficking. Some locals, interestingly, argued

²³⁰ Picture 36: Maracanã without *Favela*.

²³¹ Look for example Google Maps: *Mangueira*, Rio de Janeiro.

²³² Target 11 of the MDG 7: “Have achieved by 2020 a significant improvement in the lives of at least 100 million slum dwellers”.

²³³ The term *favela* is used here, but it is important to remember that there is no one single prototype of *favela*. Every *favela* has its own characters and standards of living.

²³⁴ Perlman 2009, 26.

that these walls were built to hide *favelas* because of the upcoming football World Cup and the Olympic Games in the city.²³⁵ In addition, the people of *favelas* have still a stigma of being in marginal even though they have been proved to intertwine with the ‘formal’ city and its functions. Thus, people of *favelas* are not in a margin concretely. However, living in *favela* is the biggest basis of negative stigma and social exclusion in Rio de Janeiro²³⁶ and thus, this structure can be seen as social inequality and structural violence.²³⁷

To continue about *favelas*, I found only one picture from all the environment-related visual material that illustrates *favela*-theme. This picture was found from the section of “GRI-Index and Assurance” of the Sustainability Report. The picture, being one page and a half, shows the landscape from the coast of Rio de Janeiro²³⁸. There is sea, green forest and mountains – natural symbols of urban environment of Rio. Based on the landmarks of the picture, the illustration shows how the *favela* of *Vidigal* is in the middle of this gorgeous natural landscape. There is no denying that the picture shows the *favela*-theme, but like the previous example of the Amazonia, it shows it in very positive light. Problems are not shown when the perspective is kept on general level, not going too much in the details. *Favela* does not look that bad or ugly place in the picture. It does not look to sprawl totally uncontrolled and hurt the environment. As if to make sure that *favelas* have nothing to do with FIFA, there is not any visual link to football in the picture. By this showing politics of *favelas*, FIFA joins to the longer and wider structurally violence tradition of shutting the *favelas* to margin and making them invisible.

As a fourth, and final example, to make my point clear, we can take another, already introduced picture from the city of Rio de Janeiro that shows the landscape of the city²³⁹. Like the rainforest picture and picture of *favela*, the picture of the ‘capital’ of the World Cup actions shows things from a bird-eye-perspective. It introduces the theme of urban environments, but staying on the aerial level, it does not go into details. Using this perspective makes it easier to avoid unpleasant details of Rio. Polluted waters can be mentioned as a one example, which would have been a theme arising

²³⁵ Perlman 2009, 27.

²³⁶ Much because of the *marginal* of people in *favelas* practice drug-trafficking and violence.

²³⁷ Perlman 149–162.

²³⁸ Picture 38: A Beautiful *Favela*.

²³⁹ Picture 39: Rio de Janeiro from the bird’s-eye perspective.

from both, global and local, Brazilian, environmental agendas. For example the coastal waters of Rio are heavily polluted by insufficient quality of the sanitation system of the city.

Even bigger reason for the water pollution is the industrial pollution on coastal zones of Rio that has dramatically affected the pollution of the *Guanabara*-bay in the area of Rio. In 2006 Guanabara Bay received 465 tons of sewage and only 68 tons of these waters were treated, most of them only with primary methods. Because of the high amount of the industry along the coast, Guanabara Bay received also industrial waste: organic material, heavy metals (chrome, lead, mercury, zinc etc.) and oil.²⁴⁰ Problem that is still existing in 2016²⁴¹ has not received any space in the visual publications of FIFA. In sum, it looks that the natural beauty and symbolic value of the main stage of the World Cup, Rio, are being used to polish the image of FIFA, while more 'ugly' and problematic themes are not visualized and included in the environmental campaign.

As a whole, it is good that FIFA has framed environmental themes very positively, but this does not have to mean that showing the environment-related problems should be totally left out. Before-after style showing of environmental problems could have been very effective way of showing how the football federation is concretely investing in environmental dimension. Possibly the risks of looking unsuccessful were too big based on the maintaining of the brand image of FIFA, and on the pressures coming outside from the business-partners of FIFA. Thus, FIFA does frame environment with a very positive manner, to be a way of cooperation, but the visualizations of environmental campaign seem to maintain structural problems without going deeper into the *local* context and without understanding the *local* environmental concerns more comprehensively. FIFA seems more to be *introducing* the diverse environmental context of Brazil than really focusing on *what might be wrong* with that diverse environmental context.

The global agenda of environmental challenges was clearly recognized, but the showing policy of FIFA seems to be more focused on introducing these problematic and controversial themes than offering concrete, solution-offering proposals for these challenges. This gives at least for the *visual image* of the environmental campaign of FIFA a slight label of greenwashing: it seems that the most

²⁴⁰ Carneiro da Silva & Ribeiro 2006, 467.

²⁴¹ The Guardian: Ex-World Sailing chief 'voted out for trying to oust polluted Olympic venue' (<https://www.theguardian.com/sport/2016/jan/26/world-sailing-polluted-olympic-venue-guanabara-bay-peter-sowrey>) Visited 27.5.2016.

important task has been to maintain the positive image of FIFA's corporation family, football and environment – environment has been used to make FIFA and the World Cup *look good*, and not the other way around.

What is important to understand is that FIFA uses very careful and subtle ways in its environmental campaign. FIFA does not give a biased information in its clearest meaning, but with the visual *framing decisions* made in its environmental campaign, it manages to frame out all the possible negative connotations of different themes like *Fuleco*, stadiums, rainforests and urban environments with *favelas*. This framing out of things is done by selecting the perspective to be on the bird's-eye level, or by simply just selecting the direction where the picture is taken from, which are very simple visual ways of participating in environmental frame-building processes.

7. Conclusions

In this thesis I wanted to show that alternative contexts should be recognized, when trying to understand the complex global environmental governance. The aim of this thesis was to show how transnational corporate-organizations, which are economic, political and communicational powers having their own values, goals and motives, can bring their voices to the environmental discussions directly via their own publication channels. By doing this, they can participate in the process of framing the environment and the politicized environmental discussions. This, in turn, is an important theme when discussing about the sustainable development and the future of positive environmental peace. In this thesis the context was a rather special one, the international popular sports.

Popular mega-level sports events receive a huge global attention and they are scenes for different stakeholders to participate in multiple discussions. Because of the more central role of the environment in world culture and world politics, global mega-level sports events have also become scenes for politicized environmental topics. Almost an un-matched publicity makes these media-events excellent places for various campaigns to promote also environmental aspects. In this thesis the focus was on the main organizer of the World Cup; on the economically and politically powerful transnational corporation family of FIFA. The purpose was to look how and why FIFA represented

and framed the environment in its visual publications related to the World Cup in Brazil 2014 as it did. All the visual publications were found from the official website of FIFA, the *fifa.com*.

Visual material was selected as the primary source because there is a need for a better understanding, and for more multidisciplinary discussions, about the use and the effectivity of visual material. Visual material, like photographs and videos, is continuously being used more in media channels, but we still lack tools and skills to look visual representations critically. Since previous studies have declared that visual material can be highly effective in frame-building processes, camouflaging sensitive values and ideas, it is important to develop the academic discussions about the power of visual. Environmental corporate-organizational publications offer a current, understudied and thus, an important context for these discussions.

Environment-philosophically this thesis adopted the perspective of anthropocenic thinking. This means that I agreed with the idea that we people are affecting the environment of the Earth. More detailed, my environmental perspective was building on the academic perspectives of environmental peace and conflict studies. Acknowledging that the environment can contribute on both, on conflict and on peaceful cooperation, I looked the material of FIFA from this point of view. In addition to this, the ideas of comprehensive and sustainable positive peace formation, and recognizing the important global-local connection in this process, were themes that I was looking from the visual publications of FIFA.

In this thesis the perspective was limited so that the violence was thought to occur through the structures of the society, in a form of in-equality and unbalanced power structures. Based on the previous studies about how the corporation family of FIFA uses the World Cup as an event for polishing its brand-image, there was a certain need for looking critically the environmental campaign of the football federation. Was the campaign of FIFA really looking to be planned for the good of the environment, or was the environment rather another context for FIFA to make itself look good? Thus, it also became important to ask what FIFA was *not showing* and why.

Environmental peace and conflict studies also helped me to understand the role of environment in politics. The literature offered a theoretical linkage for understanding what kind of environmental political discussions FIFA can participate, or what kind of discussions it should participate if it wants

to represent itself as an environmental-friendly and responsible organization. The fundamental debates about the environmental framing, what kind of environment, or what stakeholders should be acknowledged in environmental discussions, were recognized.

In the actual analysis process, the methodology of history and my chosen approach towards the visual material came close to each other. The purpose of my visual analysis was not just to focus on the technical and the aesthetical aspects of illustrations, but to understand what kind of social structures might be hiding behind these visual representations. Contemporary historical approach came quite close to this emphasizing the importance of understanding the context and looking the primary source critically. The gathering of background information of the primary source and its publisher became important.

As said, all the visual material was found from the official website of FIFA, the *fifa.com*. Since the photographs were the most used type of visual material, I decided to focus on them. The photographs were found from environmental news reports and from the official environmental documents published by FIFA. In this material selection process, the search engine of the *fifa.com* was a very helpful tool. With the search engine I was able to limit the amount of the material. The search of environmental publications was based on the texts like captions and titles, and this was the first reason that these texts that were guiding the looking were commented in my analysis. Furthermore, in many pictures the text was closely intertwined with the picture, which actually made the text a part of the visual. Texts were impossible *not to see*. FIFA clearly wanted to guide the looking with the texts. Because of all this, the texts are commented. However, the main focus of the analysis was clearly on visual.

In my analysis, four main themes arose from the visual material of FIFA. Each theme was analyzed in its own chapter. Those themes were 'FIFA defining the environment', 'Environment and people', 'World Cup stadiums as environmental nexus places' and then 'Looking Good, or too Good?', addressing the FIFA's policies of not showing. With this material driven approach I thought I could best bring the perspective of FIFA in the center. However, I tied my findings on the ideas of environmental peace and conflict studies, on the theories of organizational environmental communications and on the social sciences of football. These latter two helped me to analyze my

examples and to spot environmental themes and trends that are typical of the context of football and of more general corporate environmental communications.

I will next conclude my findings based on the examples shown in the chapters of the thesis. I will first give a short conclusions about each thematic category, and finally make the final conclusions on the visual environmental perspective of FIFA. In other words, I will answer questions of how was FIFA framing the environment visually and why, what was left out and why and, finally, how was the visual environmental framing of FIFA contributing with the ideas of positive environmental peace.

I first looked how FIFA defined the environment. Based on the primary material, in most of the pictures environment was framed to be urban, but close to the natural elements. This urban environment was visually and/or textually connected with football, with the World Cup and with the local context of Brazil, especially with the cities that were acting as the scenes of the cup. However, urban themes were selected in a way that they could strongly be linked to the themes of the global environmental agenda like urban growth management. The role of the urban in environmental protection was a theme that was, by the words of Robert Entman, *selected* and *made salient* by FIFA.

The same pattern of global framing perspective was more strongly seen within the representations of less visualized non-urban environment. FIFA had selected to show only the Amazonia rainforest theme, even though there were also other threatened non-urban areas in Brazil. Deforestation was a one specific theme in UN global agenda, which can be one reason for FIFA to highlight the rainforest-theme. The Amazonia, as the biggest rainforest area of the world, has also symbolic value in the fighting against the global carbon emissions, which was a central theme in the environmental campaign of FIFA, as well as in the UN-global agenda.

The second main theme that arose from the visual material was how FIFA represented people in the publications of the environmental campaign. The showing of people was addressed in two sub-sections. The first sub-section, 'the civilians', addressed the showing of the 'regular' people working for the environmental campaign. The other section was about the visualizing the officials of FIFA, 'the men of FIFA'.

`Civilians´, that were remarkably both men and women, were shown to talk together about the environment in seminar rooms. This way they were shown as participants of the planning process of the environmental campaign. In these seminars `civilians´ had badges, which was one signal to make the seminars look official. In addition to these planning-seminars, `civilians´ were also shown to work concretely for the environment and for the environmental campaign of FIFA. Local people were shown to plant trees, to collect wastes and to work in the factories supported by the carbon emission reducing programme of FIFA. Overall, the technology was represented as an important and effective way when trying to achieve success in environmental sustainability.

Through the `civilians´-theme FIFA also promoted the cooperation with its partners, as it was seen in picture where FIFA and Coca-Cola were represented to cooperate. Interestingly, the sponsor-cooperation was only represented in the urban circumstances, which received the biggest share of the media-attention. Unlike the close linkages with sponsors, the concrete and close connection between FIFA and the `civilians´ was not represented visually. Some pictures of people were very un-informative, making it difficult to locate their connections with the campaign of FIFA.

If the roles of the `civilians´ were represented diversely, the same did not apply to the other group of people, to the `Men of FIFA´. These FIFA-officials, being really just men, were visualized in two ways: first, speaking and representing FIFA in different seminars and press conferences and secondly, monitoring concrete work in the field. The representation was heavily personified on three men. These were Jerome Valcke, Ronaldo and Federico Addiechi. The close and friendly connections of these officials were emphasized. The men were also shown to have a powerful and popular status among the `civilians´. The camera-angles were chosen to highlight their powerful status in the World Cup-project hierarchy, and especially Ronaldo and Valcke were many times standing in very central positions, being active and receiving the gazes and the attention of other people and media. The role of Valcke became more important than the role of Ronaldo in the official press conferences. Valcke was still maintaining his powerful position while Ronaldo was not shown to have as central role as Valcke had. However, these press-conferences were more serious business than the field work – the atmosphere was not relaxed. Interestingly, at the same time the sponsors and partners received more visibility in these serious conferences.

As we see, the simplistic showing of the 'men of FIFA' was controversial itself. However, the most problematic remark was that these two groups were actually easy to separate from each other. The high-ranked officials of FIFA were shown together with the 'civilians' only in contexts where the power hierarchy and the monitoring hegemony of FIFA was not threatened. This was seen for example in the picture where Federico Addiechi was giving prizes to civilians. Finally, there was only a *one* picture where a *one* man of FIFA was fully integrated to the 'civilians'. This picture was taken in the scene of the World Cup–final, in the legendary *Maracanã*-stadium.

Acting as the context for a totally exceptional way for showing the 'civilians' and the 'men of FIFA' together, stadiums indeed worked as the ultimate nexus-points of the environmental campaign of FIFA. This was also seen also in other dimensions. That is natural on some level since the stadiums have that same role in the concrete football related actions of the World Cup: they are places where matches are played, and where the most of the global attention is focused on. This can explain why they were nexus-places also for the environmental campaign.

People were working happily at the stadiums, which were represented as the parts of the urban environments, close to the nature, following the more general environmental framing of FIFA. At the same time, stadiums were concretely connected to the themes of the environmental campaign of FIFA, like the wastes management and the reducing of carbon emissions. Stadiums were also places where the partners of FIFA were shown to be participating in the environmental developmental actions. As stated, the governing personnel of FIFA were also monitoring the campaign usually in the stadiums. The environmental-friendly technology was also framed to be very important and effective within the stadium context.

What was interesting was that the stage of the World Cup final, the legendary stadium of Rio de Janeiro, Maracanã, was visualized more than the other stadiums. The symbolic value of the most important venue of the World Cup was clearly captured in the environment-related photographs of FIFA. In general, Maracanã and the other stadiums were places that were made exceptionally and extremely good-looking, like the showing of the 'men of FIFA'-theme and the 'civilian'-theme together proved.

In addition to the stadiums, there were also other contexts where FIFA was looking good. Generally, it can be said that the whole environmental campaign was shown in a very positive light. Polluted or degraded environment was not seen in the visual publications of FIFA even though there were environmental problems in Brazil, and in the cities of Brazil that were the most visible scenes for the cup. This evoked the question if FIFA was looking *too good*. Was there something that FIFA did not show, or shew only with a very limited framing style? One example of this was the use of the mascot, *Fuleco*. FIFA made the endangered armadillo as one of the most visible characters of the World Cup, but no concrete actions were taken for protecting the species itself.

In addition, FIFA was carefully framing both urban and natural environments to look good. Use of the bird's-eye perspective and the simple pattern of framing out the certain parts of the landscape were visual methods used in this. FIFA was really careful not to show any negative connotations regarding to its own actions or football. One concrete example of this was the total blindness for the Brazilian *favelas*, which could have been easily illustrated in much-visualized and media-attention receiving urban environments. The most extreme example was the framing out of the *favela* of *Mangueira* next to the Maracanã, which was the most famous and the most symbolic stadium of the World Cup. By making *favelas* and their problems invisible, FIFA participated in the longer tradition of maintaining social inequality and structural violence by pushing *favelas* and their people to marginal, as it has long been done in the local politics of Rio.

To begin summarizing the most important findings, through its environmental campaign, FIFA was clearly recognizing the environmental themes that are generally familiar in *the context of mega-sports events*, and especially in *football-events*: wastes, transportation, energy-use and introducing developed environmental technology were themes seen also in the visual material of FIFA. *From the corporate communication perspective*, the production promotion (the World Cup is a product of FIFA) and the brand-image enhancement were clearly shining out from the environmental campaign of FIFA. The business-perspective and the signs of the transnational corporation family were seen in photographs where the sponsors and the partners of FIFA were receiving visibility.

The big question is that did the visual environmental campaign finally obey too much this corporate ideology, and was the campaign framed to look greener than it really was? Based on my findings, I argue that it did, and it was. First, the photographs and the layouts in the material of the *fifa.com*

were very carefully constructed, and designed to be very neutral. In the visual publications, FIFA was mainly borrowing the rich environmental circumstances of Brazil for its brand-polishing purposes, staying on a very neutral level. The local environmental themes of Brazil were integrated to the environmental campaign only when they were possible to intertwine with the global environmental agenda and with the most visible scenes of the World Cup. In addition, the environmental topics were chosen by FIFA in a way that they were easy to make look good by staying on a very general level without going too much on the details. When the details could be seen in the visualizations, they were strictly controlled. There was the intersection of global and local, but I would call the perspective of FIFA as *a very selective, corporate-goals-motivated glocal perspective*.

Thus, did FIFA visually contribute to the sustainable and peaceful framing of the environmental development? I argue that in its visual material FIFA is not showing enough its concrete contribution to the environmental challenges of the local, detailed context of Brazil. Because of this, FIFA fails to participate in the comprehensive, sustainable and positively peaceful framing of the environment. It is visualizing general themes and topics on the bird's-eye level, but even despite the massive visualization of governance and monitoring actions, the concrete work, done in cooperation between football federation and local actors, is not represented.

To continue, solving problems requires acknowledging them first. As the comprehensive environmental peace has proven to be complex, not always straight-forward action, it is quite unlikely that FIFA could have managed to formulate true, long-lasting environmental legacy by completely successful, fully controlled and good looking operations. It is even more un-likely when the visual material of FIFA is mirrored against the diverse and problematic environmental context of Brazil.

As a whole, the visual material published by FIFA was strengthening the image that FIFA is a transnational corporation family, which works for selling its product, football, in close co-operation with the sponsors and the partners coming from the corporate-world. The environmental campaign was planned and concretized carefully, acknowledging the status of the World Cup as a massive global visualized media-event. It was clear that the cities and the stadiums, where the eyes of the world were pointed at, were built to 'compress' the environmental framing perspectives of the FIFA-led organization machine behind the World Cup. At the same time, the powerful role of FIFA in the

hierarchy of the World Cup-project was emphasized. These aspects rising from the visual material of FIFA, critically mirrored against the background of the football federation, were proposing that FIFA rather participated in maintaining the structural in-equalities than in the development of sustainable and positive environmental peace.

The visual image of the environmental sustainability campaign was not as green and environmentally responsible as it looks at a first glance. It seems that FIFA selected environmental topics, which were easy to make look good, and which were able to receive a lot of media attention. In addition to this, the milieus were selected in a way that the partners of FIFA were also having possibility to get their share of the massive visibility. This makes sense from a neo-liberal business-oriented perspective, but if the football federation really wants to participate in a positively peaceful environmental development and in building the sustainable, long-term environmental legacy, it should not only be focusing on topics that are easy to make look good in the most visible scenes of the World Cup. The environment should be gaining more from the popularity of the World Cup, and not vice-versa.

Of course, in this process the host country should also be very active, FIFA is not a sole party in the organization-process. Together with the corporation family of FIFA, the host country and its cities should not be afraid to tackle more challenging and complex issues, too. This would mean leaving the neo-liberal, business-oriented short-term thinking behind and consider the environmental work to last longer than just the time that the world's attention is pointed to the World Cup. However, knowing that FIFA has used a dictating policies in previous World Cups, this can of course be very difficult task for the host-country.

At this point I also want to remind that I am not considering FIFA as a 'pure environment-evil'. From a one perspective of environmental peace and conflict studies, it was extremely delightful to see that FIFA framed the environment in a positive light, clearly showing it more as a way for peaceful co-operation than as a source of conflicts and security risks. FIFA was also doing well when addressing the environmental aspects familiar from the context of mega-sports events. The football federation was also clearly promoting the use of green technologies. These are all important aspects and should not be ignored. However, there is still lot to learn if a more comprehensive and equal environmental approach is pursued.

The Brazil World Cup was exceptional because it was the first time when FIFA launched a comprehensive sustainability strategy, including the environmental campaign. However, the analysis of the environmental campaigning of FIFA would also be interesting to reach to the upcoming World Cups, like the 2018 Russia-project or the 2022 Qatar-project, and see what kind of changes or similar patterns there are in different World Cup-contexts. As we live in the world where images can be taken, modified and shared fast by all of us, looking the use of visual material is one very important approach. However, at the same time it is important to say that the evaluation of environmental challenges and possibilities of the World Cup should be studied with diverse styles of approaches, not only limited with the visual communicational perspective. For example, the functions and the possibilities of the host-cities and stadiums, which were found in this study to be nexus-points for different campaigns, could be scrutinized with multi-disciplinary approaches. These studies should also focus on other mega-sports events like the Olympic Games.

Generally, this means that the role and the value of popular sports and mega-sports events, in relation with the environmental development and environmental policies, would be recognized more seriously on the academic level, too. It would mean that the mega-level sports events, which quite exceptionally receive almost an un-matched international attention, are thought more as the scenes for the global environmental governance, where global corporations and global organizations are competing to get their share of the massive international publicity and thus, their share of the possibility to affect the current structures of the world governance. This all would also mean that the biggest of these mega-level sports events, the football World Cup, would be seen as an 'environmental cup', as it was in this research. This would help in the process of making the football World Cup and its main organizer, FIFA, to be green and not just green-looking.

Appendix

Appendix 1 – United Nations Millennium Development Goal number 7

(<http://www.unmillenniumproject.org/goals/gti.htm#goal7>) (Visited 26.3.2016)

Goal 7: Ensure Environmental Sustainability
Target 9. Integrate the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programs and reverse the loss of environmental resources
Indicators 25. Proportion of land area covered by forest (FAO) 26. Ratio of area protected to maintain biological diversity to surface area (UNEP-WCMC) 27. Energy use (kg oil equivalent) per \$1 GDP (PPP) (IEA, World Bank) 28. Carbon dioxide emissions per capita (UNFCCC, UNSD) and consumption of ozone-depleting CFCs (ODP tons) (UNEP-Ozone Secretariat) 29. Proportion of population using solid fuels (WHO)
Target 10. Halve, by 2015, the proportion of people without sustainable access to safe drinking water and basic sanitation
Indicators 30. Proportion of population with sustainable access to an improved water source, urban and rural (UNICEF-WHO) 31. Proportion of population with access to improved sanitation, urban and rural (UNICEF-WHO)
Target 11. Have achieved by 2020 a significant improvement in the lives of at least 100 million slum dwellers
Indicators 32. Proportion of households with access to secure tenure (UN-HABITAT)

Appendix 2 – Links to Analyzed Pictures

3. Defining the Environment

3.1 – Urban Environment

Picture 1: Football, Brazil, Sustainability and Environment

(http://resources.fifa.com/mm/document/affederation/administration/02/60/91/68/fifaactivityreport2014-en_neutral.pdf). P. 70–71.

Picture 2: Urban meets Nature

(http://resources.fifa.com/mm/document/affederation/administration/02/60/91/68/fifaactivityreport2014-en_neutral.pdf). P. 78–79.

Picture 3: Environmental Sustainable Bus

(http://resources.fifa.com/mm/document/afsocial/general/02/50/92/69/sustainabilityreportofthe2014fwc_neutral.pdf). P. 51.

Picture 4: Constructing BRT-system in Porto Alegre

(<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2012/m=3/news=porto-alegre-begins-work-brt-system-1599633.html>). Visited 15.3.2016

3.2 – Non-urban Environment: Amazonia in the Spotlight

Picture 5: Pure Nature

(http://resources.fifa.com/mm/document/afsocial/general/02/50/92/69/sustainabilityreportofthe2014fwc_neutral.pdf). P. 42–43.

Picture 6: Purus-Project – Rainforest and Rivers

(<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2014/m=6/news=fifa-to-offset-all-its-operational-carbon-emissions-through-certified--2379123.html>) Visited 20.3.2016.

Picture 7: The Power Plant in Amazonas

(<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/photos/galleries/y=2014/m=6/gallery=2014-fwc-carbon-offsetting-programme-2379610.html#2379620>) Visited 20.3.2016.

4. Environment and People

4.1 – ‘Civilians’

Picture 8: Seminar speech

(http://resources.fifa.com/mm/document/afsocial/general/02/50/88/12/finalreportofthestadiumoperatort raininginbrazil_neutral.pdf). P. 10.

Picture 9: Men in Seminar

(http://resources.fifa.com/mm/document/afsocial/general/02/50/88/12/finalreportofthestadiumoperatort raininginbrazil_neutral.pdf). P.11.

Picture 10: Planting Trees – Looking Good

(<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2011/m=6/news=arena-pantanal-construction-carbon-neutral-1453198.html>). Visited 23.5.2016.

Picture 11: Women in a Factory

(<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/photos/galleries/y=2014/m=6/gallery=2014-fwc-carbon-offsetting-programme-2379610.html>). Visited 10.5.2016. Picture 1/5 of the photograph-report.

Picture 12: Green but Passive.

(<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/photos/galleries/y=2014/m=6/gallery=2014-fwc-carbon-offsetting-programme-2379610.html>). Visited 10.5.2016. Picture 3/5 of the photograph-report.

Picture 13: Man and the oven.

(<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/photos/galleries/y=2014/m=6/gallery=2014-fwc-carbon-offsetting-programme-2379610.html>). Visited 10.5.2016. Picture 5/5 of the photograph-report.

Picture 14: Wastes, Coke and FIFA (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2013/m=11/news=waste-management-policy-shows-social-and-environmental-focus-world-cup-2218336.html>) Visited 22.5.2016

Picture 15: Tatiane Soares. (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2012/m=7/news=workers-uniforms-recycled-raise-funds-for-charitable-cause-1666638.html>)

4.2 – ‘Men of FIFA’

Picture 16: Addiechi Speaking (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2011/m=9/news=sustainability-the-goal-for-brazil-2014-1519701.html#1519187>) Visited 28.4.2016.

Picture 17: FIFA, Brazilian Government and UN

(<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2012/m=6/news=brazil-set-new-sustainability-standard-1653133.html>) Visited 28.4.2016.

Picture 18: Best Friends (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/photos/galleries/y=2012/m=6/gallery=loc-visit-recife-1656230.html#1656224>) Visited 13.10.2016. Picture 3/6 of the photograph-report.

Picture 19: Mighty Ronaldo (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/photos/galleries/y=2012/m=6/gallery=loc-visit-recife-1656230.html#1656225>) Visited 13.10.2016. Picture 2/6 of the photograph-report.

Picture 20: Center of Attention (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/photos/galleries/y=2012/m=6/gallery=loc-visit-recife-1656230.html#1656199>) Visited 13.10.2016. Picture 6/6 of the photograph-report.

Picture 21: Beбето and Passionate Fans (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/photos/galleries/y=2012/m=6/gallery=loc-visit-recife-1656230.html#1656201>) Visited 13.10.2016. Picture 5/6 of the photograph-report.

Picture 22: Monitoring the Flourishing Rainforest (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2012/m=8/news=fifa-world-cup-flourishing-the-rainforest-1689391.html>) Visited 13.10.2016.

Picture 23: Valcke and Ronaldo, a Powerful duo (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2012/m=8/news=valcke-and-ronaldo-make-maiden-visit-arena-amazonia-1690795.html>) Visited 13.10.2016.

Picture 24: TV-attention (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2012/m=1/news=valcke-brazil-passion-has-recharged-1571034.html>) Visited 13.10.2016.

Picture 25: Official and Powerful (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2012/m=11/news=valcke-good-test-venues-advance-1954793.html>) Visited 13.10.2016.

Picture 26: Serious Business (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2012/m=8/news=valcke-the-preparations-are-right-track-1692283.html>) Visited 13.10.2016.

Picture 27: Certificate (http://resources.fifa.com/mm/document/afsocial/general/02/50/88/12/finalreportofthestadiumoperatororaininginbrazil_neutral.pdf). P.12.

Picture 28: Winners (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2014/m=7/news=worker-wins-final-tickets-through-carbon-offsetting-programme-2403778.html>) Visited 20.5.2016.

5. World Cup Stadiums as Environmental Nexus Places – Maracanã as the Ultimate ‘Flagship’

Picture 29: Environmental Campaign inside Maracanã (http://resources.fifa.com/mm/document/affederation/administration/02/33/87/89/fifa-ar2013_e_interactive_20140408_neutral.pdf). P. 69.

Picture 30: Sustainable Stadium (http://resources.fifa.com/mm/document/affederation/administration/02/60/91/68/fifaactivityreport2014-en_neutral.pdf). P. 72.

Picture 31: Maracanã and Solar Power (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2012/m=5/news=yingli-brings-solar-power-the-maracana-1629456.html>)

Picture 32: Wastes and Coke (<http://www.fifa.com/worldcup/news/y=2014/m=7/news=world-cup-waste-management-programme-exceeds-expectations-2408125.html>)

Picture 33: Cooperation in Maracanã (http://resources.fifa.com/mm/document/afsocial/general/02/50/88/12/finalreportofthestadiumoperatororaininginbrazil_neutral.pdf). P. 15.

6. Looking Good, or too Good? FIFA, Environment and Visual Silence

Picture 34: *Fuleco*

(http://resources.fifa.com/mm/document/affederation/administration/02/15/82/55/activityreport_e_2012_neutral.pdf). P. 78.

Picture 35: Amazon

(http://resources.fifa.com/mm/document/afsocial/general/02/50/92/69/sustainabilityreportofthe2014fwc_neutral.pdf). P. 42–43.

Picture 36: Maracanã without *Favelas*

(http://resources.fifa.com/mm/document/fifaworldcup/generic/02/11/20/03/summaryofthe2014fwccarbonfootprint_neutral.pdf). P. 13.

Picture 37: Beautiful *Favela*

(http://resources.fifa.com/mm/document/afsocial/general/02/50/92/69/sustainabilityreportofthe2014fwc_neutral.pdf) P.76–77.

Picture 38: Rio de Janeiro from the bird's-eye perspective

(http://resources.fifa.com/mm/document/affederation/administration/02/60/91/68/fifaactivityreport2014-en_neutral.pdf). P. 78–79.

Sources

Primary Sources:

- Aalborg Commitments (2004). (http://www.sustainablecities.eu/fileadmin/repository/Aalborg_Commitments/Aalborg_Commitments_English.pdf) Visited 25.1.2017.
- FIFA.com (www.FIFA.com).
- FIFA Annual Activity Report 2012. (http://resources.fifa.com/mm/document/affederation/administration/02/15/82/55/activityreport_e_2012_neutral.pdf) Visited 26.3.2016.
- FIFA Annual Activity Report 2014. (http://resources.fifa.com/mm/document/affederation/administration/02/60/91/68/fifaactivityreport2014-en_neutral.pdf) Visited 26.3.2016.
- FIFA Brazil Bid. Inspection Report for the 2014 FIFA World Cup™ (2007). (http://www.fifa.com/mm/document/affederation/mission/62/24/78/inspectionreport_e_24841.pdf) Visited 26.6.2016.
- FIFA Sustainability Report (2014). (http://www.fifa.com/mm/document/afsocial/general/02/50/92/69/sustainabilityreportofthe2014fwc_neutral.pdf) Visited 24.1.2016.
- FIFA Sustainability Training Report (2014). (http://resources.fifa.com/mm/document/afsocial/general/02/50/88/12/finalreportofthestadiumoperatortraininginbrazil_neutral.pdf) Visited 24.5.2016.
- Gibson, Owen (2015). Fifa corruption crisis: FBI inquiry now includes 2014 Brazil World Cup. In: *The Guardian*. (<https://www.theguardian.com/football/2015/jun/04/fifa-corruption-crisis-fbi-inquiry-now-includes-2014-world-cup-in-brazil>) Visited 20.3.2016.
- Hull, Elle (2017). "Trump's inauguration crowd: Sean Spicer's claims versus the evidence". In: *The Guardian*. (<https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/2017/jan/22/trump-inauguration-crowd-sean-spicers-claims-versus-the-evidence>). Visited 31.1.2017.
- London Olympics Sustainability Report (2012). (<http://learninglegacy.independent.gov.uk/themes/sustainability/london-2012-sustainability-plan-and-reports.php>) Visited 24.2016.
- Maul, Rob (2015). "British athletes Farah and Ennis-Hill given 'pollution packs' to cope with Beijing smog". In: *Express*. (<http://www.express.co.uk/sport/othersport/599223/British-athletes-Farah-Ennis-Hill-pollution-packs-cope-with-Beijing-smog>) Visited 29.9.2015.
- Rio+20, Paragraph 47 (2012). Charter of the Group of Friends of Paragraph 47 on Corporate Sustainability Reporting.
- Sadecky, Andrea. UN Chronicle 43.4 (Dec 2006-Feb 2007): 40-41. ProQuest. (<http://search.proquest.com/docview/218144017?accountid=14242>) Visited 12.5.2016.
- Soccerex.com. (<https://www.soccerex.com/about>) Visited 13.10.2016.
- The Guardian.com (2016). Ex-World Sailing chief 'voted out for trying to oust polluted Olympic venue'. (<https://www.theguardian.com/sport/2016/jan/26/world-sailing-polluted-olympic-venue-guanabara-bay-peter-sowrey>). Visited 27.5.2016.
- UNEP (2009). Vital Forest Graphics. (http://www.unep.org/vitalforest/Report/VFG_full_report.pdf) Visited 12.5.2016.
- UNEP (2012). Annual Report 2011. (<http://www.unep.org/annualreport/2011/>). Visited 20.3.2016
- UNEP (2013). Annual Report 2012. (<http://www.unep.org/annualreport/2012/>). Visited 20.3.2016.
- UNEP (2015). Annual Report 2014. (<http://www.unep.org/annualreport/2014/en/index.html>). Visited 20.10.2016.
- UNEP (2014). Compendium on Human Rights and the Environment. (<http://www.unep.org/delc/Portals/119/publications/UNEP-compendium-human-rights-2014.pdf>). Visited 16.2.2016.
- UN Millenium Project. (<http://www.unmillenniumproject.org/goals/gti.htm#goal7>) Visited 26.3.2016.
- Wheeland, Matthew (2015). "Brazil struggles with drought and pollution as Olympics loom large". In: *The Guardian*. (<http://www.theguardian.com/sustainable-business/2015/may/04/brazil-drought-2016-olympic-games-rio-de-janiero-rio-20-climate-change>) Visited 29.9.2015.
- WWF: Environmental Problems in Brazil. (http://wwf.panda.org/who_we_are/wwf_offices/brazil/environmental_problems_brazil/). Visited 12.5.2016.
- Yinglisolar.com (<http://www.yinglisolar.com/en/about/>). Visited 23.5.2016

Literature:

- Arena, Claudia, Bozzolan, Saverio & Michelon Giovanna. "Environmental Reporting: Transparency to Stakeholders or Stakeholder Manipulation? An Analysis of Disclosure Tone and the Role of the Board of Directors". In: *Corporate Social Responsibility and Environmental Management*. 22, p.346–361. Wiley Online Library. (<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/csr.1350/full>). Visited 25.2.2016.
- Arnaud, Pierre, Riordan, James (1998). *Sport and International Politics*. London: Taylor and Francis.
- Barros-Platiau, Ana Flávia. (2010). When emergent countries reform global governance of climate change: Brazil under Lula. In: *Revista Brasileira de Política Internacional*, 53(spe), p.73–90. SciELO Brazil. (<https://dx.doi.org/10.1590/S0034-73292010000300005>). Visited 22.4.2016.
- Brophy, Michael & Starkey, Richard (1998). "Environmental Reporting". In: Welford, Richard (edit.). *Corporate Environmental Management*. London: Earthscan.
- Burke, Peter (2010). *Eyewitnessing: The Uses of Images as Historical Evidence*. London: Reaktion Books. ProQuest ebrary. (<http://site.ebrary.com/lib/tampere/reader.action?docID=10426577>) Visited 24.1.2017.
- Carneido da Silva, V.A. & Ribeiro, G. (2006). Strategic Spatial Planning and Environmental Management: the Impact of Guanabara Bay Cleaning Programme in Rio de Janeiro. In: Brebbia, C.A. & Tiezzi, Enzo, "The Sustainable City IV: Urban Regeneration and Sustainability". WitPress.
- Chasek, Pamela S., and Downie, David L.. *Global Environmental Politics* (5th Edition). Boulder, CO, USA: Westview Press, 2009. ProQuest ebrary. (<http://site.ebrary.com/lib/tampere/reader.action?docID=10363358>). Visited 25.2.2016.
- Conca, Ken, Dabelko Geoffrey D. (edits.) (2002). *Environmental Peacemaking*. Washington DC: Woodrow Wilson Center Press.
- Conca, Ken, Wallace, Jennifer (2012). "Environment and peacebuilding in war-torn societies: Lessons from the UN Environment Programme's experience with post-conflict assessment". In: Jensen, D. and Lonergan S. (edits.) *Assessing and Restoring Natural Resources in Post-Conflict Peacebuilding*. London: Earthscan, Routledge.
- Couldry, Nick (2000). *Place of Media Power*. London: Routledge. Ebrary e-Book Collection. (<http://site.ebrary.com/lib/tampere/reader.action?docID=10070497>). Visited 3.3.2016.
- Couldry, Nick (2012), *Media, Society, World. Social Theory and Digital Media Practice*. Cambridge & Malden: Polity Press. E-Book Library. (<http://tampere.ebib.com/patron/FullRecord.aspx?p=1372248>). Visited 3.3.2016.
- Cox, Robert (2006). *Environmental Communication and the Public Sphere*. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications.
- Dalby, Simon (2013). "Peace in the Anthropocene". In: *Peace Review*, 25(4), p.561-567. Taylor & Francis Online. (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10402659.2013.846654>). Visited 21.1.2016.
- Dauvergne, Peter & Farias, Déborah BL (2012). "The Rise of Brazil as a Global Development Power". In: *Third World Quarterly*, 33:5, p. 903–917. Tandfonline (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/01436597.2012.674704>). Visited 22.4.2016.
- Death, Carl 2011. "'Greening' the 2010 FIFA World Cup: Environmental Sustainability and the Mega-Event in South Africa". In: "Journal of Environmental Policy & Planning." Vol. 13, No. 2, June 2011, p.99–117 (<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/1523908X.2011.572656>).

- Durmaz, Saime (2012). "On the Possibility of Writing Contemporary History". In: *KIRIKKALE ÜNİVERSİTESİ SOSYAL BİLİMLER DERGİSİ*. Cilt, 2 Sayı 1 (Ocak 2012). Turkish Journal Park Academic. (<http://dergipark.ulakbim.gov.tr/kusbd/article/view/5000079360>). Visited 2.3.2016.
- Ellis, Erle (2013). Anthropocene. (<http://www.eoearth.org/view/article/150125/>). (Visited 15.1.2016).
- Entman, Robert (1993). "Framing. Towards clarification of a fractured paradigm". In: *Journal of Communication*, 43(4), p.51– 58.
- Foucault, Michel (1990). *The History of Sexuality, and Introduction*. Volume 1. Translated from the French by Robert Hurley. New York: Vintage Books. A Division of Random House, Inc.
- Galtung, Johan (1969). Violence, Peace and Peace Research. In: "*Journal of Peace Research*", Vol. 6, No. 3, p. 167–191. (http://www.jstor.org/tc/accept?origin=/stable/pdf/422690.pdf?_=1463579081859). Visited 18.5.2016.
- Giulianotti, Richard & Robertson, Roland (2004). "The Globalization of Football: A Study in the Globalization of the 'Serious Life'". In: *The British Journal of Sociology*. Volume 55, Issue 4. p.545–568.
- Giulianotti, Richard & Robertson, Roland (2009). *Globalization and Football*. SAGE Publications. (<https://uk.sagepub.com/en-gb/eur/globalization-and-football/book229013>). Visited 27.10.2015.
- Goldemberg, J. (2008). "The Brazilian biofuels industry". In: *Biotechnology for Biofuels*, 1, 6. (<http://doi.org/10.1186/1754-6834-1-6>). Visited 10.4.2016.
- Haldén, Peter (2011). "The past, present and future(s) of environmental security studies". In: *Cooperation and Conflict* 46:406, p.406–414. SAGEpub. (<http://cac.sagepub.com/content/46/3/406>). Visited 28.1.2016.
- Hironaka, Ann (2014). *Greening the Globe*. World Society and Environmental Change. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Hietala, Veijo (1993). *Kuvien todellisuus. Johdatusta kuvallisen kulttuurin ymmärtämiseen ja tulkintaan*. Jyväskylä: Gummerrus kirjapaino Oy.
- Homer-Dixon, Thomas (1991). "On the Threshold: Environmental Changes as Causes of Acute Conflict". In: *International Security*. Volume 16, No. 2, p.76–116. The MIT Press. Jstor. (<http://www.jstor.org/stable/2539061>). Visited 28.1.2016.
- Jenkins, Heledd (2012). *The Environmental Impacts of Sport – The Case of Football*. Cardiff Case Studies. Cardiff University. (<http://www.cardiff.ac.uk/cplan/sites/default/files/CCS-EnvImpactsSport-Football.pdf>). Visited 25.4.2016.
- Joffe, Hélène (2008). "The Power of Visual Material: Persuasion, Emotion and Identification". In: *Diogenes*, Vol. 55, Issue 1. P. 84–93.
- Jordanova, Ludmilla (2012). "Approaching visual materials". In: Gunn, Simon & Faire, Lucie (edit.), *Research Methods for History*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press. P. 30–47.
- Kelley, Colin P. & co. (2015). "Climate change in the Fertile Crescent and implications of the recent Syrian drought". In: *PNAS*, vol. 112, no. 11. p. 3241–3246. (<http://www.pnas.org/content/112/11/3241.full.pdf>). Visited 28.1.2016.
- Kiss, Alexandre Charles & Shelton, Dinah (2007). *Guide to International Environmental Law*. Leiden: Brill. EBSCOhost eBook-Collection. (<http://web.b.ebscohost.com/ehost/ebookviewer/ebook/bmxlYmtfXzMwODQ1MI9fQU41?sid=6c2476a9-7053-4cf7-8987-9c0228576826@sessionmgr113&vid=0&format=EB&rid=1>). Visited February 16.2.2016.

Kolamo, Sami (2014). FIFAN VALTAPELI - Etelä-Afrikan jalkapallon MM-kisat 2010 keskitettynä mediaspektaakkelinä. Tampere: Nykykulttuurin tutkimuskeskus. (https://jyx.iyu.fi/dspace/bitstream/handle/123456789/44920/NK-RGB-FIFAn_valtapeli-2014-05-18.pdf?sequence=1). Visited 20.1.2016.

Lakoff, George (2010). "Why it Matters How We Frame the Environment". In: *Environmental Communication: A Journal of Nature and Culture*, 4:1. P. 70–81. (<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/17524030903529749>) Visited 2.2.2017.

Lester, Libby & Hutchins, Brett (2012). "The power of the unseen: Environmental Conflict, the Media and Invisibility". In: *Media, Culture & Society*. 34(7), p.847–863. SAGE-journals. (<http://mcs.sagepub.com/content/34/7/847.full.pdf+html>). Visited 26.2.2016.

Libiszewski, Stephan (1992), "What is an Environmental Conflict?" In: *Center for Security Studies. Environment and Conflicts Project. ENCOP Occasional Papers*. (http://www.css.ethz.ch/publications/pdfs/What_is_Environment_Conflict_1992.pdf). Visited 19.1.2016.

McDonald, Matt (2008). Securitization and the Construction of Security. In: "*European Journal of International Relations*". December vol. 14 no. 4, p. 563–587.

Melo, F. P., Siqueira, J. A., Santos, B. A., Álvares-da-Silva, O., Ceballos, G. and Bernard, E. (2014), Football and Biodiversity Conservation: FIFA and Brazil Can Still Hit a Green Goal. *Biotropica*, 46, p.257–259. (<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/btp.12114/full>). Visited 9.5.2016.

Messararis, Paul (1996). *Visual Persuasion. The Role of Images in Advertising*. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications.

Messararis, Paul & Abraham, Linus (2001). "The role of images in framing news stories". In: Reese, Stephen D.; Gandy Jr, Oscar H. & Grant, August E. (toim.). *Framing Public Life: Perspectives on Media and Our Understanding of the Social World*. Mahwah: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, p.215–225.

Miller, Toby (2016). Greenwashed sports and environmental activism: Formula 1 and FIFA. In: "*Environmental Communication*". (<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/17524032.2015.1127850>). Visited 18.5.2016.

Mitchell, W.J.T. (1994). *Picture Theory*. Chicago, London: The University of Chicago Press.

Möller, Frank (2013). *Visual Peace. Images, Spectatorship, and the Politics of Violence*. Palgrave Macmillan.

Nevala, Arto (2012). "Mitään jalkapalloa miehekkäämpää ei voi ollakaan – viisi vaihetta kylätappelusta viihdetuotteeksi". In: Ilmanen, Kalervo & Vehmas, Hanna (toim.): *Liikunnan Areenat. Yhteiskunnallisia kirjoituksia liikunnasta ja urheilusta*. Jyväskylä: Jyväskylän yliopisto, liikuntakasvatuksen laitos.

Nevala, Arto (2010). "Kyläkisoista viihdetuotteeksi. Käännekohtia MM-jalkapallon historiassa". In: *Kasvatus & Aika* 4 (2). P.203–235. (http://www.kasvatus-ja-aika.fi/dokumentit/katsaus_nevala_2106101935.pdf). Visited 22.2.2016.

Niemi, Marjaana (2017). "How green is your city? Transnational and local perspectives on urban green spaces". In: Clark, Peter, Niemi, Marjaana & Nolin, Catharina (eds.). *Green Landscapes in the European City, 1750-2010*. London: Routledge. P. 212–218.

Nixon, Howard L. II (2014). *The Athletic Trap: How College Sports Corrupted the Academy*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

Perlman, Janice E. (2009). *Favela: Four Decades of Living on the Edge in Rio de Janeiro*. New York : Oxford University Press. EBSCOhost. (<http://web.a.ebscohost.com/ehost/detail/detail/bmxlymtfxzmxotc5OV9fQU41?sid=ae59d9fa-487b-48c3-a233-15c19ff7f53d@sessionmgr4006&vid=0#AN=319799&db=nlebk>) Visited 25.1.2017.

- Preuss, Holger (2013). The Contribution of the FIFA World Cup and the Olympic Games to Green Economy. In: *Sustainability* (2013), 5, p.3581-3600. MDPI Open Access Journals (<http://www.mdpi.com/2071-1050/5/8/3581/htm#B6-sustainability-05-03581>). Visited 29.2.2016.
- Richmond, Oliver (2013). "Failed statebuilding versus peace formation". In: *Cooperation & Conflict* 3/2013. p. 378–400.
- Robertson, Roland (1995). Glocalization: Time-Space and Homogeneity-Heterogeneity. In: *Featherstone, Mike, Lash, Scott & Robertson, Rolan* (1997). *Global Modernities*. London, Thousand Oaks, New Delhi: SAGE.
- Rodriguez, Lulu & Dimitrova, Daniela (2011). The levels of visual framing. In: "*Journal of Visual Literacy*, Volume 30, Number 1, p.48-65. (http://www.academia.edu/799221/The_Levels_of_Visual_Framing). Visited 4.4.2016.
- Rose, Gillian (2012), *Visual Methodologies: An Introduction to Researching with Visual Materials*. London, Los Angeles, Delhi, Singapore: SAGE publications.
- Scheufele, Dietram A. (1999). "Framing as a Theory of Media Effects". In: *Journal of Communication*. Winter 1999.
- Schmidt, Charles W. (2006). "Putting the Earth in Play: Environmental Awareness and Sports". In: *Environmental Health Perspectives*. 114(5): p. A286–A295. US National Library of Medicine National Institutes of Health (<http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1459948/pdf/ehp0114-a00286.pdf>). Visited 19.2.2016.
- Seppänen, Janne (2002). *Katseen voima. Kohti visuaalista lukutaitoa*. Tampere: Vastapaino.
- Seppänen, Janne (2005). *Visuaalinen kulttuuri. Teoriaa ja metodeja mediakuvaan tulkitsijalle*. Tampere: Vastapaino.
- Stochetti, Matteo & Kukkonen, Karin (eds.) (2011). *Images in Use: Towards the Critical Analysis of Visual Communication*. Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company. EBSCOhost. (<http://web.b.ebscohost.com/ehost/detail/detail?sid=ae671e59-6219-4496-b6be-48215b8ac947%40sessionmgr101&vid=0&hid=128&bdata=JkF1dGhUeXBIPWNvb2tpZSxpcCx1aWQmc2l0ZT1laG9zdC1saXZlJnNjb3BIPXNpdGU%3d#AN=398638&db=nlebk>) Visited 5.4.2016.
- Sugden, John & Tomlinson, Alan (2003). *Badfellas. FIFA Family at War*. Edinburgh: Mainstream Publishing.
- Swyngedouw, Erik (2013). "The Non-political Politics of Climate Change." In: *ACME: An International E-Journal for Critical Geographies*, 2013, 12(1), 1-8. (<http://ois.unbc.ca/index.php/acme/article/viewFile/948/802>). Visited 2.2.2016.
- Tomlinson, Alan & Young, Christopher (2003). *National Identity and Global Sports Events: Culture, Politics, and Spectacle in the Olympics and the Football World Cup*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Tuomi, Jouni & Sarajärvi, Anneli (2004). *Laadullinen tutkimus ja sisällönanalyysi*. Jyväskylä: Gummerus.
- Wang, Wei, Zhang, Xiaoling, Wu, Yuzhe, Zhou, Ling, Skitmore, Martin (2016). "Development priority zoning in China and its impact on urban growth management strategy." In: *Cities*, 62. P. 1–9. ScienceDirect. (<http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0264275116308551>) Visited 24.1.2017.
- Weber, Cynthia (2001). *International Relations Theory, a Critical Introduction*. Abingdon: Routledge.
- Wilmschurst, Trevor D. & Frost, Geoffrey R. (2000). "Corporate environmental reporting". In: *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal*, Vol. 13 Iss.1 p.10–26. (<http://www.emeraldinsight.com/doi/abs/10.1108/09513570010316126>). Visited 25.2.2016.